Georgetown Security Studies Review
Special Edition: The Changing Calculus of Security and Violence

November 2015

A Publication of the Center for Security Studies at Georgetown University’s Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service

http://gssr.georgetown.edu
Contact the Editor-in-Chief at GSSR.info@gmail.com

DISCLAIMER

The views expressed in Georgetown Security Studies Review (GSSR) do not necessarily represent those of the editors or staff of GSSR, the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service, or Georgetown University. The editorial board of GSSR and our affiliated peer reviewers strive to verify the accuracy of all factual information contained in GSSR. However, the staffs of GSSR, the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service, and Georgetown University make no warranties or representations regarding the completeness or accuracy of information contained in GSSR and assume no legal liability or responsibility for the content of any work contained therein.

A NOTE ON THE SPECIAL EDITION

Each article in this special edition is research conducted by students selected to present at the Georgetown University Center for Security Studies’ symposium entitled, “The Changing Calculus of Security and Violence.” The symposium took place on Saturday, November 21, 2015, at Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.
# Table of Contents

Ethno-Demographic Dynamics of the Rohingya-Buddhist Conflict ...................................................................................... 5  
Rachel Blomquist

Forecasting Group Efficacy in the Intelligence Community Using Female Communication Metrics ........................................... 34  
Carolyn Elizabeth Clemens

Operation Artemis: A Template for Western Multilateral Intervention? .............................................................................. 54  
Jason Hartwig

The Future of Conflict: A Study of Boko Haram and Hybrid Warfare .................................................................................. 79  
Zachary Henderson

Defending Against Hybrid Warfare in Estonia ................................................. 106  
Matthew Mullarky

State-Regulated Islam and its Internal Security Implications for China’s Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region ...................... 129  
Zi Yang

Behind Electromagnetic Railgun: Redefining the Future Cost Calculus of Surface Warfare ...................................................... 148  
Rhys McCormick

Pakistan’s Urban Militant Threat: Challenges and Opportunities for Police-Led Counterinsurgency .............................. 171  
Hijab Shah
Responses to Violence: Building Resilience and Engaging Society in Mexico (2010-2014)............................192
Marcela Valdivia Correa

Kenya's 9/11: The Effects of the Garissa University College Attack on Kenyan Counterterrorism Policy..............227
Jacob Goldstein

El Salvador's Gangs and Prevailing Gang Paradigms in a Post-Truce Context............................................249
Michael Lohmuller
Ethno-Demographic Dynamics of the Rohingya-Buddhist Conflict

Rachel Blomquist

Ethno-demographic grievances define the conflict between Buddhist and Rohingya-Muslim populations in the Rakhine State of Myanmar. Nationalistic Buddhist leaders, such as the controversial monk Ashin Wirathu, maintain that the Rohingya population’s rapid growth and high fertility rates threaten to overtake local Buddhist populations. This study seeks to identify quantitative and qualitative differences between the Rohingya and Buddhist populations in Rakhine State and to elucidate the theoretical and practical implications for Buddhist-Rohingya relations. Due to the government’s decision to avoid enumeration of self-identifying Rohingya, this study has relied on several recent local surveys to reconstruct a local demographic description of the Rohingya. The “Minority Demographic Security Dilemma” theory, which specifies expectations for minority-majority conflicts and their resolution, will be used to discuss the relevant forces that underlie the Buddhist-Rohingya conflict.¹

Recent communal conflict in the Rakhine State of Myanmar has culminated in the displacement of the Rohingya community—a Muslim minority living in the northwestern

¹ I would like to thank Georgetown University’s Asian Studies Program and the Stimson Center for their support in the making of this study. I would also like to thank Dr. Richard Cincotta for his mentorship and his expertise and insight on this research.
regions of the Rakhine State. These conflicts, such as the Rakhine State riots in 2012, resulted in the destruction of Rohingya homes and have led to a recent wave of Rohingya “boat people” seeking refuge along the shorelines and coastal waterways of neighboring Southeast Asian nations.

Politicized Buddhist monks and associations, such as Ashin Wirathu, the MaBaTha, and the 969 Movement, regularly exploit demographic fears by espousing anti-Muslim rhetoric. To justify discrimination, ethno-centric Buddhists often claim that the Rohingya, sustained by high fertility and rapid population growth rates, threaten to overwhelm local Buddhist communities in the Rakhine State. The relationship between demographics and regional ethnic relations depicts significant demographic differences between Rohingya and Buddhists communities in the Rakhine State, and these differences clarify the nature of the conflict. This study analyzes the conflict between the Rohingya-Muslims and the local Buddhist population in the Rakhine State of western Myanmar through an analysis of demographic differences. Demographic comparisons of the Rohingya and similar youthful populations reveal that the Rohingya has a younger population than other members of the Rakhine State. The age differences of these populations create a cyclical relationship of fear and response among regional stakeholders.

Political-demographic models adeptly pertain to the voiced demographic issues in Myanmar. However, theoretical research by Christian Leuprecht addresses ethnic conflict as typified by communal conflict in the Rakhine State. Leuprecht’s model, known as the “Demographic Security Dilemma,” examines a cyclical relationship of demographics and regional ethnic relations by studying the interactions of a politically dominant low-fertility population and a large, more youthful minority. Leuprecht demonstrates that conflict arises when the politically
dominant majority perceives that a ‘youthful’ secondary minority population will overtake and possibly displace the majority. The ostensible threat leads to political suppression of the minority, thus exacerbating communal conflict and sustaining high fertility and growth rates of the minority. Based on Leuprecht’s model, this study asks two questions pertaining to the Rohingya:

1. How does the Rohingya’s total fertility rate, age structure, and rate of growth compare to that of Rakhine citizens, to the Myanmar population at large, and to other distinct ethnic groups of this country?

2. How might Rohingya demography, vis-à-vis the majority Buddhist populations affect the Rohingya’s political relationship with the Myanmar state?

Unfortunately, insufficient ethno-demographic data limit the development of a comprehensive demographic study of the Rohingya. Several published estimates of this minority’s birth and death rates only infer a rough estimate of the Rohingya fertility and age structure. Assessment of data on Myanmar requires critical discernment and care due to limited access to primary sources. Also, previous government policies of restricting information, has limited the scope of a wide variety of in-depth demographic analysis. Consistent omissions include exclusion from census enumeration of the Rohingya in the Rakhine State and census enumeration of minorities in conflict areas of the Kachin and Karen states. The 2014 Census estimated the potential number of non-enumerated persons in each state; however, specific data are not available.\(^2\) Despite

---

\(^2\) Note: An analysis of the Kachin age structure provided from the 2014 Census reveals an extraordinary imbalance in the sex ratio. The 2014 Census notes male out-migration to work in mines in other regions may cause this imbalance.
these limitations, this inquiry reinforces existing studies on the Rohingya by extrapolating available demographic data.

Regarding minority-majority relations in Myanmar, application of terminology requires adequate sensitivity and specificity with apt definitions that preclude contentious biases. To legitimize the ruling junta, Burma changed its name in 1989 to ‘Myanmar’, a variation of the name of the nation prior to British colonialism. However, many ethnic and opposition groups currently prefer using ‘Burma’, the name of this country during British rule. To respect the views of ethnic groups and oppositions, yet resist the sway of political changes that preclude accurate portrayal, references will employ terminology from international bodies such as the United Nations or the World Bank. For the sake of simplicity, ‘Myanmar’ refers to the Republic of the Union of Myanmar, ‘Union’ is used in reference to the country for demographic comparisons, ‘Burma’ refers to the nation prior to the 1989 ascent of the military junta, and ‘Myanmar citizens’ refers to all residents of Myanmar with citizenship rights. The Buddhist Rakhine ethnic group is the majority in the Rakhine State; however, the ethnic composition of the Rakhine State remains quite diverse. Therefore, ‘Rakhine citizens’ refers to members of the Rakhine State with citizenship rights. Similarly, the names for individual Myanmar states will adhere to conventions of the 2014 Census. Finally, the term ‘Rohingya’ identifies members of the Muslim ethnic group without citizenship rights in the Rakhine State.

Myanmar officially recognizes 135 ethnic groups dispersed throughout the nation. However, large concentrations of

---


4 Note: Expected release of the 2014 Census ethnic composition of each region is 2016.
minorities live in the ethnic states of Chin, Kachin, Karen, Kayah, Mon, Rakhine, and Shan. Chin ethnic group (consisting of 53 different sub-ethnic groups), Shan (33), Kachin (12), Karen (11), Burman (9), Karenni (9), Rakhine (7) and Mon (1), identifies official major ethnic groups having dominate concentrations in associated ethnic state (excluding Burman), with the respective number of sub-ethnic groups.\(^5\) In a number of ethnic minority states, such as the Chin, Kachin, and Karen, the state name refers to all the sub-groups in the state. Other state names, including the Kayah, Mon, Rakhine, and Shan, refer to the majority ethnic group in the territory.\(^6\) However, comparison study on all ethnic groups is beyond the scope of this paper, and this study will assume that ethnic composition coincides with regional terminology.

This paper, organized in four sections, includes two sections establishing the foundation of the research, one section detailing the research, and one section concluding the research. The first section provides a brief and relevant historical account of the conflict in the Northern Rakhine State from the independence of Myanmar to the present. Also included are previous extensive studies on the Rohingya by distinguished researchers and human rights activists. The second section explores the theoretical framework of this study, expanding on the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model and positioning it within its theoretical family. The third section presents methodology, findings, and discussion in which ethno-demographic analysis of the Rohingya population elucidates differences of Rohingya and Myanmar citizen age structures, thus providing insight into the social, political, and economic

---


impacts of Rohingya demography. With a possible total fertility rate (TFR) of around 4.0 and a crude birth rate (CBR) of 27.2, the Rohingya population, younger than the majority population and targeted with government disenfranchisement and denial of services, passively react to oppression. The last section of the paper concludes with implications of the findings, maintaining that democratic policies of the government, not demographic policies, would increase the well-being of the Rakhine population, and ultimately result in reduced Rohingya fertility rates and population growth rates.

**Background**

Governmental policies oppress many ethnic groups of Myanmar; however, “they [oppressive policies] are, in the case of the Rohingyas, inflicted with a thoroughness and relentlessness which makes their synergistic effects unusually destructive.”  


With a population that is 89% Buddhist, 4% Muslim, 4% Christian and 3% other faiths 8, the Rohingya singular religious minority status and perceived emigrant origin, has historically fated this group to unusually rampant discrimination.

**Conflict in the Northern Rakhine State**

Conflict in the Northern Rakhine State developed before British colonization of Burma in 1824. However, widespread


persecution since independence in 1948 and subsequent restriction of citizenship rights have contributed to Rohingya suffering. Similar to other ethnic groups at the time of independence, the Rohingya sought regional autonomy either in the form of secession or as a separate administrative state, thus sowing the first seeds of rebellion. Initially, Rohingya political activists sought to secede from Burma and unify with the newly formed country of Pakistan; however, agreements between the leaders of Pakistan and Burma prevented the realization of this aspiration.\\9 As moderate Rohingyas sought to engage with the government, extremist Rohingya groups developed the mujahideen, an armed group that threatened the engagement of the government and Rohingya moderates. In 1954, the government initiated Operation Moonsoon, factionalizing the mujahideen with the assassinations of leaders and imprisonment of supporters.\\10 In 1961, Rohingya leaders agreed to the Mayu Frontier Administration (MFA) as proposed by Prime Minister U Nu.\\11 The MFA was to govern townships in the Northern Rakhine state and to create a separate administrative division controlled by Muslims of Rakhine within the Buddhist Rakhine administration. Yet, the coup of 1962 ended Muslim hope of self-administration,\\12 thwarting further political-engagement activity and significantly restricting armed activity of the Rohingya.

---

In 1962, General Ne Win implemented a Burmanization policy that intertwined social and economic mobility with assimilation into the Burmese culture, thus effectively dismantling the successes that minority ethnic leaders, including the Rohingya, achieved with former Prime Minister U Nu. At this time, the Rohingya also lost citizen rights as the new administration issued Foreign Registration Cards (FRC) to the Rohingya. Operation *Naga Min* (Dragon King) of 1978, a demographic campaign intended to identify citizens, foreigners and illegal foreigners, further restricted Rohingya citizenship by identifying them as illegal foreigners. The government cemented its stance on denying citizenship to the Rohingya with the 1982 Citizenship law. This legislation anchored discrimination against Rohingyas in the national systems, political, social and economic, by formally establishing the status of the Rohingya as illegal foreigners. Within a decade, in 1991, the government launched Operation *Pyi Thaya* (Operation Clean and Beautiful Nation) in response to political demonstrations in the Rakhine State. Operations *Naga Min* and *Pyi Thaya* triggered widespread persecution resulting in mass Rohingya refugee migration across the Bangladeshi border. Recent communal violence has also factored in the ongoing Rohingya refugee flight from the Northern Rakhine State.

---

15 Ibid. 55.
Preliminary analysis of the Rohingya conflict correctly attributes the plight of the Rohingya to widespread persecution and denial of citizenship rights; however, an in-depth assessment uncovers a number of veiled trends that factor in the Rohingya struggle. David Dapice\textsuperscript{18} posits that migration from Bangladesh and high birth rates among the Muslims may not be the primary factors of Muslim population growth in the Rakhine State. Rather, purported Muslim growth is relative, due to decline of the Buddhist population with the departure of Buddhist youths from the Rakhine State to pursue employment elsewhere in Myanmar. Irish Centre for Human Rights\textsuperscript{19} and Amnesty International\textsuperscript{20} reports assess the Rohingya conflict from a humanitarian stance. Both reports, in documenting the struggles of the Rohingya as a result of repressive Myanmar government policies, impute crimes as defined by the international community. Adam Simpson examines the relationship between natural resources and ethnic conflict with particular emphasis on the Rakhine State. He states, “In Myanmar this insecurity [for marginalized populations] has been exacerbated by decades of civil conflict between the Myanmar government and the ethnic minorities who populate its resource-rich mountainous borderlands, including Shan, Kachin, Kayin (Karen), Karenni (Kaya), and Rakhine

Simpson explains that the distribution of natural resources remains a key obstacle to government peace building with the ethnic minorities. Finally, ethnic-conflict authors, David A. Lake and Donald Rothchild, posit that fears of safety or instigate inter-ethnic conflict and are aggravated by political activists and mis-information. Although these studies provide valuable insight on the Rohingya conflict, a comprehensive demographic study based on the difference in fertility rate between the Rohingya, the Union, and other ethnic groups in Myanmar will provide additional understanding on majority-minority conflict, especially in the Rakhine region.

The Youth Bulge Model Family

Politico-demographic scholars have only recently explored the relationship between a bulge in the youthful population and the elevated risk for intra-state conflict. Although other causes, such as vulnerable government regimes or weak institutions, contribute to intra-state conflict, a “youth bulge” resulting from high fertility rates and a growing population stress national political and economic systems with a large cohort of individuals entering the workforce at the same time. These ‘youthful’ nations (median age of ≤ 25.0 years) face a proliferation of intra-state conflict and civil war with an excess number of restive young men, prone to violent behavior and

As a nation’s age structure transitions to the intermediate level (median age > 25.0 years), a phase of civil war may ensue; however, stability eventually emerges. As a nation’s age structure transitions to the intermediate level (median age > 25.0 years), a phase of civil war may ensue; however, stability eventually emerges.25

Many studies analyzing the relationship between demographics and civil war have focused on conflict from a national viewpoint. Only recently has analysis applied the ‘youth bulge model’ at the sub-national perspective.26 Conflicts among sub-national groups can occur when one of three circumstances are met: (1) both the majority and minority are youthful (as in most developing nations), (2) the majority are youthful and the minority are intermediate/mature (as in nations with a prominent minority population such as the Chinese in the Philippines and Malaysia), and (3) the majority are intermediate/mature and the minority are youthful (as in Myanmar) (See Figure 1). Particular combinations of age structures may impact the nature of the subsequent conflict. Intra-state civil war as well as ethnic-conflict emerges when both populations are youthful. ‘Market-dominant minorities’, as described by Amy Chua, form with an older minority and a youthful majority in which “ethnic minorities who, for widely varying reasons, tend under market conditions to dominate economically, often to a startling extent, the ‘indigenous’ majorities around them”27 such as the Chinese in Malaysia and the Philippines. The final quadrant of elevated conflict risk

---

highlights the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ in Myanmar with a youthful minority and intermediate/mature majority resulting in ethnic conflict with repression and marginalization of the minority.

Figure 1: The Relationship between Age Structures and Ethno-Religious Conflict

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Majority</th>
<th>Youthful</th>
<th>Intermediate/Mature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethno-Religious Minority</strong></td>
<td>Youthful</td>
<td>ELEVATED RISK OF: VARIOUS TYPES OF INTRASTATE CIVIL &amp; ETHNORELIGIOUS CONFLICTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate/ Mature</td>
<td>ELEVATED RISK OF: VICTIMIZATION OF PRIVILEGED MINORITIES</td>
<td>DEPRESSED RISK OF: INTRASTATE CIVIL OR ETHNORELIGIOUS CONFLICT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Youthful country-level age structure (median age ≤ 25.0 years)

Intermediate or mature country-level age structure (median age > 25.0 years)

**Demographic Security Dilemma**

Utilizing his theory of the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’, Christian Leuprecht\(^\text{29}\) examines the relationship between youth bulges and high fertility rates at the sub-national level, exploring outcomes of differing age structures between ethnic groups. Leuprecht posits that as a minority population grows with high fertility rates and the majority in power ages with low fertility rates, the majority in power interprets this minority population growth as a national security threat.\(^\text{30}\) The majority perception that the minority will overtake the country through sheer numbers, thus increasing competition for resources and possibly instigating a cultural revolution in favor of the minority, may signal the existence of the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’. The majority then moves to ‘securitize’ the growing minority by enacting protective policies to strengthen the majority’s power.\(^\text{31}\) These population control policies such


\(^{30}\) Ibid. 62.

\(^{31}\) Ibid, 61.
as limitations on movement, number of children, and women’s rights, marginalizes the minority, a population typically less educated, poorer and more religious than the majority; yet the minority retains behaviors that sustain high fertility and growth rates. The state’s attempts to maintain power create a cyclical dilemma. This pattern of repression has three features as follows: (1) the minority population must have a higher fertility rate (as indicated through a ‘youthful’ age structure) than the majority; (2) the majority-led government must enact policies that disenfranchise or deny the minority; (3) the marginalized minority reacts to enacted policies with the passive responses of high fertility rates retention and/or migration, and/or active responses of political activism and/or violent uprisings.

**Ethno-Demographics of Myanmar**

To determine the applicability of the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model, this study utilizes a quantitative ethno-demographic analysis to disprove the hypothesis that the Rohingya’s total fertility rate and population growth rate are not statistically different from the local Myanmar citizens. The second part discusses the state of relations between the government, local populations and the Rohingya by positing that if the Rohingya are statistically different than the Myanmar citizens, then the majority-led government (local and central) acts to disenfranchise and deny services to high-fertility minorities. This marginalization leads to a response from the minority, whether passive (e.g., sustained high fertility), actively defensive (e.g., non-violent protest, political mobilization) or actively offensive (e.g., political violence, armed conflict), and ultimately escalates to further ethnic tensions and more significant threats to the majority’s political dominance. Confirmation of differences of Rohingya and
Myanmar citizen age structures provides elucidation of Rohingya demography impact on Myanmar, as found in an interpretation of the results.

Methodology

To determine demographic differences, this study examines and compares the age structures of the Rohingya, the Union of Myanmar, individual states in Myanmar, and other ‘youthful’ nations. Due to the dearth of Rohingya data, data from various UN publications and other sources including a model growth rate table provide a rough estimate of the Rohingya age structure with the data extrapolated from a single urban locality (Maungdaw Township) in the Rakhine State. 32 For the demographics of the Rohingya, the most relevant and available statistics use include the crude birth rate (CBR) and crude death rate (CDR). CBR measures the number of births per 1000 people in a population. CDR measures the number of deaths per 1000 people in a population. Scattered publications from CEDAW and UNHCR indicated 27.2 as the CBR in 2012 and 12.4 in 2008 as the CDR of the Rohingya in the Northern Rakhine State.33 These data closely matched the Model Growth

32 Note: CEDAW identified Maungdaw Township, the primary township in Northern Rakhine, as having a population of 511,785 with 90.41% Bengali. In the 2014 Census, the Union of Myanmar identified the Rohingya as ‘Bengali’. The CEDAW publication described this ‘Bengali’ population as Muslims in the Northern Rakhine State; thus the Bengali are assumed to be Rohingya.

Rate Set of male and female in the South set in the mortality level 17 table with a reproductive rate of 1.5 (R=15.00)\(^34\) as established by Coale and Demeny.\(^35\) These data established the age structure of the Rohingya in 2010 as an interpolation of values in 2008 and 2012.

Comparing the reconstructed Rohingya age structure with age structures of similar ‘youthful’ populations, regional populations (Bangladesh, Myanmar, Rakhine State) and populations of other regions in Myanmar, provides a limited validation of the Rohingya age structure and highlights differences of the Rohingya age structure with the Rakhine citizen population. According to United Nations statistics,\(^36\) fifteen countries have CBR similar to the Rohingya, with six countries (Laos, Vanuatu, Kyrgyzstan, Guatemala, and Jordan) closely matching the Rohingya CBR of 27.2 in 2010 (See Graph 1). One word of caution, uneven availability of services likely distort the fertility rates of townships versus state, national or international rates, whereas variability of services and extraneous variables distort death rates across regions. In addition, the CDR of these six countries varies considerably from the Rohingya CDR (See Graph 2), and CDR data may not correlate with ‘youthful’ populations due to extraneous variables. Thus further analysis of Rohingya with other youthful populations excludes CDR correlations. Finally, data

\(^{34}\)Note: Regional Model Life Tables and Stable Populations provides life tables and growth rate tables based on a cross-boundary data collection to examine trends in birth and mortality rates for ostensibly stable populations. The numbers stated identifies the table that produced the reconstructed Rohingya age structure.


from the 2014 Census\textsuperscript{37} and the UNPD provided age structures of the region, including Bangladesh, the Union, Rakhine State, and other internal Myanmar states, in comparison with the Rohingya age structure.

**Graph 1:** Comparison of the Crude Birth Rate (between Maungdaw Township, Myanmar, and similar youthful populations)\textsuperscript{38}

*Note: Standard error for nations with a CBR<27.2 avg range from 0.2-1.7. Standard error for nations with a CBR>27.2 avg range from 0.3-1.6

\textsuperscript{37} Republic of the Union of Myanmar. (2014). *The 2014 Population and Housing Census of Myanmar, Summary of the Provisional Results.*

Graph 2: Comparison of the Crude Death Rate (between Maungdaw Township, Myanmar, and similar youthful populations)\textsuperscript{39}

*Note: Standard error for nations with a CDR<6.5 avg range from 0.4-1.0. Standard error for nations with a CDR>6.5 avg range from 0.7-1.7

Results

The reconstructed Rohingya age structure, (See Figure 2) portrays a relatively “youthful” population that will continue to grow, barring out-migration forces. Interpretation of the age

structures reveals that the total fertility rate (TFR) \(^{40}\) of Rohingya is likely between 3.0 and 4.0. To validate this outcome, it is postulated that the reconstructed Rohingya age structure resembles the age structures of countries having similar CBR levels. Thus, based on the similarities in CBR in 2015, the five ‘youthful’ countries of Vanuatu (CBR=26.946), Kyrgyzstan (CBR=27.096), Guatemala (CBR=27.699), and Jordan (CBR=27.865) have age structures that resemble the Rohingya (See Figure 3). However, Laos, with a CBR of 27.181 and a TFR of 3.10 in 2015, purportedly has an age structure closely resembling that of the Rohingya. Regional proximity and similarities of colonial background strengthen this correlation of age structures, as the Rohingya mirrors the Laos ‘youthful’ populations with high birth rates and high population growth rates.

\(^{40}\)Note: Total Fertility Rate is the average number of children that would be born to a woman by the time she ended childbearing if she were to pass through all of her childbearing years conforming to the age-specific fertility rates in a given year and is a synthetic measure according to Population Reference Bureau’s Population Handbook.
Figure 2: Reconstructed Rohingya Age Structure\textsuperscript{41}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{rohingya_age_structure.png}
\caption{Reconstructed Rohingya Age Structure}
\end{figure}

Figure 3: Age Structures of Populations Comparable to the Rohingya

The birth rate and population growth rate of the Rohingya, one of the youngest populations within Myanmar, will continue to surpass the birth rate and population growth rate of Myanmar citizens, including Rakhine citizens, and the neighboring Bangladesh population. According to the 2014 Census, the Union maintains the demographics of an ‘intermediate’ nation with an older age structure, i.e. a greater proportion of the population is older. The age structure and birth rate of Bangladesh as well as the Rakhines, although reflecting populations that are younger than the Union, is still more mature than that of the Rohingya. Within the region, the Rohingya demographics may have matched Myanmar in 1993 and Bangladesh in 2001 (See Figure 4); however, current Rohingya demographic data, signal continued Rohingya population growth, as the demographics of the region mirrors the trajectory of nations with maturing populations.
Figure 4: Comparison of Regional Age Structures

*Note: Estimated persons not enumerated: Myanmar- 1,206,353; Rakhine- 1,090,000.

Within Myanmar, the age structures of most Union states reveal a wide range of differences, yet many states somewhat resemble the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model of majority low CBR versus minority high CBR. The Rohingya age structure resembles most other ethnic-minority regions to a greater extent than they do of the ethnic-majority regions (See Figure 5). Differences in accessibility of services at the township level and the state level possibly account for the Chin State (CBR= 29.9; TFR = 4.37)\(^{44}\) being the only region with a CBR higher than the Rohingya. Among ethnic states, the Rakhine State (excluding the Rohingya) and Mon State appear to deviate from the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model (See Graph 3). Recent developmental projects, such as creation of model villages designed to improve the livelihoods of the Rakhine ethnic group at the expense of Rohingya rights, thus decreasing birthrates, may explain the Rakhine State divergence from the model. Whereas Mon State development, due to high level of Mon population interactions with the Burman ethnic group, may account for the Mon State demographic divergence from the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model.

---

\(^{44}\) Ibid.
Figure 5: Age Structures of Selected States in Myanmar

*Note: Estimated persons not enumerated: Rakhine- 1090,000

---

Discussion

According to the ‘Demographic Security Dilemma’ model, a government controlled by the majority in power may fear a rising population growth of a minority, and will respond to the minority by either disenfranchisement or denial of services. Currently, the Rohingya population faces such disenfranchisement with denial of citizenship rights, employment opportunities and services such as quality healthcare and education. Government-implemented population control policies evincing the disenfranchisement and denial of services of the Rohingya, include Operation Naga Min of 1978, the two-child policy of 2013, and the Population Control Healthcare Bill of 2015. These policies elicit a passive reaction from the Rohingya in the form of high-birth rates retention, low

---

education obtainment, and on-going impoverishment, attributes that typically mark marginalized populations.

Population control policies against the Rohingya dates back to 1962 when the Rohingya first lost citizenship rights. In 1978, the government enacted *Operation Naga Min* or Operation Dragon King, a singularly prominent population control policy in which the government systematically identified illegal residents in problematic regions such as the Northern Rakhine State. Population control policies triggered subsequent persecution, marginalization and migration of the Rohingya.

Recently, the government has enacted two additional population control policies designed to restrict population growth in densely populated government designated regions. To address the 2012 communal violence in the Northern Rakhine State, the Myanmar government convened the Inquiry Commission on Sectarian Violence in the Rakhine State. This inquiry determined that resource competition significantly contributed to the violence and recommended that local authorities should implement Rohingya family planning programs to maintain the growth of this population. However, these programs should “be implemented … in a non-

---

discriminatory fashion and must be based on the principle of voluntary participation." 50 Yet, local Rakhine authorities, ignoring the charge of voluntary participation, implemented this two-child policy with force. Consequently, due to fear of civil discipline, the two-child policy has led to unsafe abortions and unregistered births. 51 Furthermore, the recent Population Control Healthcare Bill, enacted by President Thein Sein in May 2015, will possibly increase the incidence of unsafe abortions and unregistered births. The government designed the Population Control Healthcare Bill to reduce maternal and infant mortality rates by mandating that women residing in areas with high population growth rates engage in a 36-month birth-spacing period of children. 52 Yet, critics claim that this bill restricts women’s rights in Muslim-majority areas and fuels tensions between Rohingyas and Rakhine citizens. 53 Although a slight improvement to the two-child policy of 2012, this requirement of birth spacing of three years for children may potentially increase unsafe abortions and unregistered births, and at the same time fail to address the marginalized conditions

for this impoverished, poorly educated, and rural Rohingya population with high birth rates.

Conclusion

This study suggests that demographic differences between the Rohingya and the Rakhine citizen populations significantly contribute to communal conflict in the Northern Rakhine State. In addition, the limitations of government-enacted population control measures of the Rohingya exacerbate conflict rather than address the local perceptions of a growing Rohingya population. These policies, then, prolong the marginalization of the Rohingya. This paper suggests, as a topic of further exploration, that as Myanmar seeks a path towards democratization, the plight of the Rohingya must be addressed through inclusive policies designed to increase the well-being of the Rakhine population and decrease those characteristics of a marginalized people, rather than through demographic policies designed to exclude the Rohingya from Myanmar society.

Rachel Blomquist is current M.A. candidate in the Asian Studies Program at Georgetown University and holds a B.A. in Anthropology from Creighton University. She focuses on the relationships between politics and societies in Southeast Asia and on the Korean peninsula. Ms. Blomquist has worked as an English teacher in South Korea and has interned at think tanks in Washington D.C.
Forecasting Group Efficacy in the Intelligence Community Using Female Communication Metrics

Carolyn Elizabeth Clemens

This paper proposes a method for forecasting group efficacy using real-world metrics of female communication. The basis of this paper draws on recent MIT and Carnegie Mellon research which found that groups with more women tend to have more “collective intelligence,” translating into greater group efficacy on tasks done in a laboratory setting. Intending to use this research to help improve efficiency in the intelligence community (for which no data are publicly available), I compared women’s participation in the workplace through Enron, Inc. email data to the stock price of the company. Results of my research show a direct relationship between the fraction of women communicating on a team at Enron and the company’s stock price. This real-world finding has implications for determining the impact women have on US national security, should the appropriate data be made available.

In the last decade, the theme of women in the workforce has been discussed across media outlets, public interest, and political campaigns. More women than men are graduating from universities and women are taking a more active role in public life, becoming C-suite executives, and running for political office. However, debate continues to exist regarding
the value women have in the public sphere, and how they contribute to (or detract from) institutional culture.¹ The question I asked relates to women in government: can women’s work in government institutions make governments more or less successful? In particular, could women’s contribution make our nation safer, and if so, is there a means of empirically proving that the contribution of women has an impact -- positive, negative, or neutral?

Unfortunately, data on women’s performance in the IC and how it relates to risk is not readily available; I have no way of measuring how women’s involvement in government affects our national security. However, using the stock price of a private corporation is a useful proxy to demonstrate the method. This paper relies on an established premise from an MIT/Carnegie Mellon study demonstrating women’s impact on group efficacy. Using this premise, I compare the results of the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study (that women do affect group performance in a positive way) to Enron stock price data using the Enron email dataset released in 2002 after the company’s

collapse. My hypothesis is that there is a direct relationship between the fraction of communication from women and stock price. I will explain the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study, my methodology, the results, and limitations to my research. In further research, I hope to apply my findings more broadly to the intelligence community in order to determine how women’s involvement in the IC impacts the security of our nation, through women’s impact on risk mitigation.

**MIT/Carnegie Mellon Study**

The study focused on the hypothesis that just as individual performance on one task determines an individual’s performance on subsequent tasks, so too does a group’s performance on one task determine the group’s performance on subsequent tasks. The researchers referred to this phenomenon as “collective intelligence” (“C”). The objective of the study was to determine if “C” existed, and if so, what caused “C”. Through the study the scientists confirmed their hypothesis: “groups, like individuals, do have characteristic levels of intelligence, which can be measured and used to predict the groups’ performance on a wide variety of tasks.”

Through the study the researchers found three factors which correlate with group intelligence: 1) the more socially sensitive the group, the better the group performed, 2) the more females in the group the better the group performed, and 3) groups were less collectively intelligent when only a few people dominated the

---

Researchers developed two experiments in order to gauge collective intelligence. For each experiment the researchers measured each participant’s IQ to determine baseline intelligence. Once that was complete, participants in the first experiment were split into “40 3-person teams [which] worked together for up to 5 hours on a diverse set of simple group tasks plus a more complex criterion task.” The result of this experiment determined that a group’s performance of one task made them 43% more likely to be able to perform tasks that followed. Similarly, an individual’s performance of one task makes them 30%-50% more likely to perform the same way on subsequent tasks. Therefore, the researchers found collective intelligence did exist, because it replicated the findings on individual intelligence.

The second experiment by researchers aimed to replicate the first, but this time the researchers “used 152 groups ranging in size from two to five members,” and the groups performed 10 tasks (instead of 5). The results were very similar, “yielding a first factor explaining 44% of the variance and a second factor explaining only 20%.” An important fact that the researchers determined from both studies was that, “when both individual intelligence and ’C’ are used to predict group performance, ’C’ is a [statistically] significant predictor, but average group member intelligence and maximum member intelligence are not.”

---

3 Ibid, 3.
5 Ibid.
6 Ibid.
Because the IQs of individuals within the group were not found to be statistically significant in determining collective intelligence, it was then up to the researchers to find the factors which correlated with enhanced “C” of the various groups. In order to do this, the researchers measured certain other characteristics of the group: individuals’ social sensitivity, the speaking turns taken by each individual, and the group’s gender makeup. The methodology for these three correlations relates to the study we performed in that it highlights the role women play in the success of groups.

Social sensitivity was measured through the “Reading the Mind in the Eyes” test, a study done by Simon Baron-Cohen at the University of Cambridge. This study aimed to establish the level of “Theory of Mind,” which is “the ability to attribute mental states to oneself or another person […] the main way in which we make sense of or predict another person’s behavior.”\(^8\)\(^9\) Women scored highest in the test out of three groups: women, men, and adults with High Functioning Autism or Asperger’s Syndrome. As a result of this testing, the researchers found that groups whose members were more socially intelligent (i.e. better able to predict others’ thoughts and behaviors) had more collective intelligence and performed the tasks better as a group.

The second finding of researchers was that “C” was “negatively correlated with the variance in the number of

\(^8\) “Theory of Mind” is also referred to as “mentalizing, mind reading, social intelligence, and overlaps with the term empathy” (see footnote 9 for citation).

speaking turns by group members.”

The researchers measured this by having a subset of the groups wear “sociometric badges,” which “continuously measure the various non-linguistic aspects of individuals’ interactions” and “are capable of capturing interaction patterns based on relative location and proximity of individuals across the information channels and the social signals derived from voice tone and activity level of face-to-face interactions.” These sociometric badges allowed researchers to determine how many people in each group spoke, the frequency with which they spoke, and the dominance they demonstrated. The fewer speaking turns taken by members of the group, the less collectively intelligent the group was.

Finally, researchers found that the more women in the group, the more socially intelligent the group was. However, the researchers attributed this finding to the social sensitivity finding: “this result appears to be largely moderated by social sensitivity because (consistent with previous research) women in [our] sample scored better on the social sensitivity measure than men.” It is important to note that, “in a regression analysis with the groups for which all 3 variables [social sensitivity, speaking turn variance, and percentage female] were available, all had similar predictive power for ’C,’ although only social sensitivity reached statistical significance.” Because the presence of women in groups is

---


12 Ibid


14 Ibid
correlated with ’C,’ and women are more socially sensitive than men (a factor which is statistically significant in predicting “C”), in our own study we chose to focus on how women’s involvement impacts the success of a group.

**Enron Case Study: Women Impact the Success of a Group**

Building on this study, I looked at the correlations relating to females in the group. While the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study showed that the proportion of females is not statistically significant in influencing a group’s success, the presence of females in the group is influential in the group’s success (due to their score on social sensitivity). As not just the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study showed, women have more social intelligence, which these studies also show translates into greater success of the group because social intelligence facilitates communication, and communication facilitates collective intelligence.

Therefore, I hypothesize that more women communicating will translate into greater group success. Because the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study measures social intelligence and group success in a closed setting, I devised a hypothesis to determine whether female communication in a “real world” or open setting could impact the success of the group. For my study I examined Enron email data, and tracked female email communication to the stock price of Enron. My finding was that when 60% or

---

15 I did not examine a smaller subset of people within the Enron dataset due to time and data constraints, and I did not feel it was something integral to the validity of my study. Should the time be made available in the future, social network analyses can be conducted to further refine the group members who were most influential to Enron. From there one should be able to replicate my methodology to see if the same results hold true for this smaller subset of people.

more of emails sent in a day were sent by females, the stock was always in the “high stock price” cluster. However, the converse was not true: if the stock was in the “high stock price” cluster, there was no way to tell what the fraction of female communication was. Instead of a clean, two-way, linear correlation between two variables, the data implied a one-way—and possibly causal—relationship from female communication to stock price.

**Scope and Methodology Note**

I chose the Enron data for my study because it is the largest email data set ever released to the public from a real company. The Enron email data was made public by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission during the Enron trial in 2004. It encompasses over 600,000 emails sent among 158 senior management personnel, including both men and women.17 We do not claim that the results of the Enron dataset are representative of any other company and we make no assumptions about the content of the emails. It is also important to note that we do not explore gender identity in categorizing individuals as “male” or “female,” and we do not attempt to describe why women may impact the success of a group besides the fact that they are female, or why they may be more socially sensitive. Finally, we do not make any claims about males in this paper; we specifically focus on women.

We are solely concerned with determining how women’s involvement played a role in another readily available measure: stock price. We assume that the 158 senior managers are the

---

most influential actors responsible for the success of the company, we assume that emails sent count as “communication,” and we also assume, as confirmed by previous studies, that social sensitivity works as well online as it does face-to-face.\textsuperscript{18,19} Our last important assumption is that stock price is a good measure of the success of a company. This is probably most valid in the long term, but less so for short-term fluctuations that comprise the bulk of our analysis.

Using these assumptions, we developed a computer code\textsuperscript{20} that calculated the fraction of emails by gender sent by Enron employees and compared results to Enron’s stock price on each given day for which we had data. We coded the list of employees by gender using Google searches and LinkedIn profiles. Where necessary, we attempted to find pictures of employees to determine gender. If that was not sufficient, we consulted email content to look for pronouns in reference to the individual. If that did not work, we ultimately assigned gender to the person using traditional male/female names (i.e. John would be male, Janet would be female). For simplicity, clustering analysis determined “low” and “high” categories of stock prices with $50 as the threshold.

\textsuperscript{18} It is important to note that a study done by researchers at MIT, Carnegie Mellon, and Union College found this to be true.


\textsuperscript{20} Thanks to Professor Sean Nolan for this assistance. He asked that I mention that the programming was prototypical in nature and not previously peer edited; as a result, any future work should include a rigorous review of the code.
Results

Using the coded data, we found three group clusters: the stock price of Enron without female communication, a “high stock price” cluster (> $50), and a “low stock price” cluster (<$50), as evidenced by this graph:
The “x” axis is the percentage of emails sent by females. This ranges from zero emails sent in a day by women, to 85% of emails sent by women in a day. The “y” axis represents Enron’s stock price on the day the email was sent. This ranges from zero to $100. Finally, the Z axis measures the number of days the combination of “x” and “y” were observed. For example, There were approximately 20 days in which female communication accounted for 0% of emails sent, and the stock price was at its lowest, and there was one instance where the stock price was $90 when female communication accounted for 85% of the email communication. Another way to represent this data is through this graph:

The orange circle represents the stock price with zero female communication from Enron.

The blue circle is what we deem our “high stock price” cluster. This cluster shows female communication ranged from
greater than zero to 85% of total email communication when the stock was above $50. The red circle is the “low stock price” cluster. This cluster shows female communication ranged from zero to 60% of total email communication when the stock was below $50. Finally, the pink circle is where we found most of our data to support our hypothesis. This cluster shows that when female communication accounted for more than 60% of total communication, the stock price was always in the “high” cluster. While the data shows what the stock price would be when female communication is above 60%, it does not reveal what female communication will be when the stock price is high or low. The implication of this is that women’s communication determines stock price more than stock price affects women’s communication. The more women communicate, the more likely the stock is to fall into the “high” category.

To simplify the analysis, we decided to calculate the probabilities of female communication affecting stock price in this table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent of communication that day by females</th>
<th>F = 0 (No female communication)</th>
<th>0 &lt; F &lt; 0.6 (Emails sent by females accounted for more than 0 and less than 60% of total communication)</th>
<th>F &gt; 0.6 (Emails sent by females accounted for equal to or more than 60% of total communication)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of emails</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock &lt; $50</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock &gt; $50</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of emails that fell into each stock price category given female communication level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(Stock&lt;$50, f)</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(Stock&gt;$50, f)</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probability of stock price given the level of female communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(Stock&lt;$50 I f)</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(Stock&gt;$50 I f)</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probability for a given level of communication given stock price category</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(f I Stock&lt;$50)</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.0002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P(f I Stock&gt;$50)</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Color coding does not correspond to previous graphs’ colors.
When female communication was zero, there were 144 days when the stock price was low, and 200 days when the stock price was high. When female communication accounted for more than zero, but less than 60 percent of all communication (from here referred to as “medium” communication), there were 499 days when the stock price was low, and 107 days when the stock price fell into the high category. Finally, when female communication accounted for more than 60 percent of all communication (from here referred to as “high” communication), there were 47 days in which the stock price was over $50, and only one day when the stock price was low.

From this data, we then determined the percent of total emails from the whole timeframe that fell into each of the six categories:

1) Low stock with zero female communication accounted for 14% of all emails;
2) Low stock with medium female communication accounted for 50% of all email communication;
3) Low stock price with high female communication accounted for 0.1% of all email communication;
4) High stock with zero female communication accounted for 20% of all email communication;
5) High stock with medium female communication accounted for 11% of all email communication;
6) High stock with high female communication accounted for 5% of all email communication measured.

Using these numbers, we determined what the probability of the stock price would be given the level of female communication. When female communication was zero, there was a 42% chance that the stock would be lower than $50, and a 58% chance the stock would be higher than $50. When female communication was medium, there was an 82% chance
that the stock price would be lower than $50, and an 18% chance the stock would be higher than $50. Finally, when female communication was “high”, there was a 2% chance that the stock would be lower than $50, and a 98% chance the stock would be higher than $50.

Finally, we examined what the probability would be for a stock price to determine communication. The six findings were 1) Given a low stock price, probability of zero female communication was 22%, 2) probability of medium female communication was 77%, and 3) probability of high female communication was 0.2%. Given a high stock price, 1) probability of zero female communication was 56%, 2) the probability of medium female communication was 30%, and 3) the probability of high female communication was 13%.

**Analysis**

Though our data does not present a causal relationship between women’s communication and stock price, we can determine that women’s communication plays a part in the cause of high stock price. Assuming we have defined success and chosen its metric properly, and assuming that email communication in a single day affects the stock price on that day, we can determine based on the data that when women’s emails accounted for 60% or more of emails sent in a day, the stock price was 98% likely to be in our high category. This probability is higher than any other probability on our chart:

---

22 See footnote 23. It is hard to say what can or cannot cause the stock price of a company to change in a given day, especially when trading can happen on the micro-second level. For the purpose of this study, and due to time constraints, we assume that communication can affect stock price on a given day because decisions are constantly being made which affect a company’s profits/losses, which in turn affect the demand for the stock.
men’s communication was only correlated with a high stock price 58% of the time, and a mixture of women’s communication (below 60%) with men’s only led to a high stock price 18% of the time. We know that in Enron’s case, women’s communication was responsible for predicting a high stock price 98% of the time, compared to men’s 58%: women’s communication is therefore a greater determinant of success than men’s. This verifies the findings of the study done by MIT/Carnegie Mellon.

To further prove that it is women’s communication that causes success and not the other way around, we can look to John Stuart Mill’s method of causality using concomitant variation. This method states that A, B, and C occur together with x, y, and z. However, when A is present without B and C, and x is present without y and z, A and x are causally related. For the purpose of this paper, we will define A as female communication above 60%, B as male communication, and C as both male and female communication under 60%. X in this circumstance is high stock price, and y is low stock price (z in this circumstance does not exist). If you take away B and C, x still remains. However, if you take away A, there is less of a likelihood that x exists, and a higher likelihood that y exists. Therefore, we can say that women’s communication above 60% has a causal relationship with the high stock price. We can also say that the inverse is not true: high stock price does not lead to female communication. As highlighted in yellow in the chart above, given a high stock price, there was only a 13% chance that female communication was high. In addition this appears valid due to a lack of findings on the impact success has on the frequency of women’s communication. However, because we have no proven causal model, this could be a weakness in our argument.
One interesting thing to note is that while high female communication leads to success, it could very well be that low stock price creates a higher level of communication across the board. The data demonstrates that overall communication was highest when the stock price was lowest. This could mean that more collective group communication led to lower stock price, or that when the stock price was low, groups were more willing to communicate. The fact that 50% of all communication fell into the medium female communication, low stock price categories could mean that women are less likely to communicate when the company is not doing well. It could also mean that men are more likely to communicate when the company is not doing well. We could also assume that in the medium female communication category, the near-majority of emails (at least 40% of them) were coming from males. It could be that as men dominated the conversations, women were less likely to be involved, and thus success was less likely to occur. In a future study it would be valuable to look at the “medium” category breakdown to determine when there was female majority, when there was male majority, and how that affected stock price.

Finally, based on the two data points relating to women’s communication and the probability that a level of communication affected stock price, we see that as women’s communication went down, so did the stock price. The probability of a high stock price dropped to 18% when female communication fell below 60%. Therefore, as females refrain from communicating, the stock price has the potential to go down but not up, unless there is no female communication at all.

When female communication was zero, stock price was high more times than it was low. One could argue that because you have a 58% likelihood of high stock price with zero female
communication, female communication (or female presence in organizations) is not a determining factor in company success. This argument would be a poor one, though, because it attempts to state that solely men can communicate and still achieve success for the company. Including females results in a much higher probability of profit. In business, higher probabilities of success (98% vs. 58%) are more desirable.

It is interesting to note the number of days that emails were exchanged by men alone. Throughout the time period of the Enron email data, male-only communication accounted for 16% of all communication. In other words, women were absent from communication 16% of the time—no female communication occurred. During this absence, the stock was only 58% likely to be in the high stock price category, and the probability that women were not communicating when the stock was high is 56%. There are many potential answers to why this is the case, all of which are outside the scope of this paper.

Limitations

The limitations of this study include the effect of time on stock price, and the lack of email content analysis. There is no way to determine whether communication in a given day can affect stock price on the same day it occurred. The price of a stock is controlled by supply of and demand for that stock, and usually depends on how much investors believe a company is worth.\(^\text{23}\) Putting the idea of insider trading aside, because the worth of a company can depend on good and bad news from the company (profits, losses, mergers, acquisitions, change in leadership, change in leadership,

etc.), it is possible that female communication on a given day could affect a company’s stock price if those women are talking about things that could positively affect an investor’s viewpoint on the company’s future. However, one could make the argument that internal communication, especially between 158 people in an organization of thousands, has a negligible impact on the price of the stock. One must remember, too, that Enron collapsed before stock trading approached the millisecond level meaning communication could not travel at the speed with which it does today, thereby limiting the potential for decisions to affect stock price in the same day. This issue requires further research, and highlights another limitation of our study: we did not consider the content of the Enron executives’ emails.

The lack of content analysis limits our ability to determine whether stock price can be affected in the same day communication is sent, and it also prevents us from determining whether what women say matters, or if just saying something is what matters. For example, when women’s emails accounted for more than 60% of emails sent in a given day, could those emails be idle chatter, or did they have to be about business in order for the stock price to be higher? This was outside the scope of our paper, but would be a good jumping off point for future research, seeing as the emails have already been coded by subject matter. If we could assess the content of the emails we could determine which subjects contributed to the highest stock price, and which subjects affected stock price over a period of time. In addition, we could determine what truly matters for a 98% chance of high stock price: females simply communicating, or females communicating about subjects pertinent to the goals of the company.
Conclusion

Through assessing collective intelligence using Enron stock data, my findings indicate that the presence of communications by women does matter in the public sphere. While my findings raise many questions to be answered in future research, they also offer insight into the integral role women’s communication plays in the success of groups, in essence providing a real-world example supporting the MIT/Carnegie Mellon study’s hypothesis and findings. Should data be made available, my methodology can be applied to other companies and institutions, and I anticipate results will vary.

I hope to apply my methodology to women in the intelligence community in order to determine how women in institutions affect national security. Since the beginning of OSS during WWII, the intelligence community has been dominated by men. Because the IC has such an impact on national security, it would be telling to see how, as women have become more prevalent, the IC has achieved greater success (or not). I would do this by measuring success in terms of risk, assigning a dollar value to lives and property lost or saved. I would then develop case studies where male and female involvement can be determined, and hopefully use data that allows me to determine the likelihood of female communication. By measuring female communication in national security institutions using memoirs, Google books, and social network analyses, I should be able to tie female communication to “low risk” and “high risk” situations in the same manner I did with Enron email data and Enron stock price. Should results mimic those in the MIT/CMU study, I could then provide an argument.

24 As long as they are communicating, of course.
for greater incorporation of women into institutions which have traditionally been male-dominated and which have the potential to impact the security of our nation.

Carolyn is a fourth semester student in the Security Studies Program at Georgetown University. She anticipates graduating in May of 2016.
Operation Artemis: A Template for Western Multilateral Intervention?

Jason Hartwig

The French led European Union intervention in the Ituri district of the DRC presents a useful case study to analyze the opportunities and limitations of multilateral European interventions bridging to larger UN missions in African conflicts. This paper analyzes the diverse causes of conflict in the Ituri district, which precipitated calls for intervention and examines the EU theory of the case and key assumptions for a short duration intervention to halt ethnic conflict in the district. Ultimately, the limited duration of the deployment, failure to effectively handover to a follow-on UN mission, and inability to address underlying micro-conflicts amidst larger ethnic and political cleavages prevented the intervention from achieving a sustainable conflict termination.

The European Union (EU) intervention under Operation Artemis in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) offers an illuminating case study of a shifting European approach to engaging in African conflict. Under French leadership, the EU utilized an overwhelming application of military power in a narrowly defined mission to end localized violence in the Ituri district of the DRC and bridge to a larger UN effort. Operation Artemis was the first deployment of an expeditionary force under the EU banner and pointed towards an increasing reliance on multilateral mechanisms to enforce emerging norms of military intervention to defend civilians. This paper will
analyze how the confluence of weak governance in the DRC, ethnic conflict, shortcomings in the United Nations (UN) peacekeeping mission, and weakness of the Ugandan military created an environment that elicited calls from the UN and EU for a military intervention. I will argue that France and the EU attempted to utilize the crisis in Ituri to exert global leadership under civilian protection norms through the use of multilateral institutions. This leadership was bounded by strict mandates on deployment of military power that sought to utilize military strength while mitigating risks to deployed forces. The intervention demonstrated a nascent template of utilizing overwhelming western military force to buy time for larger UN missions to deploy sufficient capabilities to sustain peacekeeping operations. Ultimately, I argue the intervention proved of limited effectiveness in supporting long term solutions to conflict in the DRC by focusing too heavily on military solutions rather than addressing root causes of the violence in Ituri.

Origins of the Ituri Crisis

The Second Congo War

Indiscriminate violence against civilians in the ethnically divided district of Ituri created the conditions that eventually evoked a military intervention from the EU. The violence in Ituri emerged in the wake of the initial outbreak of war in the DRC in 1998 that became characterized as the Second Congo War. The war began when President Laurent Kabila, newly installed after the war to depose the previous dictator Mobutu Sese Seko, demanded the withdrawal of Rwandan forces still occupying the eastern portion of the DRC. Fearing the new regime would undermine the Rwanda Patriotic Front’s (RPF)
ability to conduct counterinsurgency operations against Hutu rebels operating out of the eastern DRC, the Kagame regime worked with the Ugandan government to sponsor a rebel organization of disaffected Congolese elites to overthrow Kabila. The ensuing conflict became Africa’s most lethal war and drew in multiple external interventions.¹

After initial gains, Rwandan and Ugandan forces fell into a stalemate as a forceful Angolan intervention propped up the Kabila regime from complete collapse. In short order, Ugandan and Rwandan forces came into conflict over lucrative resource extraction in the central provinces of the DRC and the conflict gradually devolved into multiple localized struggles between proxy para-military groups throughout eastern and northern DRC.² Much of the local conflict could be attributed to divisive land ownership and citizenship policies of the Mobutu regime. The arrival of mass numbers of Hutu refugees in the wake of the RPF’s victory in Rwanda exacerbated the tribal, ethnic, and nationalist divides stoked by years of abusive rule from the Mobutu regime.³

**Ethnic Conflict**

Within the context of ethnic divisions exacerbated by years of authoritarian misrule and armed groups rampaging across the eastern DRC, the long-simmering conflict between the Hema and Lendu communities in the Ituri district of northwestern DRC exploded into bouts of ethnic violence in 1999. Like the

---

more publicized conflict between the Hutus and Tutsis, the conflict between the Hema and Lendu featured imagined divisions of economic livelihoods between pastoralists (Hema) and farmers (Lendu) that had been exploited by Belgian colonial authorities in the early 20th century. The Belgians had codified perceived differences in modes of production between the two communities into divisions of extractive labor based on ethnic constructs as the Lendu became laborers while the Hema raised cattle for consumption by laborers.4

As with other communities throughout the eastern DRC, ethnic divisions were deeply intertwined with land ownership. The Belgians had largely bestowed land ownership on the Hema due to their position as herders at the end of the colonial period.5 Mobutu’s land distribution policies exacerbated socially constructed divisions between the Hema and Lendu communities and Hema elites consolidated control over a majority of the positions in local leadership.6 In his analysis of the Kivu provinces immediately to the south of Ituri, Pierre Englebert discovered similar dynamics involving a mix of ethnic identity, contested claims on land ownership, and the power of legal command. Englebert argues this confluence of factors structured ethnic dynamics in a manner that reinforced colonial patterns and created a dangerously competitive environment for local governments positions based on ethnic divisions.7 The complete collapse of state authority in the wake

4Veit, Alex, Intervention as Indirect Rule: Civil War and Statebuilding in the Democratic Republic of Congo, (New York: Campus Verlag, 2010), 1, 56, 102.
5Ibid., 100.
of the Ugandan incursion into Ituri in 1998 provided space for local elites to contest previous land ownership arrangements. Micro-level conflict over land had proliferated throughout the eastern DRC from 1999 onwards and the Hema took advantage of an initial local alliance with occupying Ugandan forces to form the Union des Patriotes Congolais (UPC) in June, 2002. The Lendu countered the emergence of the UPC by forming multiple militias to balance Hema power. 8 Rather than explaining the crisis in Ituri as an explosion of primordial hatred, the appropriation of ethnic identities by elites in Ituri closely aligns with Williams’ larger treatment of conflict in Africa finding entrepreneurs of violence capitalizing upon the interplay of colonial constructs of ethnicity and resource distribution in competitive political environments. Through tracing of conflict causation, the ethnic conflict in Ituri was the symptom of deeper-seated struggles for control of political power and resources between elites.9

The Ugandan Intervention

As part of the precipitating events of the Second Congo War, the Ugandan Peoples Defense Force (UPDF) had occupied Ituri in 1998, largely to protect Ugandan economic interests in the resource rich region. Once in control of Ituri, leadership from the UPDF managed a monopoly over resource extraction, trade, and taxation during their occupation. The UN alleged that the UPDF network managing these commercial enterprises had intentionally provoked ethnic tension in order to justify the presence of Ugandan forces. Evidence from UPDF behavior seemed to support this assertion, as the UPDF had sponsored

8 Veit, Interventions as Indirect Rule, 116-118.
many of the armed groups in Ituri at some point in an apparent attempt to maintain a delicate balance of power between combatting ethnic militias and maintaining control of local resource extraction.  

By the start of 2003, as the war seemed to be winding down, almost 2,000 Ugandan troops remained in Ituri, despite pressure from the international community to completely withdraw based on a series of agreements intended to end the Congo War.  

Uganda had committed to withdrawing from the DRC under the Luanda agreement in 2002. As part of the agreement, the Ituri Peace Commission was established to oversee the peace process after the UPDF’s withdrawal. However, problems almost immediately plagued the handover as the commission did not actually convene until eight months after being established at Luanda. The UPDF’s strategy of balancing Ituri’s armed groups through shifting alliances had begun to fail, particularly as the UPC began to assert itself against its former patron. Upwards of a dozen ethnic militias had emerged from the chaotic Ugandan occupation of Ituri and the UPDF strategy for executing a withdrawal was predicated on balancing a coalition of militias against the UPC, which culminated in driving the UPC out of Bunia, the district capital in March, 2003. However, the coalition almost immediately began to turn against itself while the UPDF completed its

---

11 Ibid., 7.
withdrawal in early May. The inability of the UPDF to control increasingly fractious armed actors corresponds with quantitative empirical research identifying the difficulty in bargaining amongst fragmented actors in civil war and highlighted a key element in the political environment of Ituri.

In the midst of a proliferating constellation of armed groups, the UPDF had entirely failed at guaranteeing local security through a mix of corruption and organizational weakness. Corruption had gutted the UPDF through neo-patrimonial practices under Museveni and the behavior of UPDF leadership provided stark evidence of its corrosive effects. In this degraded state, the UPDF largely reflected findings from literature identifying the organizational inability of African militaries to defeat rebel groups like the UPC or provide security to citizens due to shortcomings wrought from corruption and neo-patrimonialism.

The U.N. Intervention

The Congolese Army (FAC) did not possess the capacity to fill the void in security forces left by the withdrawal of the UDPF.

---

As a result, the UN mission in the DRC (MONUC) intended to deploy a peacekeeping force on the heels of the UPDF’s departure. However, the mandate for the force did not allow peacekeepers to engage combatant factions, which was necessary as violence continued to escalate in the absence of security forces. Additionally, the Uruguayan battalion selected was meant for static operations and did not possess the capacity for peace enforcement operations, including heavy weapons and transport capabilities. Limited capacity for patrolling kept the UN force isolated in its base in Bunia.

Recent scholarship on the failure of peacekeeping missions in Africa has pointed towards a misguided emphasis on reaching agreements between belligerents without actually addressing the aims of the combatants. This dynamic featured prominently throughout the eastern DRC following the series of peace agreements in 2002, as few of the war aims maintained by the multiple armed groups spreading across the region were addressed in peace negotiations.

By May 2003, as MONUC struggled to establish any measure of stability in Bunia, estimates placed the number of civilians killed in Ituri since 1999 as high as 50,000. Immediately following the UPC’s expulsion from Bunia and the withdrawal of Ugandan forces, Lendu militias began to round up Hema civilians, while citizens protested against MONUC following the peacekeepers’ failure to intervene. Hema militias responded to the Lendu offensive and at least 430 people were killed in a two week period in May around

---

20 Williams, War and Conflict in Africa, 178-181.
Bunia, while upwards of 12,000 people sought shelter at the MONUC compound.\(^{21}\)

Recognizing the inability of MONUC to stymie the violence surrounding Bunia, Secretary General Kofi Annan penned a letter in mid-May requesting a multi-national intervention led by a member state of the Security Council. Annan conceptualized a brief intervention that could stabilize the situation around Bunia enough to provide MONUC sufficient breathing room to build capacity in Ituri.\(^{22}\) The Security Council passed resolution 1484 shortly after Annan’s letter was published. The resolution provided a mandate for a multi-national force to deploy to Bunia immediately to secure citizens and UN personnel around the airport and city. The deployment duration was expressly limited with a September 1, 2003 end date. An expanded MONUC brigade was authorized for deployment by mid-August to replace the intervention force.\(^{23}\)

**French and EU Decision to Intervene**

French foreign policy towards Africa had been increasingly moving away from unilateral action since 1994 in the wake of its controversial intervention in Rwanda. The debacle in Rwanda had marked a similar high tide of larger European involvement in African peacekeeping operations. However, French interests in central Africa had not waned in the absence of unilateral interventions. Starting in 1994, the French worked

with the United Kingdom in a series of summits to develop a framework whereby the collective European security apparatus grew with a focus towards supporting African stability.\(^{24}\)

In the growing consensus favoring collective European security enshrined under the European Security and Defense Policy (EDSP), the Chirac government possessed an opportunity through the crisis in Ituri to re-engage in central Africa under the mantle of a multilateral institution. The French interest in intervening in Ituri was twofold. First, the crisis presented an important opportunity to demonstrate French leadership on a global stage. France had eagerly embraced the growth of European multilateralism to address security issues and Ituri offered a useful test case to reinsert French influence in central Africa under a multilateral framework. Second, calls for intervention in Ituri had followed closely on the heels of the Chirac government’s well-publicized battle with the United States over the invasion of Iraq. American swipes at multilateral organizations like the UN and willingness to pursue unilateral action in lieu of collective action directly threatened the growing French reliance on multilateralism to remain globally relevant. An intervention supported under a UN mandate with a clear humanitarian purpose presented a stark contrast to unilateral American approaches in Iraq.\(^{25}\)

The French accepted Annan’s request for assistance as the framework nation under the EDSP. The EU largely supported the French vision of utilizing the call to action in the Ituri crisis as a means of demonstrating European leadership and unity on humanitarian issues.\(^{26}\) The EDSP had further laid out collective


\(^{26}\) Ibid., 405.
European interests in maintaining stability in Africa, regardless of whether the engaged states possessed interventionist histories in Africa. With the US seemingly uninterested in African stabilization missions and believing the UN to be incapable of effective peace enforcement, the EU identified peace enforcement operations in Africa as a strategic void. Although the French government certainly saw the Ituri crisis as an opportunity to demonstrate French global leadership in a gap left by the US, the EU writ large demonstrated similar interests in the opportunistic use of crisis to fill an unoccupied space in leading peace enforcement operations.\textsuperscript{27}

As the Security Council resolution sought a clearly limited, but rapid intervention, French military expeditionary capabilities were the key instrument of power supporting the intervention. The French military would provide 900 of the 1,500 troops who ultimately participated in Operation Artemis under the title of the International Emergency Multi-National Force (IEMF). Many of these troops belonged to special operations units possessing the ability to rapidly deploy and seize and secure airfields, which proved a critical capability in Bunia. The French military also provided light armor and tactical and strategic air support. The rest of the intervention force was filled out by special operations forces from Sweden, Germany, and the UK, while Canada and Belgium provided logistical personnel.\textsuperscript{28}

The theory behind Operation Artemis placed a heavy reliance on the ability of the EU force to manage a swift


\textsuperscript{28} Miskel, “The Intervention in the Democratic Republic of Congo,” 8.
deployment of a well-equipped force capable of rapidly seizing control the Bunia airport and ultimately securing the city through the deterrent power of the intervention force’s advanced capabilities. As directed by Resolution 1484, the mission was short duration and limited geographically, allowing the decisive application of force to stabilize Bunia for the arrival of a reinforced MONUC brigade in August. EU leadership envisioned using unique Western military capabilities to provide a bridge to the more limited MONUC force, while building momentum through deterring armed groups around Bunia. Importantly, in its focus on utilizing military means, the theory of the case did not include considerations into the root causes of the conflict between the Hema and Lendu or the local political dynamics of Ituri.

**EU and French Normative Assumptions**

The Chirac government and other leaders in the EU developed Operation Artemis under three key normative assumptions. First, Europe had largely retreated from unilateral engagement and had embraced multilateral security arrangements as the best means of addressing African security issues. Second, Europe had become a leader in pressing for human rights norms and promoting the controversial normative belief in government responsibility to protect civilians. Finally, EU political and military leadership believed that decisive use of Europe’s unique military power could rapidly stabilize conflict zones and provide a window for a larger UN force to arrive and assume stabilization responsibilities.

---

29 Ibid., 8.
Execution of Operation Artemis demonstrated how the collective security framework established under the EU began to exert normative constraints on decisions of national governments. French decision-making was further restricted by distrust from DRC’s neighbors and the Chirac government recognized the need to operate under a multi-national framework to overcome African biases against the French colonial past.\(^\text{30}\) After the French government assumed the role of framework nation and proposed an EU led intervention, other European governments’ decision making was limited by a normative trap whereby commitments already made under the EDSP reduced the likelihood European governments would be willing to renege support on the inaugural mission outside of Europe.\(^\text{31}\) Further, the European Security Strategy explicitly articulated a priority to strengthen the UN Security Council. The passage of Security Council Resolution 1484 created an additional normative constraint for European governments to lend support to the French led intervention in order to uphold the stated commitment to supporting the UN Security Council.\(^\text{32}\)

The efforts of the French and British governments to build the initial momentum towards embracing a collective European security framework under the EU placed them in a unique position as France began considering intervention.\(^\text{33}\) The French government’s deliberations over intervention in May


\(^{32}\) Ibid., 397.

were guided by the dual roles France played as a permanent member of the Security Council and the likely framework nation of an EU response. In this position, the French government could confidently assume they would be able to gain an acceptable mandate from the UN and procure EU support through willingness to bear most of the operational costs and risks as the framework nation.  

The bruising international debate on the intervention in Iraq had strained the British and French relationship as they occupied opposite sides of the debate. The political leadership of both nations recognized the utility of operationalizing the EDSP, which both governments still supported, through a humanitarian intervention demonstrating collective European commitment to normative values on human rights and protection of civilians. The Ituri crisis ultimately presented a rather non-controversial opportunity to put the Iraq divisions behind Europe and allow the EU to step forward onto the world stage as a unitary actor on pressing international security issues.

Protection of Civilians and Human Rights

Although published in December 2003, after the conclusion of Operation Artemis, the European Security Strategy highlighted the importance the EU placed on human security as part of the EU’s commitment to global security. The document clearly articulated the Great Lakes Region as a strategic priority in addressing state failure and protecting civilians from sub-state violence. The EU approach to those strategic priorities placed an emphasis on intervention to provide security capacity in the absence of its provision by sovereign governments in regional

34 Ulriksen, “Operation Artemis,” 512
conflicts or failed states. European leadership had also been decisive in leading the emerging normative discussion on the responsibility to protect. The report issued by the International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty in 2001, demonstrated the increasing importance Europeans placed on collective international responsibility in protecting civilians in conflict. Within these documents, the EU had articulated a key connection between multilateral commitments and the responsibility to protect civilians as a collective security concern, particularly in Africa.

Unique EU Military Capabilities

Security Council Resolution 1484 and Kofi Annan’s letter to the Security Council articulated many of the empirical assumptions underlying the French theory of intervention to terminate violence against civilians. Foremost among French concerns was sufficient provisions to enforce the mandate. French peacekeeping doctrine focused on proactively using lethal force, if needed, to enforce rules established to secure civilians in a specific geographic area. While providing sufficient provision for force, the mandate was also exceedingly narrow – pertaining only to Bunia and the immediate surrounding area - thereby providing enough geographic limitations to conceivably achieve short-term outcomes in

achieving stability with the rather small force being deployed.\textsuperscript{39} The differing provisions for force between the MONUC mandate and the EU emergency intervention force illuminate the importance EU leadership identified in the ability to enforce UN provisions through military means. Further, by keeping the intervention force independent from UN control, the EU demonstrated the normative assumption driving the ESS that European militaries possessed unique capabilities best deployed outside of UN missions, which were generally constrained by weak mandates and sub-standard quality troops and equipment.

**Execution of Operation Artemis**

French military planners had already begun planning an intervention before the mission was submitted to EU approval. Due to the interventionist legacy in Francophone Africa, planners were able to make several reasonable planning assumptions in determining the feasibility and force requirements of an intervention in Ituri, including access to Ugandan airfields in Entebbe, thus allowing sufficient proximity to the operational area and ensure rapid concentration of forces. Further, as MONUC still maintained its presence in Bunia, planners believed that advance elements of the intervention force would be able to secure the airfield in Bunia in order to facilitate airlift of follow-on forces. Providing light armor and air support offered sufficient capabilities to likely deter resistance from the UPC, which had reoccupied Bunia following the withdrawal of Ugandan forces. Possessing the ability to mass overwhelming firepower against relatively

lightly armed forces seemingly mitigated many of the inherent risks of meeting resistance during the intervention.\textsuperscript{40} In order to further reduce the probability of meeting armed resistance, the French commander on the ground, Brigadier General Thonier went to great pains to explain that the intervention force would not be disarming or demobilizing any armed groups.\textsuperscript{41}

The operational execution of Operation Artemis largely aligned with the risk and opportunities French and EU planners envisioned. Despite initially offering public opposition to the use of French forces in an intervention unit and threatening armed resistance, the UPC withdrew their fighters from Bunia just before the arrival of French advance forces. This withdrawal offered an important opportunity for the intervention force to build combat power without risking a confrontation with the UPC before possessing overwhelming force. Despite the withdrawal of the UPC from within Bunia, the IEMF narrowly avoided another significant intervening risk when a large force of Lendu militiamen attempted to storm Bunia. Fortunately for the IEMF, the assault was repulsed by the UPC on the outskirts of the city without requiring intervention from the still weak EU force.\textsuperscript{42}

Perhaps chastened by international criticism over the nature of its intervention in Ituri, Uganda was sufficiently accommodating in providing use of airfields in Entebbe to logistically sustain the intervention force. After action reviews of the intervention focused extensively on the impressive logistical feat of rapidly deploying a combat ready force on such short notice and highlighted the singular importance of utilizing Ugandan airfields. The use of French and Swedish

\textsuperscript{40} Homan, “Operation Artemis in the DRC,” 2-3.
\textsuperscript{41} Ulriksen, “Operation Artemis,” 518.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 517-518.
special operations units proved critical in securing the Bunia airfield and providing a cover force for the build-up of follow on forces. The role of the special operations units certainly highlighted the unique capabilities possessed by the EU force that could not be replicated within MONUC. Finally, despite proving lacking in the ability to stabilize Bunia, the MONUC forces already present in Bunia provided key logistical support to the operation.

Outcomes

The arrival of the initial French contingent did not initially halt Hema and Lendu militias’ violence against civilians. However, Swedish and French forces fought a few sharp skirmishes with the UPC as the IEMF began to challenge UPC control in the areas immediately surrounding Bunia, while also clashing with Lendu militias. Overturning his previous proclamations relating to disarming militias, General Thonier declared Bunia a weapons-free zone on June 22, after completing build-up of forces. The IEMF proactively patrolled to enforce the new proclamation, resulting in more skirmishing with the UPC, which fared poorly in a series of one-sided engagements resulting in the UPC’s withdrawal from the city outskirts. Both Hema and Lendu combatants publicly remarked on the vast disparity in military capabilities between their lightly armed militias and the intervention force and generally acceded to stabilization efforts around Bunia after the initial skirmishes. The IEMF show of force did produce telling

---

46 Veit, Intervention as Indirect Rule, 153.
immediate results with the civilian populace as 60,000 refugees returned to Bunia and the IEMF distributed 3,000 tons of humanitarian supplies.47

The IEMF demonstrated many superior attributes compared to the MONUC forces it augmented in Ituri. Importantly, the deployment of units with their command structure and organic assets intact proved a significant difference in the more ad hoc command and control arrangements under MONUC. The predominant use of French also simplified communications. In terms of capabilities, the intelligence collection capacity within the IEMF far exceeded any capability held by MONUC forces. The ability to drive operations through intelligence combined with night-time operational capability gave the IEMF a massive advantage over MONUC. Finally, the use of air assets proved decisive in deterring prolonged resistance from militias around Bunia as the IEMF expanded its footprint in the city.48

---

To analyze the effect of the EU intervention on violence levels, I constructed a dataset from the Armed Conflict Location and Event Dataset, which compiles media reporting on armed conflict by location and event type. As demonstrated in Table 1, the data tracking violence levels in Ituri indicate that the IEMF intervention did have short-term effects in limiting violence. After the last burst of violence perpetrated by Lendu militias in Bunia as the IEMF was still in the midst of deployment, only one attack resulting in civilian fatalities was

---

recorded in media outlets. However, almost immediately after the withdrawal of the IEMF in September, fighting resumed between the UPC and other ethnic militias, while the UPC tested newly arrived forces with MONUC in a series of engagements in and around Bunia. By November, the UPC had resumed attacks against civilians in Bunia, apparently undeterred by the presence of a more robust force under MONUC. Likely, MONUC’s failure to decisively respond to UPF provocations only days after the IEMF’s departure signaled that the temporary period of peace enforcement in Ituri had ended.50

The data tracking violence levels in Ituri seem to support critiques of the IEMF deployment. Among the most significant shortcomings identified in the intervention was the lack of a demobilization plan or any type of mandate to enforce peace through disarmament and demobilization. Although the IEMF instituted and enforced a weapons free zone in Bunia, the narrow geographic focus on the zone simply forced groups to temporarily displace and wait out the IEMF deployment.51 Simultaneously, Lendu militias utilized the return of refugees to infiltrate fighters back into Bunia after their expulsion by the UPC prior to the arrival of the IEMF.52 Ituri’s permeable borders with Uganda and Sudan allowed an unrestricted flow of arms and illicit financing to maintain the various militias in the district, despite temporary setbacks following clashes with the IEMF around Bunia.53 Uganda and Rwanda continued efforts to influence conditions in Ituri, albeit at reduced levels, through

the support of various militias, once again undermining the long-term impact of the IEMF and MONUC intervention. Ultimately, by July 2004, militias in Ituri remained unreconciled with the Kinshasa government and violence once again flared between various militias.\footnote{Ibid., 11, 18.}

The French led EU intervention in Ituri had succeeded only in providing a very brief respite to violence in Ituri. The limited footprint and mandate of the intervention meant that issues sustaining armed groups and their capacity for violence were never addressed by the IEMF, while the short duration mandated under the Security Council resolution clearly signaled to militias that they only needed to avoid decisive engagements with the IEMF to survive.\footnote{Homan, “Operation Artemis in the DRC,” 4.} The UN after action review reported that the IEMF ultimately failed to provide an effective bridge to MONUC. The limited duration of the deployment offered almost no flexibility in the timeline for the deployment of the Ituri Brigade, while the unwillingness of EU forces to remain and re-hat under MONUC command fatally delegitimized the UN mission. European insistence on remaining separate from UN forces signaled to local militias in Ituri that MONUC would always remain an entirely different, less capable entity than the elite forces deployed under Operation Artemis.\footnote{Peace Keeping Best Practices, “Operation Artemis,” 14.}

The EU decision to deploy specialized military forces without supporting political and diplomatic efforts placed MONUC in an almost identical position it had occupied following the withdrawal of the UPDF earlier in 2003, as it possessed neither the mandate nor capabilities to limit violence in Ituri. The logic driving EU assumptions in achieving stability
through short-term military interventions proved deploy flawed. Empirical analysis on conflict termination finds that only interventions based on power-sharing agreements facilitated by strong third party mediators and sustained by credible external security guarantees maintain peace agreements with any regularity. The assumptions driving the EU intervention possessed none of these considerations. Many assumptions behind Operation Artemis seem to have fallen back into colonial paradigms relying on overawing locals with demonstration of superior military capability. However, just as in colonial times, while western forces generally confined themselves to well-fortified localities, entrenched patterns of indigenous rule adapted and resisted western influence.

Conclusion

The IEMF has provided a template guiding many French and EU interventions following Operation Artemis. The concept of utilizing European forces as a bridge to larger UN missions was replicated later in the DRC in 2006 as well as EU missions to Chad and the Central African Republic in 2009. Overall, the EU conducted 12 peace operations in Africa under the EDSP from 2003-2012, with the most intense activity in the period from 2003-2008. Operation Artemis clearly demonstrated the beginning of a normative shift for the French and EU as multilateral deployments in support of peace operations

58 Veit, Intervention as Indirect Rule, 254.
continued to proliferate. The DRC became a testing ground for multiple forms of peace operations and the model of augmenting UN forces with western capability and stronger mandates for peace enforcement was replicated with the Intervention Brigade in the eastern DRC in 2013.\(^6\)

Although Operation Artemis successfully stabilized Bunia for two months in 2003, the EU intervention did not achieve a lasting impact in stabilizing Ituri. The fleeting nature of the deployment merely temporarily displaced armed groups, while the EU never connected their military capability to a prolonged UN presence or any form of political settlement. The rapid resumption of violence against civilians and between armed groups following the IEMF’s departure signaled the flawed logic underpinning French and EU assumptions guiding the intervention. The EU had clearly demonstrated singular military capability, but its unwillingness to more fully cooperate with MONUC undermined any long-term effects in providing a strong external security guarantee to the peace agreement under which the Ituri Peace Commission operated. Perhaps the continued agony of the eastern DRC more than ten years following Operation Artemis offers the most compelling indictment of the flawed EU assumptions driving the intervention and the ultimate futility of short duration use of military force absent robust political mediation.

Jason Hartwig is a second year Masters candidate in the Georgetown School of Foreign Service, Security Studies Program with research interests focusing on international security and sub-state violence. Jason's professional experience includes five years as an officer in the United States Army and

\(^6\) Nivet, 111; Holt and Berkman, “France and European Peace Operations,” 162.
three years working on security sector reform at the Department of Justice's International Criminal Investigative Training Assistance Program. Jason received a B.A in history from Dartmouth College.
The Future of Conflict: A Study of Boko Haram and Hybrid Warfare

Zachary Henderson

Since the inception of its conflict with the Nigerian government in 2009, Boko Haram’s capabilities have greatly expanded, allowing it to take control of territory in northeastern Nigeria. Boko Haram’s innovative use of conventional, irregular, terrorist, and criminal elements has created a loose confederation of forces that presents a hybrid threat. The concept of hybrid warfare has been developed to give a theoretical basis for how future conflicts are likely to be organized. Hybrid warfare is defined as a protracted conflict that leads to a strategic victory by neutralizing conventional forces' strengths while gaining strategic advantage through asymmetrical means. Since mid-2014, Boko Haram can be categorized as a hybrid threat rather than as strictly an insurgency or terrorist organization. Understanding Boko Haram as a hybrid threat provides insights into a low-end asymmetric hybrid conflict and builds upon the hybrid warfare construct.

Boko Haram has been described as a group of roving bandits committing wanton violence against northeastern Nigeria’s population and as an insurgency that has destabilized the region
Neither categorization, however, satisfactorily explains how Boko Haram has successfully captured territory and expanded capabilities that have grown to threaten the region. Boko Haram’s innovative use of conventional, irregular, terrorist, and criminal elements has created a loose confederation of forces that presents a different kind of threat. Since mid-2014, Boko Haram can best be categorized as a hybrid threat rather than as strictly an insurgency or terrorist organization. Understanding Boko Haram as a hybrid threat provides insights into a low-end asymmetric hybrid conflict, builds upon the hybrid warfare construct itself, and helps to identify the differences between insurgency and a hybrid conflict. This paper will evaluate Boko Haram as a hybrid threat and illustrate why this categorization provides fresh insights into the conflict. Section one will present a brief overview of Boko Haram’s history, including its capabilities, tactics, and stages of development. Section two will provide the foundation for the hybrid threat construct. Section three will evaluate Boko Haram as a hybrid threat. Section four will argue against understanding Boko Haram as a compound war, insurgency, or irrational actor. Finally, section five will describe the benefits and implications of evaluating Boko Haram as a hybrid actor.

---

History of Boko Haram

Jamaat Ahl Al-Sunna li-Dawa wal-Jihad, which means ‘Group of the Followers of the Prophet for Propagation and Jihad,’ is the formal name for the group typically known as Boko Haram, a term that means “education is forbidden.” Because it is commonly used for the group and for simplicity, the name Boko Haram will be used throughout this paper.

Boko Haram began as a loosely-formed movement in the late 1990s that opposed corruption in the government and aimed to create a more Islamic society in Northern Nigeria. Mohammed Yusuf, a mallam (Quranic scholar) who preached in Maiduguri, Borno State in Nigeria, founded the movement that would later become Boko Haram. Yusuf was a Salafist (school of Islam) who advocated a return to the values of the original Prophet Muhammad's followers and a rejection of modern innovations. According to Yusuf's teachings, modern societies, including Western secular values, are corrupt and against the teachings of the Quran.

Boko Haram arose out of the inequality, corruption, and ethnic differences that exist in Nigeria. A 61% majority of the population lives in “absolute poverty,” on less than one dollar a day. Geographic, religious, educational, and ethnic differences in the country further exacerbate the differences between ethnic groups. Northern Nigerians are predominantly Muslim, taught

---

3 Jane's, 5-6.
in _madrassas_ (Islamic theological schools), and are Hausa (an ethnic group that generally resides in Northeastern Nigeria).\(^6\) Southern Nigerians are mainly Christian, educated in secular institutions, and are primarily Yoruba and Igbo.\(^7\) Northern Nigerians have few opportunities for economic advancement. Southern Nigerians, while not much better off, have more opportunities since they are closer to the Niger Delta oil fields.\(^8\) From the perspective of Yusuf and many other Muslims in the North, the Westernization of Nigeria and the influence of Southern Christians are what caused Nigeria’s extreme poverty and corruption. Historically, Southerners have had political power since colonization, have benefited from corruption of political power, and have been blamed by Northerners for the current problems in Nigeria. These conditions, when combined with others, helped ignite the conflict in northeastern Nigeria that exists today.

While attending a funeral on June 11, 2009, 17 Yusufiyya (followers of Yusuf) were shot and wounded by police following their refusal to comply with a contentious new law requiring people to wear helmets while riding motorbikes.\(^9\) Publicly condoning violence for the first time, Yusuf announced to his followers that there must be retaliatory attacks


\(^7\) “Nigeria Facts.” National Geographic.
http://travel.nationalgeographic.com/travel/countries/nigeria-facts/. Accessed September 4, 2015. These are the three most prominent ethnic groups. There are approximately 250 ethnic groups in Nigeria.

\(^8\) Ibid.

against the police.\textsuperscript{10} This incident initiated the main conflict in northeastern Nigeria. There was a subsequent series of attacks by the Yusufiyya, many of who were then arrested by police. Yusuf was arrested and then killed while reportedly trying to escape.

Some of the group's senior figures fled Nigeria and joined other jihadi groups in Western Africa, which provided experience and knowledge to the future leaders of Boko Haram. It is reported that Khalid al-Barnawi and Adam Kambar, two of Yusuf's associates, went to Algeria and trained with Al-Qaeda in the Islamic Maghreb (AQIM).\textsuperscript{11} Mamman Nur, another associate of Yusuf, fled to Somalia and trained with Harakat al-Shabaab al-Mujahideen (HSM, later known simply as al-Shabaab). These men returned to Nigeria, and in August 2009, they issued a statement entitled, “We Speak as Boko Haram.” They declared jihad against Nigeria and said, “Boko Haram is just a version of Al-Qaeda, which we align with and respect:” and “We support Osama bin Laden, we shall carry out his command in Nigeria until the country is totally Islamized.”\textsuperscript{12} Abu Mohammed Abubakar bin Mohammed, know as Abubakar Shekau, led a violent group parallel to Yusuf’s peaceful campaign known as the Nigerian Taliban from 2002 to 2009.\textsuperscript{13} Shekau took control of Boko Haram in July 2010.\textsuperscript{14}

The first stage of development of Boko Haram occurred during the uprisings from July 2009 through December 2010. The frequency and severity of operations during this first stage were much lower than they have come to be in recent years.

\textsuperscript{10} Jane’s, 3, 33-34.
\textsuperscript{11} Jane’s, 7, 9-10,13.
\textsuperscript{12} Jane’s, 4, 35.
\textsuperscript{13} Jane’s, 3.
\textsuperscript{14} Jane’s, 4.
Table 1 (below) shows that the number of deaths in 2009 and 2010 were lower than in later years, and this fatality rate reflects the relatively low intensity of the conflict at that time. Boko Haram used assassinations, improvised explosive devices (IEDs), suicide vehicle-born improvised explosive devices (SVBIEDs), raids, and armed assaults as primary tactics. These methods would remain as hallmarks of the group. Its targets included political and religious figures that criticized the group, security personnel and stations, Christian churches, secular schools, beer breweries, and other businesses that Boko Haram believed to be immoral.

Table 1: Approximate Number of Fatalities During Boko Haram Conflict from 2009-2014.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fatalities</td>
<td>1250</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1750</td>
<td>1750</td>
<td>2500</td>
<td>7000</td>
<td>14850</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second stage of development of Boko Haram spanned December 2011 to April 2014. During this time period, the severity and frequency of attacks increased. Table 1 shows that there was an increase in the number of fatalities from previous years, evidencing the escalation of the conflict. This escalation was caused by an increase in the number of militants gained through recruiting efforts, prison breakouts, and the reported

---

15 Jane's, 36, 38.
return of more senior members of the group who had trained with AQIM and Al-Shabaab.\(^{18}\) On January 20, 2012, Boko Haram conducted coordinated small arms, IEDs, suicide IEDs (SIEDs), and at least one SVBIED attack on government, police, military, and intelligence targets in the city of Kano, Nigeria, in an effort to gain the release of prisoners being held there. Over 200 people were killed during this single attack, but similarly complex attacks would become more frequent.\(^{19}\)

The third stage of development began in April 2014, when the group again escalated the frequency and severity of attacks. 2014 set a new high for the number of fatalities in any year during the conflict.\(^{20}\) From this point on, Boko Haram conducted attacks almost daily. Most notorious was Boko Haram's attack on a school in Chibok, Borno, where militants kidnapped 276 female students and torched nearby residences. Publicized with the Twitter trend ‘#BringBackOurGirls,’ this single attack sparked international outrage.\(^{21}\)

The fourth stage of Boko Haram’s development has been characterized by the active control of territory. On August 24, 2014, Shekau released a video relaying the group's new territorial ambitions.\(^{22}\) Beginning in early April 2014, the group began to seize a small number of towns. The organization declared itself a part of the Islamic caliphate on August 25,
By December 1, 2014, Boko Haram was in control of at least 47 towns across the states of Adamawa, Borno, and Yobe. Boko Haram had gained control of territory equivalent in landmass to Belgium. Boko Haram then declared its allegiance to the Islamic State located in Syria and Iraq on March 7, 2015.

The Nigerian government’s response to Boko Haram was ineffective from 2009 to 2014. Political leaders would not discuss policy regarding Boko Haram. As Manji Cheto, vice president of corporate advisory company Teneo Intelligence explained it, “By acknowledging the scale of the violence, [we would be] acknowledging a certain degree of [President Goodluck Jonathan's] failure as a president, so he's not going to talk about security…” The government’s silence was an attempt to quell fears in Nigeria of Boko Haram’s increasing influence and maintain the government’s political power. Amnesty International claims that the military frequently ignored towns that requested assistance prior to an impending

24 Jane's, 51.
28 Ibid.
Boko Haram attack and the military also committed indiscriminate attacks on civilian populations thought to be in support of the group. 29 Nigerian defense officials called these claims “baseless.” 30 Civilian Joint Task Forces and vigilante groups have arisen to protect communities and have blurred the lines between civilian and combatant. 31

During December 2014, the region began organizing to fight against the threat of Boko Haram through the Multi-National Joint Task Force (MNJTF), which consisted of military forces from Nigeria, Niger, Chad, and Cameroon. In January 2015, Boko Haram overran the MNJTF headquarters base in Baga, Borno State, Nigeria. 32 Now, in late 2015, Boko Haram continues to conduct daily attacks, ambushes, and terrorism against these countries' militaries and civilians. Boko Haram has shifted from more conventional tactics to using irregular warfare to protract the conflict. 33 As MNJTF’s conventional forces have become more engaged in the conflict, the number of fatalities has sharply risen. January 2015 was the most deadly month of the conflict with over three thousand

31 Okeowo, 2015.
fatalities.\textsuperscript{34} Beginning in early 2015, the MNJTF began to push back Boko Haram from its strongholds in the Lake Chad Basin area and Sambisa Forest, but the group is reported still to have between four thousand to six thousand full-time fighters.\textsuperscript{35} While Boko Haram's conventional capabilities are being marginally degraded, its asymmetric capabilities, namely those of suicide bombing and raiding, are still a present danger to the region.

**Hybrid Warfare Concept**

The concept of hybrid warfare has been developed to give a theoretical basis for how future conflicts are likely to be organized. The hybrid warfare construct strives to develop an understanding of a new way of war that is organized against Western militaries' vulnerabilities, particularly those in the moral-ethical field.\textsuperscript{36} The hybrid theory of warfare has also been created as a response to the American experiences in the


Afghanistan and Iraq wars. The hybrid concept was conceived in a way that allows the enemy to have a vote in the shape of the conflict. 37 The challenge that faces American military planners is the lack of adequate planning for hybrid warfare. United States planners view hybrid threats as only contingencies of conventional wars. 38 The hybrid warfare model has made contributions to military operational contingency planning, allowing for responses to a hybrid threat regardless of the type of warfare within the conflict. Examining and producing more case studies can improve indicators so that hybrid warfare is more readily identifiable.

Hybrid warfare is characterized as a protracted conflict that leads to a strategic victory by neutralizing conventional forces' strengths while gaining strategic advantage through asymmetrical means. 39 Hybrid warfare combines the use of conventional, irregular, and criminal elements on all three levels of warfare: tactical, operational, and strategic. Military analysts have long described this as “multimodal” or “multivariant” warfare. 40 Furthermore, the blending of different methods of warfare creates synergy to target the vulnerabilities of the opposition and produces greater physical and psychological results on the battlefield. 41

Hybrid wars' asymmetrical operations are distinguished by their unrestricted operational art. 42 Operational art is the link

37 Hoffman, *JFQ*, 34.
38 Hoffman, *JFQ*, 38
39 Davis, 25.
40 Hoffman, *JFQ*, 35.
between strategic objectives and tactical actions. According to Fleming, “[Operational art] is characterized as the employment of military forces, sequencing of tactical actions and logistical operations to attain strategic goals. Moreover, operational art is the creative use of distributed operations for the purposes of strategy or the conduct of operations in order to attain operational and strategic aims.” As a characteristic of hybrid strategy, unrestricted operational art refers to the link between “strategy and tactics in an asymmetric and unrestricted manner devoid of military customs and accepted norms” and is “manifested in organizational innovation at the operational level.” Unrestricted operational art allows for the hybrid threat to conduct operations that are morally dubious, against Geneva Conventions, and violate human rights. By using an unrestricted operational art, a hybrid threat can overcome a stronger, more conventional opponent.

There are five characteristics an actor must possess to be evaluated as a hybrid threat. First, the actor must employ a mix of conventional forces or weapons and irregular or terrorist capabilities, often augmented by criminal activities. Second, these modes of warfare need to be applied at the strategic, operational, and tactical levels of warfare. The organization of the hybrid threat will most likely have a de-centralized command of planning and execution and can be a state or non-state actor. The third area of evaluation is in the actor’s use of an unrestricted operational art. Fourth, hybrid threats need to have an internal ideology and an external enemy that helps to

---

43 Ibid. 31.
45 Fleming, 32.
define the organization. The previous steps create the fifth area of evaluation: the synergy created between all of these elements. Synergy is created by the combination of components, that when used together, create more of an effect than the sum of their parts. Synergy created by hybrid threats explains how hybrid threats can overcome conventional military strength to obtain strategic objectives.

There is a distinction between hybrid warfare and hybrid threat. The difference describes hybrid threat actors as possessing the capabilities to conduct hybrid warfare. It may be advantageous for the actor to conduct hybrid war if the circumstances warrant application. The actor can move between using and not using hybrid war as it suits its interests throughout the conflict as long as the capability to do so still exists and has not been significantly degraded during the conflict.

**Evaluating Boko Haram as a Hybrid Threat**

Hybrid warfare recognizes that conflicts will not strictly follow the rules of conventional or irregular warfare; a blending of styles will take place. This adds to the difficulty of distinguishing separate capabilities in evaluation. Boko Haram’s most-used conventional capability is direct fire infantry, although it does possess advanced technological weapons as well. Shekau has appeared in videos in 2014 displaying the group's armories that include anti-aircraft

---


47 Jane’s, 24-29.
missiles, armed personnel carries, machine guns mounted on trucks, and rocket propelled grenades. Boko Haram's conventional capabilities have been best demonstrated since mid-2014 when the group began to take and hold territory. In early January 2015, Boko Haram overran a MNJTF military base. Capturing villages and military bases through conventional armed assault has bolstered the credibility of its conventional capabilities. As the group came into more conflict with the MNJTF in early 2015, fatalities dramatically increased. During the early part of this year, Boko Haram stood on equal footing with the MNJTF. Since then, however, Boko Haram has begun to give up ground to the MNJTF. Many officials warn that Boko Haram is strategically retreating, rather than indicating that its forces are collapsing. Boko Haram’s capabilities still remain significant.

Boko Haram, on paper, employs a conventional hierarchical organizational structure. Village commanders report to regional commands, and regional commanders are a part of the shura council of Boko Haram proper. Shekau presides over the council and he is responsible for being the figurehead of the organization. In practice, however, the group is more similar to a loose confederation of forces that has

49 Jane’s, 51-53.
51 Ibid.
52 Jane’s, 11.
not always agreed with one other on tactics or ideology.\textsuperscript{53} Multiple organizations operate autonomously under the umbrella term Boko Haram; however, it is unclear how much control Boko Haram and Shekau have over all of the factions, and regional commanders are largely semi-autonomous.\textsuperscript{54} Information about the group’s organizational structure is not known with certainty; however, the group’s ability to change tactics, organize logistics, and its overall effectiveness as a fighting force indicate that some structure is present in the organization.

Figure 1 shows the number of reported events, contributing factors, and fatalities in the conflicts between government forces and Boko Haram from May 2011 through July 2015. The numbers illustrate the increasing escalation of the conflict. There appears to be a correlation between the number of fatalities, the rise of conventional capabilities in mid-2014, and the beginning of the MNJTF's offensive in January 2015. Figure 1 also shows that Boko Haram first began to gain territory and cause related fatalities in May 2014. Furthermore, the majority of violence is categorized as being against civilians or as a battle with no territory exchanged.

Boko Haram uses a mix of more clearly definable irregular and terrorist tactics such as ambushes and bombings. The group has waged a protracted conflict that has tested the resolve and legitimacy of the Nigerian government. The organization conducts assassination, armed assaults, ambushes, bombings, and kidnapping. Its targets include police, military, local militias, civilian commerce centers, as well as political and

\textsuperscript{54} Jane’s, 11.
religious opposition leaders. Boko Haram’s use of terrorism and irregular warfare provides time and space for the group to operate freely while also serving other purposes, such as degrading security forces or as reprisal attacks on resisting populations.

**Figure 1:** Fatalities and Reported Events in Conflict with Boko Haram from May 2011 to July 2015.  

Boko Haram provides opportunities for criminal activity to occur in four ways. First, Boko Haram outsources operations to

---

http://www.usfglobalinitiative.org/newsletter/category/security-review/
criminal groups and local gangs. These groups function as reserves and can be activated and deactivated as needed.\textsuperscript{56} Many fighters are therefore part-time and can blend back into the population after operations cease. Second, the group uses kidnapping, and sometimes ransom, for funding and manpower. Extortion, robberies, and looting are also used and provide resources for the organization.\textsuperscript{57} Third, in areas not clearly controlled by the government or Boko Haram, opportunistic criminals carry out robberies and raids for profit.\textsuperscript{58} Many of these crimes are attributed to Boko Haram without substantial supporting evidence. Fourth, Amnesty International defines many activities by criminals and Boko Haram as crimes against humanity. It is thought that the female captives are married off to fighters of the organization – a practice that is tantamount to sex slavery. Two thousand women have been kidnapped since the beginning of 2014.\textsuperscript{59} Men, women, and children are conscripted into the fighting forces.\textsuperscript{60}

\textsuperscript{56} Blood, 2015.
\textsuperscript{58} Smith, \textit{Boko Haram}, 5.
Within its organizational structure, Boko Haram has achieved a fusion of operational and tactical levels of regular and irregular warfare. Boko Haram has been operating between three and five organizations run by different commanders since late 2014.61 One of these organizations, Ansaru, is a splinter group of Boko Haram led by Barnawi, who is reported to have received training in Algeria by AQIM.62 Barnawi was influenced by AQIM’s more global outlook and desire to strike Western targets, and he disagreed with Shekau about the targeting of Muslims and civilians for attacks. Barnawi ultimately broke away from Boko Haram in 2012 and formed Ansaru, a group that specializes in the kidnapping of Westerners.63 There was a reported reconciliation between the groups in late 2012 that was later confirmed on November 13, 2013, when Boko Haram and Ansaru claimed responsibility for kidnapping a French priest.64 Since the reconciliation, Ansaru has operated under the name of Boko Haram but continues to function independently. The confederation of forces that make up Boko Haram, such as Ansaru, help to explain how multiple, simultaneous operations are occurring around the country.

The fluidity of actions between conventional, irregular, and terrorist warfare enables Boko Haram to shift to and from various types of tactics in order to confront the specific security threats it has faced. For example, the Nigerian government declared a state of emergency in the states of Borno, Adamawa, and Yobe in May 2013.65 There was an influx of Nigerian military forces in population centers and Boko Haram

62 Jane’s, 12.
63 Jane’s, 9-10, 12-13.
64 Jane’s, 4, 11-12.
65 Jane’s, 44.
responded by dispersing into the countryside and waging irregular warfare.\textsuperscript{66} IED attacks and irregular warfare degrade the Nigerian military’s strength and require the military to disperse to protect the population. Boko Haram’s forces are then able to effectively coordinate concentrated attacks against this dispersed military force. The synergy gained from this combination of tactics delegitimizes the government and breaks the Nigerian military’s morale, contributing still further to Boko Haram’s might in the region.

In addition to tactical advantages such as those mentioned above, Boko Haram is also supported by a large capacity for intelligence-gathering and operational space. Nigeria's government and military are vulnerable to corruption and Boko Haram is reported to have infiltrated various security services in the country.\textsuperscript{67} Boko Haram's militants are able to gather intelligence based upon their proximity to the population and by the territory that they control. Additionally, the ungoverned space between Boko Haram's territory and the Nigerian government-controlled territory has allowed for havens for retreat and regrouping, a situation that has helped preserve its fighting forces, specifically in the Sambisa Forest and in the porous borders between Nigeria, Cameroon, Niger, and Chad.\textsuperscript{68} This ungoverned space has resulted from the Nigerian security forces’ focus on regaining cities, leaving the rural villages and the countryside very vulnerable.


\textsuperscript{67} Pate, 2014, 50.

\textsuperscript{68} Ibid.
The fourth area of evaluation rests on the simultaneous internal ideology and external enemy of the group that defines the organization. This principle is rooted in Social Identity Theory and helps to explain how a hybrid threat identifies itself. Its religious identity, socio-cultural context, and ethnic group identity define Boko Haram’s internal narrative. The Nigerian government, military, and security forces are the external existential threat to Boko Haram. The external threat, with conventional military capabilities, drives the hybrid actor to seek alternative methods of warfare. Thus, Boko Haram uses terrorism and hybrid warfare to confront the conventional capabilities of the Nigerian military.

The most defining aspect of hybrid warfare is the use of conventional, irregular, criminal activity, and unrestricted operational art to create synergy that supports Boko Haram’s strategy. Since mid-2014, Boko Haram has used conventional forces to gain and hold ground. Bombings and terrorism are employed as reprisal attacks in order to degrade the Nigerian police, military, and civilian JTFs. Boko Haram’s criminal activity allows it to fund, replenish manpower through volunteers and conscription, and provide arms, ammunition, and equipment to its forces from smuggling and raiding. The Nigerian military is crippled from responding by its intelligence services’ and military’s corruption. The presence of corruption, Boko Haram’s mix of operations, and lack of government responsiveness de-legitimizes the Nigerian government and greatly affects operations on the battlefield. Hybrid warfare

---

70 MuCulloh and Johnson. 2013, 16.
creates temporal and geographic space for Boko Haram to operate and has been effective in making strides towards its strategic objectives.

Boko Haram's synergy incorporates the dysfunction of the Nigerian government, economy, and military. By defeating the Nigerian military and de-legitimizing the government, Boko Haram is able to control the population. The Nigerian people do not trust their military, in part because of Boko Haram’s tactics, but also because the military has been implicated in indiscriminate attacks on communities that were suspected of supporting Boko Haram. These attacks have galvanized the population against the government. Furthermore, from the beginning of the conflict, security forces have often ignored the request for military support and protection from impending Boko Haram attacks.

Boko Haram has all of the characteristics of a hybrid threat. It engages in conventional, irregular, terrorist, and criminal activities; it operates with an unrestricted operational art shown by its progression of escalation in violence; and it fuses the tactical and operational levels of war into a unified strategy. Boko Haram also possesses advanced technologies to augment conventional and irregular forces. The synergy created between these elements within Boko Haram help to explain its ability to defeat the Nigerian military and de-stabilize the region.

Alternatives To Hybrid Warfare

Compound warfare is the intellectual foundation for the hybrid threat concept. Compound war is the term coined by Thomas Huber to describe the use of regular and irregular forces

71 Fleming, 13.
together to achieve strategic objectives. Regular and irregular forces complement each other and increase the nature of the threat posed by each kind of force. To make a distinction between hybrid warfare and compound war, Frank Hoffman argues that the fusion of operational and tactical forces is the basis for hybrid threats. Hoffman describes hybrid war as hinging on the capability to “employ all forms of war and tactics, perhaps simultaneously.” Huber disagrees with Hoffman over the fusion of operational and tactical levels of warfare, saying that this fusion is nothing new, but is a traditional characteristic of an insurgency. The preceding evaluation of Boko Haram has demonstrated that it has combined the operational and tactical levels of warfare with regular and irregular forces, particularly since August 2014.

The larger critique of hybrid warfare, led by Huber and Russell Glenn, is that hybrid warfare is a subset of insurgency or irregular warfare. Hoffman's rebuttal is that “the hybrid construct was deduced from looking at the enemy instead of simply planning as if the enemy doesn’t get a vote. Hybrid Threats are the problem, not an operating concept that presents

73 Hoffman, JFQ, 36.
74 Ibid., 36-37.
75 Ibid., 35.
Categorizing wars based on the response, either with counter-insurgency (COIN) or conventional war, does not allow for a response that is tailored to the threat. Furthermore, the choice between conventional warfare and COIN is a false argument. The future of warfare will be a hybrid model.

*Future Character of Conflict Paper (FCOC)* by the United Kingdom’s Ministry of Defense describes future conflicts as being hybrid in nature. This paper explains that hybrid warfare “is not code for insurgency or stabilization, it is about a change in the mindset of our adversaries, who are aiming to exploit our weaknesses using a wide variety of high-end and low-end asymmetric techniques.” Hybrid warfare is a unique challenge, different from either COIN or conventional operations. Hybrid warfare requires policymakers and military leaders to recognize the threat and adapt to the changing security environment that combines different modes of operations.

By evaluating Boko Haram as a hybrid threat, policymakers are better able to construct a response to the security threat posed by Boko Haram. To defeat Boko Haram, policymakers should target Boko Haram as an organization, its objective of creating a caliphate, and the environmental conditions that give rise to politically motivated violence. A strategy to defeat Boko Haram would consist of a conventional war to uproot Boko Haram’s strongholds, securing the

---


population from terrorism, and building the trust and legitimacy of the Nigerian government and military by providing services to the population and reducing corruption. The strategy to defeat Boko Haram may appear to be COIN or counterterrorism strategy, but the benefit of using the hybrid warfare model is it allows there to be a more a more flexible response to many different kinds of conflict. For example, the policy response to Boko Haram will not be the same as for Hezbollah or any other conflict, but the model of hybrid warfare will remain the same.

One other possible objection to Boko Haram being classified as a hybrid threat is that it is not a rational actor. For any hybrid threat, the underlying assumption is that the actor is rational. This argument is directed at Boko Haram's organizational structure and the perception of uncontrollable and indiscriminate violence. From the beginning, Boko Haram’s organization has always been a loose confederation with groups operating independently at times. Ansaru is the most notable example. Ansaru removed itself from under the umbrella of Boko Haram and then rejoined the confederation in 2012.  

This loose confederation of forces is also to blame for criminal activities that occur in ungoverned areas. Local gangs operate as mercenaries for Boko Haram and provide a reserve force that can be activated, deactivated, and blend back into the population. These criminal activities add to the confusion of what is identified as a Boko Haram operation. According to this argument, by the nature of the organization, Boko Haram does not control its forces operating under the name Boko Haram.

82 Jane's, 4, 11-12.
Furthermore, how Boko Haram controls local and regional forces is unknown.

The strategic level of thinking can modify what operations are undertaken by Boko Haram and thereby exercise control over operations. By recognizing that a hybrid threat actor is pursuing its own interests, it is strategically predictable. 84 It is in keeping with Clausewitz that strategic aims give way to war as a form of policy. Strategy is often codified and provides the overarching guidance to lower organizations. Hybrid threats will present new operational challenges, but remain strategically predictable.

Shekau, the primary leader of Boko Haram, communicates through videos. His appearances allow the organization not only to identify, but also to communicate with outside audiences, his strategic objectives and those of his organization. During these videos, he has claimed that Boko Haram's goals are to Islamize Nigeria, overthrow the government, and rid the country of anything not in keeping with his interpretation of Quranic and Salafist law. By providing strategic guidance to the movement, he is controlling the organization through establishing missions for lower organizations. Additionally, Shekau provides target suggestions for other attacks. 85 Any other organizational communication provides additional command and control to the organization. Through these communications, Boko Haram is acting rationally to achieve its strategic objectives.

Conclusions

84 Fleming, 27.
85 Ndege, 2013.
Examining Boko Haram as a hybrid threat produces insights into how hybrid threats develop, their strengths and weaknesses as organizations, and the synergy that is created by their unique response to their context. Furthermore, the understanding of the hybrid warfare construct is aided by the exploration of a low-end asymmetric conflict with a high amount of social, political, military, and economic disruption.

Boko Haram’s progression of violence from terrorism to hybrid warfare is critical to understanding the development of a hybrid threat. No organization begins with a list of capabilities that can qualify it as a hybrid threat; these capabilities take years to develop. Boko Haram was allowed years to develop, beginning with the Nigerian Taliban. As tensions escalated with the government, a confederation of forces banded together to begin a campaign of terrorism across northeastern Nigeria. The government ignored the threat to the country, and when it did react it was slow and ineffective. This allowed both temporal and geographic space for Boko Haram to develop, recruit, and arm itself. The cycle of limited government response and Boko Haram’s escalation continued. Boko Haram acquired conventional capabilities that aided in gaining and controlling territory. In mid-2014 Boko Haram was able to hold a significant area and to control many villages and cities in northeastern Nigeria through conventional forces. This progression provides a model of the development of a hybrid warfare actor.

The importance of a population-centric strategy cannot be overstated when examining hybrid threats. Boko Haram was able to take advantage of the government’s ineptitude by separating the Nigerian government from its people. In the future of warfare and hybrid conflicts, securing populations will remain a vital part of obtaining a strategic victory. By securing the population of Nigeria, Boko Haram’s ability to gather
intelligence, conscript military forces, and acquire funding would be crippled. Furthermore, securing the population is vital to the legitimacy of the Nigerian government.

Examining Boko Haram and the synergy produced from its organizational structure is significant for understanding the complex nature of hybrid threats. Boko Haram’s synergy is created through a movement of autonomous organizations with a common strategy; employing a mix of conventional and irregular warfare, terrorism, and criminal activity; and operating with an unrestricted operational art. The synergy created allows for Boko Haram to respond to threats to its security, de-legitimize the government, and control territory. The ability to move and progress from terrorism, irregular, and conventional warfare, even as equipment and capabilities are destroyed, is evidence of resilience within the organization. The fluidity between different kinds of operations, increased by the scope of operations with unrestricted operational art, is unique to hybrid threats. Even if Boko Haram’s conventional forces are destroyed by MNJTF, the hybrid threat construct suggests that the organization will be able to persist within the context of its other capabilities. Boko Haram will continue to be a security threat to West Africa for many more years. More significantly, hybrid warfare will continue to present security challenges in future conflicts.

Zachary Henderson is a first year graduate student in the Security Studies Program at Georgetown University’s School of Foreign Service. He is a United States Army veteran and holds a Bachelor of Science in Religious Studies from Missouri State University.
Defending Against Hybrid Warfare in Estonia

Matthew Mullarky

Russia’s successful use of hybrid warfare in Crimea demonstrated how a state could effectively impose its will through speed, deception, and unconventional capabilities. Estonia’s demographics and geographic position make it a prime target for a hybrid attack. Accordingly, Estonia will need to take action both independently and in conjunction with the United States and NATO in order to successfully forestall a future incursion. Domestically, Estonia will need to improve the capabilities of its Territorial Defense Force and politically and socially integrate its Russian minority population into domestic civic institutions. Militarily, Estonia should cooperate with the United States and NATO to bolster NATO’s conventional military deterrence, with a focus on building a credible quick reaction force. These actions will limit Russia’s ability to manipulate Estonia’s minority populations and expand domestic tensions into a larger war.

Russia’s successful use of hybrid warfare in Crimea demonstrated how a state could effectively force its will through a combination of propaganda, cyber, diplomatic, and conventional military means. It is a style of warfare that prioritizes speed, flexibility, and deception. The United States and its allies will need to devise a full spectrum defense to appropriately resist an offense with such breadth. This is especially true for Estonia, a nation that is particularly vulnerable to hybrid tactics given its border with Russia, large
socially and politically unintegrated ethnic Russian population, and comparatively small military. Neither Estonia nor NATO, as an organization, can defend against hybrid warfare separately. Instead, they must work together to counter the threat. Their response will need to address the domestic, military, and political aspects of hybrid warfare.

Domestically, Tallinn should ensure that Russia cannot use Estonia’s large minority populace as a pretext for invasion – with special attention given to its significant ethnic Russian population. This can be abetted by socially and politically integrating minorities into the larger population. The Estonian government can also work with NATO to counter Russian propaganda and gain some control over media narratives and disinformation. At the same time, Tallinn may wish to train local police and civic institutions on addressing and diffusing potential crises that are instigated by an external power.

Militarily, hybrid warfare still relies on an attacker’s conventional military dominance to rapidly overwhelm a defender’s resistance and consolidate territorial gains. Keeping this in mind, both Estonia and NATO should improve their abilities to rapidly respond to conventional military threats. NATO should also strengthen its intelligence capabilities to more easily recognize when and where an attack is likely to occur.

Politically, NATO should update Article V to better address the concept of hybrid attacks. The provision’s current language about an “armed attack” may hinder or even prevent NATO from taking necessary precautions and counter-measures during the early stages of a hybrid offensive. This is problematic, given how quickly a hybrid assault can escalate into a conventional occupation and force the defenders into a fait accompli.
Updating Article V becomes all the more important given that NATO will likely continue to play an important role in protecting Estonia’s security. Pooling intelligence resources from all of the member states will allow the alliance to anticipate offensive maneuvers and differentiate between a prelude to an attack and mere propaganda. The member states should also work together to establish a credible and capable conventional military deterrent that is mobile, rapidly deployable, and can deny an aggressor the opportunity to overpower local defense forces. More specifically, the United States should bolster its State Partnership Program (SPP) in Estonia and develop better metrics to measure the program’s effectiveness.

Hybrid attacks present a unique challenge to defenders. However, a state or alliance in the process of resisting a hybrid attack has multiple opportunities to forestall an offensive. Doing so first requires the defender to understand the specific threat hybrid warfare poses.

Defining Hybrid Warfare’s Challenges

Just as a state may conduct a conventional war in multiple ways, a state may also execute a hybrid war through different avenues. This fact makes it difficult to form a precise definition of the nature of hybrid warfare. In the broadest terms, it is a form of warfare that brings together state and non-state actors using conventional and unconventional means in physical and non-physical battle-spaces. In the physical dimension, it can include criminal or paramilitary organizations armed with conventional weaponry using insurgent tactics. These groups may be advised or supported by professional armies. However, the cyber and propaganda elements, used in conjunction with
various military operations, give hybrid warfare its unique place on the spectrum of conflict.¹

States have grappled with the issue of hybrid warfare since the Classical period. Herodotus mentions an early example of a state using a combination of conventional military might, propaganda, and their opponents own resources in tandem as coercive tools. During the Greco-Persian Wars, the Persians gave captured Greek spies a tour of Persia’s shipyards, arsenals, and camps in order to demonstrate the enormity of the empire’s invasion preparations. The spies were then allowed to return to their cities in Greece and spread terrifying rumors of Persia’s military might.² The Persians intended for the spies’ rumors to act as propaganda and weaken the Greeks’ resolve before the invasion began and facilitate their planned conquest.

The 2006 Lebanon War provides a more modern example of hybrid warfare. Israel pursued chiefly conventional tactics against Hezbollah, which employed a mixture of conventional, insurgent, criminal and terror tactics in opposition. More significantly, Hezbollah made excellent use of propaganda to magnify its limited tactical successes into a public relations victory. Its messaging campaign pressured Israeli politicians even after the conventional phase of the war ended.³ In this case, Hezbollah used a mixture of conventional and unconventional military forces to withstand Israel’s offensive

and followed up with a media drive to portray survival as success.

It is debatable whether the previous examples truly constitute hybrid warfare. Technological limits made it impossible for the Persians to have any real coordination between their military forces and propaganda efforts. Similarly, one could contend that Hezbollah’s use of media in the Lebanon War is no different from any government or organization that has claimed that their defeats are victories.

Even so, the examples do show a continuity of states using their militaries, messaging, and other non-military tools in different combinations. Propaganda is employed before, during, and after the conventional phase of a conflict to gain international legitimacy and weaken a defender’s resolve. Local populations, especially aggrieved minority groups are exploited as either an excuse for a *casus belli* or as potential allies. These tools are backed by capable conventional military forces. All of these actions are deliberately used in combination to achieve the attacking state’s political objectives.4

Russia’s approach to hybrid warfare is unique in that Russia incorporated it as a part of official military doctrine sometime between 2010 and 2014. The Gerasimov Doctrine, named after Russia’s Chief of the General Staff, calls for the integration of military, cyber, legal, and information forces. It places a premium on obfuscating intentions to keep defenders off-balance.5

While hybrid warfare is a recent addition to Russian military doctrine, it employs tactics similar to those used in

---

older conflict, such as the 2008 Russian-Georgian War. Russia justified intervention by stating a need to prevent the Georgian government from committing violence against South Ossetia and Abkhazia. This rationale gave Moscow political cover to fight Tbilisi. These tactics were further refined during Russia’s Crimean invasion in 2014.\textsuperscript{6} One can see Russia’s significant hybrid capabilities in the fact that Crimea was annexed within 28 days of the decision to escalate the conflict.\textsuperscript{7}

Russia’s brand of hybrid warfare has its own distinct pattern of eight phases:

\textit{Phase 1:} Non-military asymmetric warfare begins, which includes propaganda and misinformation to establish favorable conditions for the next steps.

\textit{Phase 2:} The attacker misleads political and military leaders through diplomatic channels and false government reporting.

\textit{Phase 3:} The attacker compromises the defending nation’s government officials and security forces through intimidation and bribery. If successful, the defenders will abandon their duties.

\textit{Phase 4:} The attacker issues destabilizing propaganda to exacerbate a population’s discontent, which is then compounded by entry of Russian militants.

\textit{Phase 5:} The attacker isolates the defender by establishing no-fly zones and blockades. Private military companies are used in conjunction with armed opposition units.


\textsuperscript{7} Johnson. “Russia’s Approach to Hybrid Conflict – Implications for NATO’s Deterrence and Defense,” 8-9.
Phase 6: Military operations start with extensive reconnaissance and espionage. Large-scale misinformation continues.

Phase 7: Targeted use of precision weapons and artillery is used alongside previous methods.

Phase 8: Conflict termination through the elimination of armed resistance. Artillery and air strikes are the primary sources of heavy firepower, while light infantry detachments operate freely and receive supplies by air.\(^8\)

The eight phases demonstrate how the Russian government uses non-military action to prepare for a political and military takeover. The disinformation campaign attempts to keep the defender’s military, civilian leadership, and general population ignorant of Russian intentions while weakening the state’s ability to resist. The military then takes advantage of the created disorder by eliminating remaining opposition.\(^9\)

The Gerasimov Doctrine gives context to Russia’s hybrid operations in Georgia and Crimea. Russia’s incorporation of hybrid tactics into military doctrine suggests that Moscow views the two wars as a potential model for future conflicts. Consequently, NATO states should individually and jointly formulate methods to counter a hybrid attack.\(^10\)

Russia’s formulation of hybrid warfare presents structural challenges for NATO, which was established to respond to conventional threats. The first challenge is hybrid war’s

---


ambiguous nature. Hybrid warfare largely exists at a level of conflict below conventional war. Moreover, escalation can occur very quickly and on the attacker’s time-table. Actions in the earlier phases, while undesirable from the defender’s perspective, are not considered in the same category as a conventional war. Bribing a foreign public official is a cause of scandal and will mark a low point in relations between the two states, but hardly constitutes war. Propaganda, similarly, can be a component of war, but is not an act of war unto itself. Hybrid tactics heighten these ambiguities and make the potential cost of a defender’s miscalculation much higher. States cannot be on high alert at all times but they also cannot afford to ignore a possible prelude to a conventional attack. Furthermore, the attacker gets to choose if and when to escalate. If the situation seems ripe, the attacker may choose to expand operations through more aggressive military elements. If, however, the early phases are unsuccessful, the aggressor can choose to continue implementing destabilizing operations and wait for a better attack opportunity or choose to pursue another strategy altogether.11

This mixture of ambiguity and escalation leads to a second challenge: the applicability of NATO’s Article V. Since Article V is currently only triggered by an armed attack, it would probably not be activated by the propaganda, bribery, and espionage that characterize hybrid warfare’s early phases.12 The danger here is escalation can occur very quickly and the aggressor’s conventional forces will only have to deal with

11 Johnson. “Russia’s Approach to Conflict -- Implications for NATO's Deterrence and Defense." 4-6, 10-12.
12 Julien Lindley-French. "NATO and New Ways of Warfare: Defeating Hybrid Threats." Paper presented at the NATO Summit, Newport, United Kingdom, September 4-5 2014.
token resistance once the intimidation, disinformation, and bribery campaign has succeeded. It may be too late for allied states to effectively act by the time the war enters its conventional phases and Article V is called upon in response.

All of this serves to raise the question of whether NATO is the appropriate organization for addressing hybrid warfare. NATO is primarily a military organization and is ill-equipped to handle domestic unrest, even when provoked by an outside power. Even those proponents in favor of expanding NATO’s security guarantees to cover hybrid warfare have noted the importance of a stronger domestic response to address underlying social issues. NATO cannot do much to help states politically and socially integrate minorities into larger society, nor is it well equipped to address larger economic issues.13

Nevertheless, NATO can provide a conventional military deterrent and coordinate intelligence sharing among member states. NATO can also provide a forum for member states to discuss and coordinate energy and economic issues, especially in conjunction with the European Union. In these areas, it greatly enhances the states’ tools compared to what they would possess if each chose to act independently.14

Hybrid Warfare’s Shortcomings

While hybrid warfare does present Estonia, NATO, and the United States with some different challenges, it also contains a few inherent structural weaknesses that can be exploited by

defenders. Recommendations for Estonia and other NATO member states will be made based on these weaknesses.

First, Russia’s efforts rely on having a sympathetic local population. A hybrid warfare aggressor needs a fifth column to provide a quasi-legal and ethical justification for an invasion, as well as to provide manpower for militia forces. More fundamentally, an aggressor needs a compliant local population to facilitate an area’s occupation. States might be able to mobilize the local population when defending, as Hezbollah did in 2006, but they cannot always count on this group when attacking. This effectively limits hybrid action to areas where the population is already alienated and vulnerable to an attacker’s propaganda.

The attacker is in control of the escalatory time-table but cannot safely advance to the next phase until earlier phases have been successfully completed. In other words, a military advance cannot take place until the attacker has created a permissive environment through propaganda, sabotage, and political confusion. Therefore, while the attacker may choose if and when to escalate, the order of the distinct phases themselves are predictable. This gives the defender an opportunity to plan an appropriate response. Recognizing the various phases and bolstering defenses accordingly, before the attacker introduces conventional military forces, should assist in keeping the conflict at a lower and more manageable level.

A defender also has the option of maintaining a capable conventional military deterrent, though this is not a complete

solution. While the Gerasimov Doctrine is notable for the number of non-military components it incorporates into Russia’s war-making capabilities, the final phases are still determined by the advent of conventional armed forces. A strong conventional deterrent therefore remains an important piece of countering a hybrid attack.\(^1^8\) For example, while it is conceivable that Russia may attempt a hybrid operation in Estonia, it is hard to imagine Estonia offensively using hybrid tactics against Russia, even if the non-military aspects aligned. The disparity in conventional armed forces is too great for such an operation to succeed.

Lastly, it is unclear how effective propaganda campaigns are in persuading foreign populations. The Pew Research Center recently released a study showing that Eastern and Western Ukraine had very different opinions on Russia, Western Powers, and how to resolve the situation in the Donbas region. Overall, respondents from Eastern Ukraine were significantly pro-Russia while Western Ukraine was more oriented towards a Western European viewpoint. Both Eastern and Western Ukraine had a low opinion of Vladimir Putin. However, it is unclear if these differences in perception and opinion were due to the effects of propaganda and the media or because of pre-existing inclinations. What is notable is that the survey showed that Europe had a largely negative view of Russia vis-à-vis Ukraine, despite recent Russian attempts to get more involved in European media and news outlets.\(^1^9\)

---

\(^1^8\) Johnson. “Russia’s Approach to Conflict -- Implications for NATO's Deterrence and Defense,” 10

Russia’s use of deceptive tactics and its ability to sow distrust in state institutions has proven effective at quickly subduing a target population with relatively minimal fighting, allowing for a swift annexation. However, the Gerasimov Doctrine calls for a very specific and conducive environment in order for these tactics to be truly effective. This limits the geographic areas realistically threatened by hybrid operation and allows NATO and individual member states to focus their defenses at their most vulnerable points.

**Estonia’s Role in Defense**

While hybrid warfare does not guarantee victory for the attacker, defending states should still bolster their capabilities. Hybrid war’s ambiguous early phases and quick escalation means that individual member states are their own first line of defense. This is perhaps especially true for Estonia, a state that has a recent history of being on the receiving end of Russian aggression and is now a prime target for further hybrid action.

Estonia is a likely location for a full hybrid attack in no small part due to its large minority population. Estonia was once part of the Soviet Union and roughly 25% of its population is ethnically Russian. This means both that there is potentially a population sympathetic to Russian disinformation and that Russia could use the population as a *casus belli* under the Responsibility to Protect doctrine, regardless of the ethnic group’s actual ideological leanings.²⁰

---

Russia has also repeatedly interfered in Estonia over the past several years. In 2007, the Estonian government was experienced a massive cyber-attack. The attack came after a riot, comprised mainly of the Russian minority population, erupted in Tallinn over the government’s plans to remove the “Bronze Soldier” Soviet war memorial. Russia was never conclusively proven to be the aggressor. In 2014, an Estonian intelligence official was abducted while still in Estonia. He was then taken across the border into Russia and accused of espionage.21

These incidents and vulnerabilities have caused Estonia to adopt a defensive posture. Estonia is the only Baltic country, and one of the few NATO members, that spends as much as two percent of its annual GDP on defense. While the Estonian military is not very large, the professional army is supplemented by a voluntary Territorial Defense Force (TDF)22 and citizens who spend 8-11 months in conscripted service.23 Estonia’s TDF units are currently in the process of being modernized, in terms of equipment and technical expertise, though this will likely be a time-consuming process.24

Estonia’s infrastructure has already proven to be vulnerable to hybrid tactics, its borders can be infiltrated by Russian agents, and it has a large ethnic Russian population likely used by Russia as a means to pressure Tallinn. Ethnic minorities in Estonia often have a general sense of social and political disenfranchisement and have disagreements with the government over the use of the Russian language.25 NATO, as

---

22 Szymanksi. "The Baltic states' territorial defence forces in the face of hybrid threats."
24 Szymanksi. "The Baltic states' territorial defence forces in the face of hybrid threats."
an organization, is poorly equipped to deal with domestic instability, which means that Estonia must address these issues domestically.

Accordingly, Estonia should position the TDF as a paramilitary organization situated between standard police and conventional military forces in terms of capabilities. Currently, Estonia’s TDF has an analogous role to the United States’ National Guard. They are light forces regionally organized to patrol the border, conduct search and rescue operations, assist emergency services, and act as a reserve force during wartime. They can also be used to maintain order in the event of large-scale riots or national disasters and act as a quick reaction force against conventional threats.26

The Estonian government is already moving in this direction. The TDF is currently being trained to have faster reaction times and use weapons similar to the regular army. These reforms would make them more effective against conventional threats. The TDF role in peacetime crisis management also makes it an ideal tool for responding to tense, but controllable situations. The regional organization of TDF units gives each a degree of familiarity with the regions they serve. They are therefore more likely to be trusted by the local population.27 Accordingly, it would be useful to ensure that TDFs are trained in peaceful crowd management and de-escalation techniques in order to prevent tumultuous situations from spiraling out of control.

Tallinn is also advised to disaggregate the identity of ethnic Russians into their sub-national identities. Ethnic Russians should be treated and encouraged to think of themselves as not

26 Szymanksi. "The Baltic states' territorial defence forces in the face of hybrid threats."
27 Szymanksi. "The Baltic states' territorial defence forces in the face of hybrid threats."
Russian, but instead as Kazakh, Avar, Tartar, etc.\textsuperscript{28} Israel has successfully used this to ease tensions with its large Arab minority and prevent other outside forces from coopting the Arab population. Disaggregation can be accomplished through government publications, census questionnaires, educational scholarships for disaggregated minorities, and other programs that celebrate sub-national cultures. Ethnic Russians are likely to find Russian overtures less appealing if they do not see themselves as ethnically Russian.\textsuperscript{29}

Simultaneously, the government will need to remain in contact with the Russian minority, despite a historical degree of mutual distrust.\textsuperscript{30} In the short-term, Tallinn should keep its lines of communication with vulnerable populations open to make Russian exploitation more difficult. This could be accomplished through more civic engagement and more collaboration and contact between central and local governments. In the long-term, the government should work towards greater social and political integration with the minority populations.

As with any analysis, further research could alter the above recommendations and offer stronger conclusions. There is little concrete information available on ethnic Russian participation in the Estonian police, defense forces, or government. Similarly, there seems to be scarce data available, in English, on quantitative trends on social and political integration or on how ethnic Russians view their government. Such information would help determine both the progress of integration for its

\textsuperscript{29} Daniel Byman. "Co-optation," in Keeping the Peace: Lasting Solutions to Ethnic Conflicts. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002), 81-84.
\textsuperscript{30} Hyndle-Hussein. "The Baltic states on the conflict in Ukraine."
own sake and how susceptible Estonia’s minority populations are to being coopted. It would also point to what the Estonian government can do to build more trust with its own population.

Abroad, Estonia should cooperate with the other Baltic States, outside of NATO, to jointly counter Russian propaganda. There is currently no Russian language television station, outside of Russia, that covers all three Baltic States. This gives Russia a great deal of control over an area where television is still widely used.31 Radio stations are similarly valuable in countering propaganda and present another opportunity for cooperation.

The Baltic States can also divide the labor by specializing in different aspects of countering hybrid warfare. To their credit, several already have established several “Centres of Excellence” under NATO auspices. Latvia operates the Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence and Lithuania maintains the Energy Centre of Excellence. Perhaps appropriately, Estonia has opened the Cyber Defense Centre of Excellence.32 As with radio and television stations, these are resources that can be shared and benefit the whole region.

NATO’s Role

NATO’s primary role in countering hybrid warfare will be to develop a strong conventional military deterrent. The force must be strong enough to credibly resist a conventional assault that typically ends a hybrid operation. Additionally, it also must be mobile and flexible enough to be quickly deployable to any

potential hotspot.\textsuperscript{33} NATO and the United States have already taken some steps towards this by pre-positioning heavy equipment in Eastern Europe. \textsuperscript{34} While pre-positioned equipment is not a replacement for a mobile force, it does allow for faster deployments and demonstrates NATO’s commitment to defending its Eastern Europe members.

Some scholars \textsuperscript{35} believe that conventional military deterrence against Russia should go even further and include more nuclear elements. Russia has frequently used its nuclear arsenal as a means to “de-escalate” a conflict and gain concessions over other states that lack nuclear weapons. \textsuperscript{36} NATO heightening its nuclear posture could give the alliance an edge in achieving escalation dominance and make de-escalation a less effective tactic. However, it is not an effective answer to hybrid tactics as a whole. This is because Russian hybrid doctrine relies on ambiguity and only escalating when gains can be made and consolidated quickly. It also does not directly address the fifth column threat that Russia poses to Estonia. As a whole, this makes nuclear deterrence an inappropriate response to hybrid warfare. It is disproportionate during the early phases of hybrid warfare and too unwieldy during later phases that occur after the gains have already been made.

Certainly, NATO’s military deterrent is only effective if both members and potential enemies believe that the alliance is effective.

\textsuperscript{33} Lindley-French. "NATO and New Ways of Warfare: Defeating Hybrid Threats," 5, 8-10.
\textsuperscript{35} Dr. Lindley-French is a Fellow at the Canadian Defence and Foreign Affairs Institute, a Senior Fellow at the Institute of Statecraft, and a Distinguished Visiting Research Fellow at National Defense University.
\textsuperscript{36} Lindley-French. "NATO and New Ways of Warfare: Defeating Hybrid Threats," 2
able and willing to respond to aggression. The intentional ambiguity behind the Gerasimov Doctrine makes attributing an attack and forming an apt political-military response difficult, which casts doubt on NATO’s assurances. In response, some have argued that NATO should give local commanders the authority to make decisions on when to engage their forces in reaction to a perceived attack. While allowing local commanders to make snap judgments would shorten the response time to crises, it also risks sending the alliance to war or escalating a conflict due to misinformation and the forces of friction.

Rather, NATO should redefine Article V to clarify that the escalatory tactics used in hybrid warfare would trigger a response from NATO. This response could include armed retaliation, or other measures short of war, if an aggressor escalates to the point of infringing and violating member states’ sovereignty through physical, kinetic, cyber, or other means. Though a redefinition would not solve attribution difficulties, it would send a message to NATO members and potential enemies and force the alliance to reconsider what aspects of sovereignty it wants to defend and how.

NATO will need to build effective intelligence structures if it intends to properly react to hybrid aggression and forestall an invasion. A stronger intelligence apparatus can also have a useful secondary purpose in directly countering Russian propaganda being projected into member states. NATO would

---

37 Janis Berzins is the Director of The Center for Security and Strategic Research, National Defence Academy of Latvia.
need to make the declassification process easier\textsuperscript{40} in order to properly demonstrate the existence of little green men, who are clandestine Russian soldiers operating in a warzone. Ultimately, it would go a long way towards gaining early control of the narrative campaign. Furthermore, this information could be shared with local law enforcement agencies to respond to or even prevent Russia from inciting or taking advantage of a situation as possible justification for a \textit{casus belli}.

NATO’s status as a major international organization could allow it to coordinate with other political institutions, such as the European Union (EU), on a comprehensive response to hybrid warfare’s non-military aspects. NATO can act a meeting ground for alliance members to vet non-military security concerns that can then be addressed in other bodies. Where military action might be inappropriate, NATO could coordinate with the EU to enforce sanctions and identify alternative energy sources for those countries dependent on Russian natural gas. The fact that many states are members of both the EU and NATO would make the process of facilitating such conversations straightforward.\textsuperscript{41}

**The United States’ Role**

The United States’ capabilities and political sway give it a special a role in both NATO and Estonia’s defense. First and foremost, the United States can take a greater leadership role in NATO. A recent study by the Pew Research Center shows that

\textsuperscript{40} Lindley-French. "NATO and New Ways of Warfare: Defeating Hybrid Threats,” 8-12.

many Europeans believe that the United States would honor its NATO commitments but that they were uneven in support of committing their own states’ resources. The United States can try to persuade other alliance members towards meeting their defense spending commitments. More than that, the United States can push the alliance towards a greater state of readiness by holding joint exercises designed to test and strengthen the alliance’s rapid reaction and deployment capabilities that would prove key in countering a hybrid attack.

NATO has a particular interest in learning how to properly counter hybrid warfare, as Russia is not its only practitioner or the sole threat to European collective security. ISIL has employed variations of hybrid tactics throughout the Middle East and North Africa, using a combination of insurgency tactics, conventional military formations, and a very strong propaganda campaign. Furthermore, ISIL’s wars have caused great regional instability and a refugee crisis for Europe. ISIL’s hybrid threat means that many NATO members have a stake in adopting counter-hybrid tactics.

More specifically, the United States can use the State Partnership Program (SPP) to bolster Estonia’s TDFs. The SPP links US National Guard training with with elements of the host nation’s military forces in areas including border security, anti-narcotics operations, disaster relief and humanitarian response, and responding to civil disorder. Estonia was an early partner in the SPP and is currently assigned a unit of Maryland’s National Guard.

---

42 Simmons, Stokes, and Poushter. "NATO Publics Blame Russia for Ukrainian Crisis, but Reluctant to Provide Military Aid," 5-9.
43 Lindley-French. "NATO and New Ways of Warfare: Defeating Hybrid Threats,” 4-7, 9.
professionalize the host state’s non-commissioned officers and can share technical expertise.45

Many of the skills developed through the SPP are those that would likely be very useful in a hybrid conflict. While security forces clearly have a place in defending the homeland against a conventional threat, the state may also need them to contain and de-escalate riots and seal national borders. Estonia is especially likely to find expanding the SPP and its security capabilities appealing given that Tallinn is trying to modernize local TDFs, especially with regard to military equipment and improved cyber capabilities.46

While anecdotal evidence suggests that the SPPs are very popular with both host nations and US regional combatant commanders, there are currently no good metrics for determining how effectively they accomplish their objectives. Better reporting and assessment methods could make a popular program even better and reveal further cooperation and training opportunities. The program could also use some improvements in its funding mechanism, which currently comes from both the National Guard Bureau and the combatant commands. These challenges include obtaining special orders, pay, and allowances for the National Guard soldiers. SPP stakeholders have also indicated that they have great difficulty affording and leading exercises with civilian participants, even though such engagements are widely seen as being very valuable.47 Lastly, it

46 Szymanksi. "The Baltic states' territorial defence forces in the face of hybrid threats."
may be beneficial for the United States to expand the activities that SPP covers to more explicitly prepare for hybrid warfare.

SPP is already seen as an effective peer-to-peer program between the United States and its partners. Expanding the areas of training and having effective assessments will only improve the program’s quality. Securing the necessary resources and streamlining funding process for recipient states will ensure that the program’s livelihood continues for years to come.

**Conclusion**

Many of the issues hybrid warfare presents can be discerned through available data. Russia’s incorporation of hybrid warfare into official doctrine means that Estonia, the United States, and NATO must adjust their defense plans and coordination efforts accordingly. Estonia is the only state that can address the domestic issues that make it vulnerable to Russian interference and invasion. The large Russian population must be socially integrated in order to both improve Estonian society and defend the state’s political integrity. Militarily, Estonia can continue improving its Territorial Defense Force and national cyber defense capabilities. The United States can assist in this by expanding and improving the State Partnership Program while securing the funding process to ensure that joint training exercises continue.

While Estonia is its own first line of defense, NATO will continue to have a political role in guaranteeing its security. Amending Article V to recognize and account for hybrid warfare will align NATO against this threat and clarify its protocol in the event of aggressive action. Preparing a rapid reaction force will establish a credible conventional deterrent that may change an aggressor’s calculations and alter the balance of forces during a confrontation. NATO can also help
states address non-military security concerns by cooperating with other international organizations, such as the European Union, in multilateral diplomacy.

Hybrid warfare certainly presents Estonia and NATO with a unique set of challenges compared to conventional warfare. However, they, as defenders, have multiple opportunities to forestall attacks and mitigate escalation by promoting internal political stability, good relations with possible disenfranchised populations, and maintaining a credible conventional deterrent.

Matthew Mullarky graduated from Macalester College in 2012 with degrees in Political Science and Philosophy. He researched and wrote about economic and energy issues for the Minnesota House of Representatives until 2014. He will graduate from Georgetown’s Security Studies Program in the spring of 2016.
State-Regulated Islam and its Internal Security Implications for China’s Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region

Zi Yang

Adherence to Islam is the primary identity of Xinjiang’s Turkic-speaking Muslims, yet its popularity is also a source of concern for China as led by the Communist Party. This paper examines how the state regulates Islam in Xinjiang and why it continues to maintain a strict control of Islamic affairs in the Autonomous Region even when this form of regulation antagonizes the Muslim population—the 10.7 million strong Uyghurs in particular—and exacerbates the security environment.

Nowhere in China has governance been more difficult than Xinjiang. Unlike provinces of China proper, Xinjiang is a complex region built upon a mishmash of ethnic, linguistic, and religious identities that demand meticulous administration on the state’s behalf. Distinct models of governance were experimented by the Qing and Republican governments until November 1949 when the region was brought into the People’s Republic of China that instituted a Leninist system.¹ Officially atheist, the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) views the largely Muslim Xinjiang as especially unreceptive to the state’s religious policies. Islam, which is followed by more than half

¹ The Qing preferred a hands-off approach regarding the minorities of Xinjiang, allowing their traditional leaders a large degree of autonomy in governance. The Republican governor Jin Shuren, however, was actively engaged in minority politics.
of Xinjiang’s 22 million inhabitants, is valued as the primary identity by the Turkic-speaking Muslims. Grievances over state religious control have previously been used as a tool to mobilize people for protests and even armed insurrections. It is then necessary to ask, how does the Chinese state regulate Islam in Xinjiang? Moreover, why does the state continue to maintain a strict control of Islamic affairs in Xinjiang even when this form of regulation antagonizes the Muslim population – the 10.7 million strong Uyghurs in particular – and exacerbates the security environment? Although current policies run counter to the overarching security objective dedicated to keeping stability, the entrenched status of the religious control system, ideological constraints, and the Party leadership’s confidence in the effectiveness of the religious regulatory agencies all contribute to the state’s lack of political will in considering reform.

The Muslims of Xinjiang

The 10th century marked the initial arrival of Islam in the region now known as Xinjiang, but it took more than 700 years before Islam became the predominant faith among settlers of oasis towns and nomads of the steppe. Today, four out of five of Xinjiang’s largest ethnic groups follow Islam. The 10.7 million Uyghurs, 1.5 million Kazakhs, 1 million Hui, and 198,000 Kyrgyz are Sunni, while a majority of the 50,000 Tajiks follow

---


3 Xinjiang weiwuer zizhiqu tongjiju 新疆维吾尔自治区统计局, “Zhuyao nianfen fen minzu renkou shu” 主要年份分民族人口数 [Ethnic Population by Year], *Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region Statistical Bureau Online*, June 23, 2015, accessed August 26, 2015,
the Ismaili branch of Shi’a Islam. Linguistically, the Uyghur, Kazakh and Kyrgyz speak Turkic languages that are mutually intelligible. The Hui however, speak Chinese like the 8.6 million Han residents of the region.

The Uyghurs, given their history of recalcitrant relations vis-à-vis the state, will be the focus of this paper. Pious by tradition, practicing Islam is an integral part of Uyghur identity. Almost all milestones in Uyghur life are celebrated according to Islamic customs. The first words read to a newborn is usually a verse from the Quran, and the last words an Uyghur person hears before departing from this world would also be from the Muslim holy book.

Even after decades of socialist education, most Uyghurs have a surprisingly fair grounding in the basics of Islam. A recent study shows that 96 percent of Uyghur survey participants know that the birthplace of Islam is located on the Arabian Peninsula. 97.7 percent know the correct numbers of prayers per day, and 78 percent understand the meaning behind the hajj, or the pilgrimage to Mecca. Although lacking in terms of theoretical knowledge – only 24.9 percent provided correct

4 Cai Jiangfan 蔡江帆, “Woguo Tajikezu xinyang de duoyuan gongrong yu hexie gongsheng tedian” 我国塔吉克族信仰的多元共融与和谐共生特点 [The Diverse and Harmonious Beliefs of Our Country’s Tajiks], Journal of Northwest University for Nationalities (Philosophy and Social Science) 4 (2014), 124.


answers relating to predestination, and 59 percent know the relationship between the Prophet Muhammad and Allah – Uyghurs surveyed uniformly expressed a sense of happiness and security when asked to identify the practice of Islam with a particular feeling. In a country developing as rapidly as China, Uyghurs find Islam a source of comfort and an aegis against the frustrations of modern life.

Though the majority of Uyghurs appreciate Islam as a positive and indispensible component of life, the state has a different perception. While Islam can provide psychological comfort to a believer, it can also rally popular resentment against the state. In fact, the modern history of Xinjiang is dotted with demonstrations and uprisings under the banner of Islam. The rebellious attitude of the Uyghurs is partly due to a strong sense of nationalism derived from an Islamic identity that distinguishes themselves from the majority Han who dominate Xinjiang’s politics and by extension its future. Thus, it is not surprising the state’s main security effort is concerned with monitoring and regulating Uyghur life through Islam, which plays an essential role in shaping Uyghur behavior.

Regulating Physical Spaces

The key characteristic of a Leninist state is its ability to penetrate down to the lowest level of society. The presence of agents in all societal echelons allows the state power to control not just physical spaces, but also to regulate thoughts and ideas.

---

6 Ibid, 2-4.
7 Demonstrations and uprisings with distinct religious characteristics include the Hotan Incident of 1954, the Kashgar Incident of 1981, the Baren Incident of 1990, and the Aksu Incident of 1996. See also: Michael Dillion, Xinjiang – China’s Muslim Far Northwest (London; New York: Routledge, 2003), 53, 59, 63, 70.
The mosque is the state’s primary physical target in regulating Islam. The center of Uyghur communities, the mosque is the spiritual refuge where celebrations of faith take place. Mosques in Xinjiang may be grouped into four categories, with each serving its own purpose: the *Id Kah* (holiday) mosque is usually the largest in town and has a specific function for Eid celebrations; *Juma* (assembly) mosques are also large mosques used for Friday prayers; *Mazar* (mausoleum) mosques are built next to tombs of Sufi saints and provide a place of worship for pilgrims; and the small but numerous neighborhood (*shuma*) mosques serve the religious needs of Uyghur neighborhoods.8

Far from operating independently, Xinjiang’s mosques are guardedly managed by the state through a network of Islamic Associations. Founded in May 1953, the China Islamic Association is the only legal organization representing Muslims of China. Although not officially part of the state religious regulatory apparatus, the Islamic Association assists the state in all matters of Islamic affairs.9 Modeled on the CCP, the Islamic Association is hierarchically organized with sub-divisions and liaison groups down to the village-level.10 A Mosque Administrative Committee (MAC) manages each of Xinjiang’s

8 Aziquli Upur 阿孜古丽·吾甫尔, “Qingzhensi zai Weiwuerzu shehui shenghuo zhong de zuoyong” 清真寺在维吾尔族社会生活中的作用 [The Role of Mosques in Uyghur Social Life], *China Muslim* 3 (2009), 37-38.
22,945 mosques. In almost all cases the MAC is headed by a pro-government cleric approved by the local Islamic Association. Like a party cell without the official title, MACs are responsible for anything that happens within a mosque’s perimeter. All religious activities must be carefully designed according to state policies, and anything else besides everyday religious functions – be it the publication of religious writings or hosting “large scale events” – must be approved first by the local Islamic Association and religious affairs bureau.

Respected by Uyghurs as pure men who do good deeds, Islamic clerics are the leaders of their community. At present, there are 29,617 imams in Xinjiang. Besides teaching Islamic virtues and performing various rites, clerics may also serve as grassroots level communicators of the state’s messages. The

---

11 In 2009, approximately 24,300 mosques were counted in Xinjiang. See also: Wu Yungui 吴云贵, Zhou Xiefan 周燮藩, Yang Fuxue 杨富学 and Zheng Xiaoyun 郑筱筠, “Ruhe renshi he lijie Xinjiang zongjiao” 如何认识和理解新疆宗教 [How to Familiarize and Understand the Religions of Xinjiang], The World Religious Cultures 4 (2014), 51; Xu Shuchun 徐树春, “Xinjiang Weiwuerzu qingzhensi” 新疆维吾尔族清真寺 [The Mosques of the Uyghur People], Tourism Overview 1 (2014), 63.


13 “Large scale event” is a blanket term that may include religious events of any size, be it holiday celebrations or Quran study sessions. There have been reports of government informants in mosques monitoring the actions of imams and the congregation. See also: “Official Repression of Religion Continues in Xinjiang,” Congressional-Executive Commission on China, July 12, 2011, accessed August 26, 2015, http://www.cecc.gov/publications/commission-analysis/official-repression-of-religion-continues-in-xinjiang.


selection of imams is a strictly controlled process. In some instances the Islamic Association can directly appoint imams. Otherwise, a potential must first have a recommendation from his local MAC and go through a rigorous background check prior to being officially recognized as an imam.\textsuperscript{16} As informal employees of the state, imams receive a monthly stipend, but the meager subsidy (150-200 Yuan or $23-31) forces a good number of clerics into commerce to keep their mosque financially afloat. Although the state’s budget constraints may be an explanation for the low pay, it is also possible that this is a stratagem designed to reduce the clerics’ engagement in religious activities aside from the basics so they can be easily managed.\textsuperscript{17}

Having “patriotic” credentials, in other words being supportive of the Party and its policies, is a requirement for anyone who wishes to become an imam. Elderly imams who have not been filtered through the state-run education system must attend political study sessions to learn about the Party’s policies. As a result, Xinjiang imams are well informed in political matters, but may be lacking in theological knowledge. Curiously, even with mandatory political indoctrination, 34.6 percent of 182 Islamic clerics surveyed in 2009 are of the opinion that believers of Allah cannot submit to the leadership

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{17} Li Xiaoxia 李晓霞, “Xinjiang zongjiao shiwu guanli zhengce fenxi–jiaozhi renyuan shenghuo butie zhidu” 新疆宗教事务管理政策分析–教职人员生活补贴制度 [An Analysis of Religious Regulation Policies in Xinjiang–Living Subsidy for Clerics], Sociology of Ethnicity 117 (2012), 14-15.
\end{itemize}
of the Party, 70.3 percent believe that it is justified to seize political power via Jihad and exterminate infidels in the process, and 40.1 percent hold the belief that the only type of legal government is one established upon the Quran and Hadith.\(^{18}\) Thus, the effectiveness of “transforming” clerics through political indoctrination should be called into question since such policies might actually be enhancing a conservative, even a fundamentalist religious identity.

It is no secret that Chinese law discourages people from religion, given the Party’s atheist outlook predicated upon its absolute adherence to Marxist dialectical materialism. Nevertheless, a few Islamic theology institutes are allowed in Xinjiang, though they are subjected to strict supervision. The Xinjiang Islamic Theology Institute (XITI) is the only institute of higher education in China that teaches in the Uyghur language. The XITI operates under the supervision of the Xinjiang Ethnic Affairs Commission (XEAC) and trains its students in the Hanafi school of jurisprudence. Aside from theology,\(^{19}\) students of XITI must take classes on “patriotic education,” which inculcates the official view on Xinjiang’s

\(^{18}\) Ren Hong 任红, “Xinjiang yisilanjiao jiaozhi renyuan xianzhuang diaocha yu yanjiu” 新疆伊斯兰教教职人员现状调查与研究 [An Investigative Study of the Current Conditions of Xinjiang’s Islamic Clerics], *Social Sciences in Xinjiang* 4 (2009), 62.

\(^{19}\) The following courses are offered at XITI: Mandarin Chinese, Arabic, Uyghur literature, politics, geography, history, basic IT, basic sports, *tajweed* (proper recitation of the Quran), rules of *tajweed*, interpreting the Quran, principles on interpreting the Quran, principles of Hadith studies, interpreting the Hadith, sharia law, principles of the sharia law, the life of Muhammad, *tawheed* (Islamic monotheism) studies, Islamic culture, and new *wa’z* (sermon) methods. See also: “Xinjiang yisilan jiaojing xueyuan qingkuang jianjie” 新疆伊斯兰教经学院情况简介 [A Brief Introduction of the Xinjiang Islamic Theology Institute], *Xinjiang Ethnic Affairs Commission Online*, February 20, 2013, accessed August 26, 2015, http://www.xjmzw.gov.cn/zjyj/yljjhy/xyjs/898.htm.
past and present. Since ageing is a serious issue among Uyghur clerics, the state takes great care in grooming a pro-government younger generation, and XITI graduates are guaranteed a position among their own ethnic group’s clerical class. In addition to higher learning, there are five mid-level theology institutes located in Kashgar, Hotan, Aksu, Kizilsu, and Ili, but there is limited information available to the public on how these schools function, though the state almost surely has a role in setting the agenda.

Despite recent academic publications that have shown that an overwhelming number of Uyghur parents prefer educating their children with Islamic values, the state imposes a strict ban on scripture schools or classes for anyone not yet an adult. According to Armijo, the state takes great precaution in ensuring that “children are not exposed to religious teaching or

---

20 Kamardin Ahmeti 卡马尔丁·艾合买提, “Xinjiang yisilan jiaojing xueyuan buduan wanshan jiaoxue guanli zhidu” 新疆伊斯兰教经学院不断完善教学管理制度 [Xinjiang Islamic Theology Institute Continues to Improve its Educational and Administrative Institutions], *China Religion* 4 (2014), 64-65.


22 By the year 2013, XITI has graduated 635 students of Uyghur, Kazakh, Kyrgyz, Uzbek and Tatar background. See also: Ahmeti, 64.


24 Yao, Dawooti and Zhou, 4.
practices.”²⁵ Yet the high demand and the lack of supply due to the state’s ban have engendered a black market of religious education in the form of underground scripture schools and short-term Quran classes. There have been periodic police raids on scripture schools and local media have run exposés on the austere condition of these schools.²⁶ But there has yet to be a slowdown in terms of demand and Chinese research on this subject has concluded that the “struggle” against underground scripture schools is going to take years if not longer.²⁷

Regulating Thoughts and Ideas

The state’s control of Islamic affairs goes beyond the realm of physical spaces and extends deep into the ideational sphere. The XEAC plays a crucial role here. Doubling as the Xinjiang Religious Affairs Bureau,²⁸ the XEAC is formally a state organ (unlike the Islamic Association) that administers ethnic and

²⁵ Jackie Armijo, “Muslim Education in China,” in The Madrasa in Asia: Political Activism and Transnational Linkages, ed. Noor A. Farish, Yoginder Sikand, and Martin van Bruinessen (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2008), 186.
²⁸ “One institution, two signboards” or yigejigou liangkuai’paizi, is a way of organizing the bureaucracy in China. Two institutions with dissimilar yet comparable functions, in this case the Xinjiang Ethnic Affairs Commission and the provincial Religious Affairs Bureau, would be combined into one organ that issues orders according to the circumstance.
religious issues in tandem with Islamic Associations. The XEAC is a vast bureaucracy that controls almost all matters pertaining to Islam, whether it is the issuing of halal licenses or the organization of hajj groups. Following the CCP tradition of using censorship for thought control, the XEAC’s Editorial Office for Ethnic and Religious Publications screens manuscripts in all languages relating to ethnic and religious subjects to ensure that only the official narrative goes to press. Gazetteers and almanacs of Xinjiang’s localities are also under the Editorial Office’s close scrutiny to guarantee that even the last detail of local history touts the party line.

While censoring new publications is important, remaking the past to fit the contemporary narrative is of analogous value. The Office for Managing Antiquarian Books (OMAB) collects, stores, edits, and publishes ancient texts written by and for ethnic minorities. The OMAB is said to have around 1,500 ancient manuscripts in possession, though this is likely an erroneous figure since the OMAB collected 845 volumes of old books in the first eight months of 2013 alone. Although the official mission statement of the OMAB declares that its work

29 Going on the hajj individually or in groups without official approval is not allowed under Chinese law because the state fears the individual might return – if at all – with extremist ideas. In addition, state organized hajj creates an incentive system for Muslims to conform to current policies, because only the most “patriotic” ones will be selected to complete one of the five pillars of Islam.


is dedicated to ‘salvaging’ ancient texts, sculpting the past becomes much less difficult when the state takes control of the primary sources.

Since most Uyghurs do not understand Arabic, let alone Quranic Arabic, the interpretation of the meanings of sacred texts is another significant task in shaping the Uyghur masses’ worldview. The Xinjiang Islamic Association handles this matter by interpreting Islamic holy books in the ‘correct’ way, i.e. promoting passages that advocate unity and peace among mankind as opposed to the verses commanding Muslims to commit violent acts against unbelievers and apostates.\textsuperscript{33}

The interpretation of Islamic holy books is now a part of a new counter-narrative created by the state to push against fundamentalist ideas in Xinjiang. Known as the “Islamic Dao of the Mean (\textit{yisilan zhongdao sixiang}),” this new idea is a mix of Islamic and Confucian principles that calls for moderation in religious life. According to an official document released by the China Islamic Association, the Islamic Dao of the Mean has four basic principles that encourage moderation in religious practice, spiritual cultivation and behavior towards others, in addition to using verses of the Quran and Hadith to counter extremism.\textsuperscript{34}


The Current State of Islam in Xinjiang

Despite the extensive regulation of religion, Uyghur interest in Islamic thoughts outside of state endorsement is actually rising. In southern Xinjiang, where Uyghurs constitute the majority, Islam holds sway over everyday life and religious conservatism is making a comeback as a form of nativist protest against an overbearing state. Men wearing large beards and women donning the *niqab* (or the full-body veil) are common sights on the streets of the south. Authorities have enacted a new law banning large beards and the *niqab* in public spaces, but fully enforcing such law is almost impossible given the sheer scale of this conservative practice.

Besides the outward expression of religiosity through clothing and long beards, fundamentalist ideas are also becoming popular, especially among the young. Referred by locals as ‘Wahhabi’ because of their tendency to favor Saudi customs and a literal interpretation of Islam, Uyghur scripturalists are challenging the official narrative promoted by

---

35 Muslims make up over 90 percent of southern Xinjiang’s population. See also: Wu, Zhou, Yang and Zheng, 52.
37 For Uyghur women, veiling is also the result of social pressure from their chauvinistic male counterpart. In the city of Hotan for example, Uyghur women who go to the bazaar without any type of head covering risk having stones thrown at them. See also: Rachel Harris, “Harmonizing Islam in Xinjiang: Sound and meaning in rural Uyghur religious practice,” in *On the Fringes of the Harmonious Society: Tibetans and Uyghurs in Socialist China*, ed. Trine Brox and Ildikó Bellér-Hann (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 2014), 303-304.
39 Brox and Bellér-Hann, 304.
pro-government clerics. Calling themselves *sunnatchi* or “those who follow the practice of the Prophet Muhammad,” they act according to the Quran and Hadith only. The *sunnatchi*’s religiosity is not confined to their personal lives. Propagation of orthodox ideas and enforcement of Islamic duties – regular mosque attendance for example – have been carried out by *sunnatchi* against libertines of the Uyghur community. Attempts to regulate trade according to scripturalist standards have occurred as well, as there have even been cases where Coca-Cola vendors were criticized for selling a *haram* (forbidden by Islam) product.

Like all other Islamist movements, the *sunnatchi* tried to garner popular support by attacking a controversial established institution, in this case the practice of *nazir*, the traditional Uyghur feast to commemorate the dead. Viewed as a meritorious deed by some Uyghurs, *nazir* is nevertheless perceived by others as unnecessarily extravagant. The *sunnatchi* joined the debate on the side of the latter. Citing the lack of precedent in Islamic holy books, they criticized people who organize *nazir* as “ignorant” and “backward.” Other traditional practices, such as *barat* or praying for the deceased, as well as pilgrimage to burial sites of Sufi saints have also came under *sunnatchi* flak. This is a troubling development for the state that seeks to maintain social stability, and its

---

41 Ibid, 172.
42 Ibid, 176.
43 Ibid, 177.
relations with the traditional, pro-government Uyghur clerics would likely be strengthened.

The rise of fundamentalist ideas as well as the continued stern control of Islam by the state is one of the reasons behind why a growing number of Uyghurs are refusing to follow government-mandated religious regulations.\(^{44}\) There has been evidence where Uyghurs, mostly young, have been reluctant to pray at mosques except on Fridays because they view the imams as “traitors.”\(^{45}\) There have also been documented clashes between pro-government imams and mosque attendees over if one should follow officially set prayer times.\(^{46}\)

**Why Not Reform?**

Individuals tend to react negatively towards policies that intrude upon personal liberty, especially when it comes to the issue of faith. For a people as religious as the Uyghurs, regulating Islam to its very last detail has certainly alienated sections of the population. As a matter of fact, strict control of Islam is indirectly contributing to its popularity among Uyghurs and making people more receptive to fundamentalist ideas. So why hasn’t the state considered options to loosen control and allow greater religious freedom?

The lack of political will is the most concise answer. China’s religious control apparatus is a national system. The State Ethnic Affairs Commission and the State Administration of Religious Affairs give orders to subordinate organs in every

---

\(^{44}\) Jay Dautcher, *Down a Narrow Road: Identity and Masculinity in a Uyghur Community in a Uyghur Community in Xinjiang China*, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Asia Center, 2009), 262-263.

\(^{45}\) Li, 19.

\(^{46}\) Bellér-Hann, Cesàro, Harris and Finley, 172.
province, autonomous region, and direct-controlled municipality to enforce state policies. To make changes in one autonomous region means the whole system will be destabilized, an unattractive notion to China’s leaders who firmly adhere to the Dengist dictum of ‘stability trumps everything.’ Another reason is that the state’s actions are still guided by atheism. The belief in using state power to gradually reduce grounds held by religious authority is still prevalent among party notables who perceive the loosening of religious control as appeasing forces inherently anti-socialist.

The realists of the Party, led by General Secretary Xi Jinping, also support the maintenance of the current policies rather than reform because change brings uncertainty. Given the volatile condition in Xinjiang, venturing into the unknown is not an option favored by many. The national level of support for the current religious policies in Xinjiang is strong and there appears to be no division among politburo members regarding this question. The country’s top leaders have repeatedly expressed confidence in the current system’s ability to efficiently regulate religious matters and assist in wearing out

48 Zhang Xiuming 张秀明, “Xinjiang fanfenlie douzheng he wending gongzuo de shijian yu sikao” 新疆反分裂斗争和稳定工作的实践与思考 [Implementation and Thoughts on Anti-Separatism and Maintain Stability Work in Xinjiang], (Urumqi: Xinjiang renmin chubanshe, 2009), 129, 227.
extremist elements.\textsuperscript{50} At the second central Xinjiang working conference in May 2014, Xi Jinping voiced support of religious policies in the region by affirming the need to “give great attention to cultivating patriotic clerics… and make certain that the leadership of religious organizations is in the firm grip of the patriotic and faithful.”\textsuperscript{51}

Conclusion

Governing a region as complex as Xinjiang demands deft and political finesse. Ethnicity, language, and especially religion all play a role in complicating the already restive situation. Although Xinjiang has been developing fairly well economically in recent years, China’s “growth-first” model is far from the panacea to the “Xinjiang problem” as many believe. The resurgence of religiosity, in particular a fundamentalist school under the current religious regulatory system is a testament to the need to review the state’s relationship with Islam and analyze the degree of positive

influence current policies have in the religious sphere. In the end, taking a tough stance against violence and terrorism does not mean one has to alienate liberals, moderates, conservatives or even peaceful scripturalists by imposing heavy restrictions on how people honor the principal tenets of Islam. When it comes to internal security, there are always multiple solutions to a conundrum, and all options should be on the table.

Appendix
Zi Yang is a graduate student at Georgetown University School of Foreign Service Asian Studies Program. He currently serves as a research assistant at Georgetown University’s Center for Security Studies.
Behind Electromagnetic Railgun: Redefining the Future Cost Calculus of Surface Warfare

Rhys McCormick

Currently in development, the electromagnetic railgun tops many lists of future ‘game changing’ technologies. At an estimated $25,000 per shot and ability to operate at long-range, the railgun has the potential to revolutionize surface warfare operations by breaking the cost curve that has become the foundation in many of our adversaries’ strategies. History shows, however, that potentially revolutionary technological advances must be accompanied by changes in tactics, doctrine, strategy, and force structures. Using a military-technical revolution framework, this paper assessed the availability of those historical considerations found in previous revolutionary technologies. The data show that the revolutionary potential of this technology still remains to be seen, and will depend on a number of decisions to be made in the coming years. Yet, the evidence also suggests that, depending on the outcomes of those decisions, we could be looking at a key element of the next revolution in military affairs.

When discussing future ‘game changing’ technologies, the electromagnetic railgun can be found on many people’s lists. Capable of firing projectiles over 100 nautical miles at speeds topping Mach 7, all for a fraction of the cost of the current missile inventory, the railgun has the potential to revolutionize surface warfare operations. With sea testing of prototypes to
begin in 2016 aboard the USNS Trenton, the challenges and opportunities for the United States Navy in integrating this 'game changing' technology merit analysis.¹ This paper seeks to identify and assess those challenges and opportunities for a technology that has the potential to redefine the surface warfare cost calculus in ways not seen since the end of the Battleship Era.

Railguns: From Science Fiction to Reality

Conceptually, the railgun most closely functionally resembles traditional naval artillery guns such as the MK45 gun currently found on US Navy ships. In fact, the railgun can be seen as the evolution and replacement for traditional naval artillery. Both systems launch projectiles at adversarial targets, but they do so in fundamentally different ways. While traditional naval artillery is launched by either chemical or gas propellants, the railgun is launched by electromagnetic forces. By running electricity through two parallel rails, a Lorentz force is generated that propels projectiles towards the target.² This electromagnetic Lorentz force allows the railgun to engage targets over the horizon that traditional naval artillery guns could never reach.

² The Lorentz force is “the force exerted on a charged particle by a magnetic field (or a magnetic and an electric field).” Source: "Lorentz, n.". OED Online. September 2015. Oxford University Press. http://www.oed.com.proxy.library.georgetown.edu/viewdictionaryentry/Entry/110343.
Benefits of the Railgun Compared to Traditional Munitions

Compared to traditional naval artillery and missiles, the railgun presents a number of benefits to the warfighter that include redefining the cost curve, rapid long-range lethality, increased safety, and ease of logistics.

The first and predominant benefits of the railgun over other munitions options are in redefining the existing cost curve. Whereas the cost of a single missile today can vary anywhere from $0.99 million for the Rolling Airframe Missile to $1.41 million for the Tomahawk Missile, to the average of $4.45 million per STANDARD missile, the cost of the railgun is only an estimated $25,000 per shot. In describing just how impactful such a change would be, Rear Admiral Mathias Winter, Chief of Naval Research, stated that with a railgun, “we’ll be able to truly break the cost curve from an operation and cost-per-kill [standpoint].” While the railgun will not replace all of these systems, it will perform a complementary, force-multiplying role. Instead of the Tomahawk Missile being the only suitable long-range land attack option, the railgun could fulfill some of those missions. This would allow for Tomahawks to only be employed for targeting the highest value

---

and hardened targets, while the railgun would be utilized for the remaining targets.

For example, during the 2011 military operations in Libya as part Operation Odyssey Dawn, the US launched 124 Tomahawk missiles on the first day of operations and an additional 38 on subsequent days for a total of 162 used over the course of the 13-day operation. At a cost of $1.41 million per missile in Fiscal Year 2015, a replicate operation would cost the Department $229 million for just the Tomahawks themselves. Under the high-low munitions planning mix outlined above, a Tomahawk would have to take out a target that 56 or fewer railgun projectiles could not eliminate before the Tomahawk became the more economically viable option. If for example, 100 Tomahawk missiles were substituted for the railgun at a rate of 15 railgun projectiles per Tomahawk missile, the Department of Defense (DoD) could save over a $100 million for an exact replicate of Operation Odyssey Dawn. That Tomahawk replacement rate represents a conservative estimate of the number of railgun projectiles required for duplicate efforts. Further reductions to that replacement rate would bring even more dramatic changes to the cost per kill calculus.

The second major benefit of the railgun over other systems is rapid long-range lethality. Possessing a unique combination of range, speed, and lethality allows it to strike targets other

---

6 Program Acquisition Cost by Weapon System: United States Department of Defense Fiscal Year 2016 Budget Request
7 Calculation made based on cost of the Tomahawk Missile in FY15 and the advertised cost per railgun projectile of $25,000.
weapon systems might not feasibly be able to. This provides for greater operational flexibility by reducing the time between the call to fire and impact. Instead of waiting for close air support or missiles that may take long times to reach the warfighter, commanders could call in a railgun strike based upon the changing battlefield dynamics.

The third benefit of the railgun lies in increased safety aboard ships. Unlike missiles and traditional naval artillery, railgun projectiles pose no risk of catching on fire because they contain and use no explosive materials. Finally, railguns provide numerous logistical benefits to the fleet compared to traditional munitions. Not only would naval ships be able to carry more railgun projectiles due to their lack of chemical propellants, they would also be able to carry more due to the smaller shape and size, as well have the ability to be resupplied at sea, unlike missiles. When a ship depletes its missile stock, it must to return to port to resupply, as was seen during Operation Odyssey Dawn. With the railgun, other ships in the fleet could resupply the ship allowing it to avoid returning to port and remaining in the combat zone.

How do the Physics Work?

In its most basic form, the railgun system consists of five parts: launcher (consisting of two electrically conducive parallel rails and an armature), a power supply, a pulse-forming network, a projectile, and a gun mount. To fire the railgun, power is temporarily stored in pulsed power system by the ship. This stored power is then sent in the form of an electric current up

---

9 Ibid.
through the positive rail, across the armature, and down through the negatively charged rail. In completing this circuit, electromagnetic Lorentz forces are generated forcing the armature to accelerate up the rails, launching the accompanying projectile at the target.  

**Railgun Development History**

To understand the challenges and opportunities for the Navy, this report discusses the history of railgun development, as many of the historical lessons still apply today. While the railgun may be fired aboard a ship for the first time in history shortly, the concept for the railgun is actually quite old. It is only in recent years that advances in materiel sciences have moved the railgun from the theoretical realm to reality.

The earliest recorded history of an electronic gun can be traced to an 1844 announcement advertising a “newly invented Electric Gun: Siva, or THE DESTROYER.” Unfortunately, no further records or documentation exist beyond the announcement. In 1901, Norwegian physicist Kristian Olaf Bernard Birkeland conceived of, built a working small-scale prototype of, and patented the idea for an electromagnetic gun. For the next two years, Birkeland worked on improving his design, but ultimately ended the project after an unsuccessful demonstration of a larger design. The next significant breakthrough in the history of the railgun

---


development occurred in 1917. Working in France, French inventor Louis Octave Fachon-Villeplee conceived of an alternate to Birkeland’s design that culminated in a series of patent applications for his “Electronic Gun of Firing Apparatus.” 13 Fauchon-Villeplee’s railgun more closely resembles the railguns of today, consisting of two pole pieces connected by the fins of the projectile. 14 While Fachon-Villeplee ran into the same issues as Birkeland when attempting to scale the weapon up, his research laid out both the foundation for future work as well as outlining advantages of the system when compared to traditional artillery. 15

During World War II, while they never fielded it, the Germans designed the first ‘technically feasible’ railgun. Building off Fauchon-Villeplee’s efforts, German scientist Dr. Joachim Hänsler led the effort to build an electric gun starting in 1943. Focused on trying to solve the problem of the Allies’ bombing campaign, Hänsler conceived the idea to, in accordance with the military’s anti-air (AA) requirements, place six AA railguns on top of a house filled entirely with generators to power the system. However, the war ended before Hänsler could test his idea. Following the war, the Army commissioned a study to evaluate the feasibility of this design. The report concluded that such a weapon was ‘technically feasible,’ but would have required “enough power to illuminate half of Chicago.” 16

In the years following WWII, there were numerous attempts at building a feasible railgun by a number of countries.

14 McNabb, Early Electric Gun Research p. 251-252  
15 Ibid. p. 253  
In the 1950s, the US Air Force experimented with building a railgun, but failed to attain the peak firing velocities of the aforementioned previous efforts.  In 1977, the Australian National University set a record, firing a projectile at 5.9 kilometers per second. This effort later led to the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency and the Strategic Defense Initiative Organization to fund US electromagnetic launcher efforts in the 1980s. However, like the efforts before them, these research efforts failed to solve the power generation issues critical in transitioning the technology from laboratory experiment to operational usefulness.

In 2005, the US Navy launched a renewed effort that led to the breakthroughs that have allowed for the realistic weaponization of the technology. As part of its newly created Innovative Naval Prototypes program, the Navy invested $250 million with the hopes of producing a prototype capable of firing a projectile at 32 mega joules (MJ) of energy. In 2010, the investment paid off as the Navy successfully fired a projectile at 32 MJ, with velocities topping Mach 7, from one of its experimental prototypes. This success encouraged the Navy to fund a second phase of effort focusing on turning the project into an “acquisition program” with demonstrated “repeate rate fire capability.” As part of the Phase II effort, sea testing of the railgun prototype will begin aboard the Joint-High Speed Vessel USNS Trenton (JHSV-5). Aboard the Trenton, the railgun will fire five rounds at a static target of varying distances between 25 and 50 nautical miles. Following this test,

---

18 Ibid.
research efforts will focus on reaching Initial Operational Capability (IOC)\textsuperscript{20} by the mid-2020s as currently planned.\textsuperscript{21}

**What is Still to Come before IOC?**

Even as the railgun begins sea tests in 2016, there are critical remaining hurdles to solve prior to IOC. In order for the railgun to be deemed operationally capable, it must demonstrate two key capabilities: firing between several hundred to 3,000 shots before barrel replacement is required and being able to fire 10 to 12 rounds per minute. Developing both capabilities before the mid-2020s is not guaranteed and will require further advances in materiel sciences to address the stresses placed on the twin rails.

The first issue, barrel durability, stems from the Lorentz force that sets the railgun apart from traditional naval artillery. As the projectile and armature move up the rails, the Lorentz force is simultaneously trying to rip the two arms apart. Historically, experimental railgun testing has required that scientists replace the rails after just a few shots, sometimes after just a single one. Recent advances have placed the Navy on a path to reaching suitable barrel durability by reducing some of the issues associated with buckling and friction, but there is still work to go. In testimony before the Intelligence, Emerging Threats and Capabilities Subcommittee of the House Armed Services Committee, Chief of Naval Research Rear Admiral

---

\textsuperscript{20} IOC as defined by Joint Publication 1-02, *Department of Defense Dictionary of Military and Associated Terms*, defines IOC as, “The first attainment of the capability to employ effectively a weapon, item of equipment, or system of approved specific characteristics that is manned or operated by an adequately trained, equipped, and supported military unit or force.”

\textsuperscript{21} LaGrone, “NAVSEA Details at Sea 2016 Railgun Test on JHSV Trenton.”
Matthew Klunder stated in 2014 that, “barrel life has increased from tens of shots to over 400, with a program path to achieve 1000 shots.” This quote demonstrates that while progress has been made and a path towards operational effectiveness exists, work remains to achieve sufficient barrel longevity.

The second issue, ‘rep-rate fire capabilities’ also remains on track towards IOC. In order for the railgun to be deemed operationally effective, it must be capable of firing 10 to 12 rounds per minute. The historical problem in reaching that rate of fire has come in building a power system capable of generating the requisite power but still small enough to fit on ships. The Navy has made a series of recent technological breakthroughs that have allowed it to reduce the size of the pulsed power system by a factor of 2.5 making it suitable for deployment aboard ships. Current research efforts in this area are focusing on the development of advanced cooling techniques for pulsed power system as well as continued focus on materiel sciences.

The evidence suggests that the railgun is on track to reach IOC by the mid-2020s, but research and development (R&D) is never a guarantee. There are numerous examples throughout history of programs that appeared promising but ultimately failed as a result of technological challenges in development. In addition to the remaining issues for the railgun system, advances in the development of the railgun projectiles may cause issues as the Navy seeks to move beyond first generation projectiles. As the railgun becomes integrated into the fleet,

\[\text{Source: Department of Defense (DOD) Fiscal Year 2015 Science and Technology Programs: Pursuing Technology Superiority in a Changing Security Environment, Before the Intelligence, Emerging Threats and Capabilities Subcommittee of the House Armed Services Committee, 113th Cong. 3 (2013) (statement of Rear Admiral Matthew L. Klunder, Chief of Naval Research, United States Navy).}\]

\[\text{Ibid.}\]
certain mission sets will necessitate the development of more advanced projectile capabilities such as the ability to fire a ‘shotgun shell’ projectile, or improved targeting guidance. Furthermore, the Navy eventually wants to develop a 64 MJ railgun capable of firing over 200 nautical miles away. All of these aforementioned issues will merit attention as the Navy begins the first sea testing in 2016, as well as the planned testing of the ‘rep-rate fire’ in 2019.

Integrating the Railgun: Challenges and Opportunities

With the railgun program on a viable path to IOC, R&D is just the first step in exploiting this potentially revolutionary technology to redefine the cost calculus of surface warfare. The larger challenge may come in integrating it into the fleet. Yet the puzzle of how to integrate a new system also presents opportunities. The following sections analyze the challenges and opportunities in integrating this technology.

Lessons from History – Military-Technical Revolution

In his seminal 1992 analysis, *The Military-Technical Revolution*, Andrew Krepinevich wrote:

> A military-technological revolution occurs when the application of new technologies into military systems combines with innovative operational concepts and


organizational adaption to alter fundamentally the character and conduct of military operations.\(^{26}\)

As part of a broader effort to determine if the nature of warfare was fundamentally changing as a result of advances in technology in the late-20\(^{th}\) century, Krepinevich first sought to assess how countries revolutionized and exploited the development of new technologies. As history shows, being the first to develop a new technology is not sufficient to sustain one’s military superiority. Whether it is the French Navy’s failures between 1850 and 1880, or the British during the interwar period, history is rife with countries that failed to recognize the intrinsic revolutionary value of their own inventions.\(^{27}\) Krepinevich’s analysis found that technologies become revolutionary when all of the following considerations are present:\(^{28}\)

- Technology Change
- Military Systems Evolution
- Operational Innovation
- Organizational Adoption

Having established the nature of forthcoming technology change, these considerations provide a framework from which to analyze the opportunities and challenges in integrating the railgun technology into the fleet upon its maturation. If the

---


\(^{28}\) Ibid.
United States is to succeed in redefining the surface warfare cost curve, maximizing the exploitation of new technologies will be essential. It is not merely enough to develop the technology: it must be integrated into the tactics, doctrine, strategy, and organizing principles of the organization.

**Military Systems Evolution**

In looking at how military systems evolve to new technologies, there are two aspects to consider: How are the forces organized, and will this change how the forces operate?

**Future Naval Concept of Operations and the Railgun**

With the program still in development, plans to integrate the railgun into Naval Concept of Operations (CONOPS) are, to date, more speculative than definitive. Proponents of the railgun have argued that it could fulfill a number of missions ranging from naval surface fire support to ballistic missile defense, while skeptics are more dubious of its ability to actually perform the more complex missions with guaranteed reliability. The missions the railgun could hypothetically perform fall into three categories:

- **Confirmed Mission:** The missions that the Navy has explicitly stated the railgun will perform upon IOC.
- **Probable Missions:** The missions that naval officials and outside experts have stated that the railgun would perform, but have not been officially confirmed by program officials.
- **Potential Missions:** The missions that have been identified as potential missions if or when the technology required becomes available.
Confirmed Missions

To date, the Navy has officially confirmed the railgun will perform just two missions upon entering the fleet: naval gunfire support and long-range strike.

Naval gunfire support, or “fire provided by Navy surface gun systems in support of a unit or units tasked with achieving the commander’s objectives,” is a critical pillar of Marine Corps and Navy doctrine.\(^{29}\) Historically, naval gunfire support was used to soften beach defenses before an amphibious landing; today, it is used less for weakening beach defenses, but rather for targets further inland, as the current Amphibious Operations doctrine places a preference on bypassing the beach and other strong points in order to enable maneuver warfare.\(^{30}\)

Whereas the current naval surface fire support mission is limited by the 13 nautical mile range of the MK45, the use of railguns would allow commanders to strike much further inland. Furthermore, the electromagnetic propulsion provides additional benefits to the naval gunfire support mission specifically:

- First, as the projectile falls on top of the target as a result of its ballistic trajectory, there is a smaller risk of the explosive’s kinetic energy accidently hitting friendly troops.


• Second, the ballistic trajectory allows for targeting of adversaries entrenched on reverse slopes.\textsuperscript{31}

Long-range strike, or “an attack to damage or destroy an objective or a capability” is the second confirmed shore bombardment mission.\textsuperscript{32} In conjunction with land-attack missiles such as the Tomahawk missile, the Railgun would be a key component in the elimination of the adversary’s targets. As mentioned in the Benefits of the Railgun Compared to Traditional Munitions section above, the railgun would be employed as part of a high-low munitions mix. Railguns could perform future strike missions and leave only the high value, hardened defense, and targets beyond 100 nautical miles for the Tomahawk.

**Probable Missions**

Anti-surface warfare (ASuW) and anti-air warfare (AAW) are two probable missions the railgun can reasonably be expected to perform upon entering the fleet. Similar to the long-range strike mission, the railgun will be expected to complement existing missile systems in a high-low munitions mix for both the ASuW and AAW missions. The benefit of incorporating the railgun into the ASuW and AAW missions beyond redefining the cost curve is speed. With speeds topping Mach 7, the railgun can hit targets located beyond the horizon in as few as

---


six seconds. This provides naval commanders additional options for protecting the fleet in a security environment in which advanced missile technologies are rapidly proliferating.

Potential Missions

Potential missions the railgun could perform include ballistic missile defense, anti-cruise missile defense, and defense against small boat threats. Performing these missions will require additional technological advances before the railgun could perform them with any certainty. However, should the technology become available, employing the railgun for these missions would offer substantial benefits to the Navy. As adversarial missiles are becoming more advanced, they are increasingly becoming more difficult to detect and defend against with the missile systems of today. The railgun would be able to substantially reduce both the cost per kill and the minimum radar detection range required to ensure destruction of the enemy missile.

Future Naval Force Structures

While the Navy may have plans to integrate the railgun into its CONOPS, a larger question remains: what ships will the railgun be deployed upon? Given the substantial power required operate a railgun, the DDG-100 Zumwalt-Class Destroyer is the only combat ship capable of operating it.

---

without significant modifications to its base configurations. The DDG-1000 is able to operate a railgun thanks to its integrated power system (IPS), which allows the ship to redirect power throughout the ship where necessary. However, after the program encountered significant cost overruns, the program was truncated and now there are plans to only purchase three of the original 32 ships. With only three DDG-1000 planned to enter the fleet, this leaves the Navy with two options: wait for the next-generation destroyer program, the Future Surface Combatant Ship (FSC), to enter the fleet, or retrofit existing ships in the inventory to equip the railgun. Neither option is necessarily better than the other as both carry significant tradeoffs and risks in the short- and long-term.

The first option, waiting for the FSC, brings with it a railgun ‘operational-deployment gap.’ This option would leave a five- to ten-year gap between the railgun achieving operational usefulness in the mid-2020s and projected wide-scale employment aboard FSC in the early 2030s. The risks in this plan lie in the operational innovation and organization adaption considerations Krepinevich laid out. The railgun could and likely would be employed aboard the DDG-1000s during

37 This assumes that the railgun achieves IOC as planned in the mid-2020s and that the FSC enters the fleet as planned in the early 2030s. There does exist significant risk of both criteria not occurring. The risk of the railgun not achieving IOC in the mid-2020s is less than that of the FSC not entering service by the early 2030s. If the railgun IOC is delayed, this “operational-deployment gap” delays” disappears. There is a much greater risk if FSC is delayed due to schedule overruns or temporary push back of the program due to pressures on the shipbuilding budget. If the railgun achieved IOC in the mid-2020s and FSC was delayed, the “operational-deployment gap” would increase.
this period, but the demands of ship rotations ensures that there will likely only be a single Zumwalt at sea at a time. While the Navy would still experiment operationally with the railgun during this period, they will not see the same benefits as if they performed tests with wider-scale employment. This operational experimentation risks also carries with it risk for organization adaption. Waiting to employ the railgun in larger quantities aboard FSC makes it unlikely that the lessons of railgun experimentation will be established clearly enough to be incorporated into the FSC design. While the Navy already knows the basics of what the railgun will require in terms of power generation and deck space, operational experimentation may reveal that the benefits of employing a railgun could be maximized by tweaking additional aspects of ship design. The risks of option one are clear, but so too are the benefits. In the current security environment, the Navy is facing challenges to its absolute dominance of the seas that it has not seen since the end of the Cold War. At the same time, external budgetary pressures like the Budget Control Act of 2011 have placed caps on defense spending, imposing additional constraints on the Navy. As such, the Navy could be reasonably expected to reach the conclusion that whatever benefits railgun experimentation may provide, they would not outweigh the risks and costs to retrofitting existing ships in such a pivotal moment.

Should the Navy elect to take option two -- retrofitting existing ships -- they have a few options. The US Navy today has three surface combatant ships that could be potentially retrofitted to fit the railgun demands: The DDG-51 Areligh Burke-class Destroyer, Ticonderoga-class Cruisers, and the Littoral Combat Ship.

DDG-51 Areligh Burke-class Destroyer Flight III

The most obvious surface combatant to retrofit to accommodate a railgun would be the DDG-51 Areligh Burke-class destroyer. Following the cancellation of the DDG-1000, the Navy elected to restart production of the DDG-51 and commence design of an upgraded Flight III variant. To fulfill the mission, the power and cooling systems were upgraded to accommodate a larger radar system. The newly designed Flight III system did not include the installation of an IPS due to the ship’s design limitations, limiting the destroyer’s ability to field railguns and other heavily power-dependent systems. However, an analysis by the Government Accountability Office found that that it was still possible to install a railgun if current weapon systems were removed. The study found that, for example, by “removing the ship’s main 5-inch gun and a forward 32-cell missile launcher system” a small railgun could be installed.39

The Navy has begun studying the possibility of integrating the railgun onto the DDG-51, but analysis is still ongoing.40 With production of the Flight III DDG-51 planned to begin in FY16 and continue through at least FY22, the first ones produced are not likely to include plans for a railgun, but it is certainly imaginable that the ships produced near the end of this production cycle could include room for a railgun.

40 Eckstein, “Navy Pursuing Upgraded Railgun”
Littoral Combat Ship/Small Surface Combatant

The Littoral Combat Ship (LCS) is the second surface combatant ship that could potentially employ the railgun. Designed as a multi-mission modular ship that operated in littoral zones, the original program was truncated at 32 of the originally planned 52 ships.\(^41\) To fill this capability gap, the Navy elected to produce the small surface combatant (SSC), or fast frigate, as a follow-on to the LCS. Compared to the LCS, the SSC will be larger, more survivable, and better armed.\(^42\) However, even with the upgrades, it seems doubtful that the Navy will consider employing railguns aboard either ship for the foreseeable future. The Navy has conducted studies of the issue,\(^43\) but concluded that the size of the ship is not conducive to railgun employment.\(^44\)

Ticonderoga-Class Cruisers

The Ticonderoga-class cruiser has served as the centerpiece of the carrier battle group’s missile defense strategy since its conception. It is from the Ticonderoga-class cruisers that the air warfare commander has directed friendly aerial operations as

---


\(^44\) Osborn, “Navy Will Test its Electromagnetic Rail Gun aboard DDG 1000”
well as the monitoring and detection of adversarial air assets. In order to perform his or her job, the air warfare commander’s position is supported by additional staff and specialized command and control equipment. While there were initial discussions about including room for the air warfare commander on the new Burke-class destroyers, the final version did not have the requisite space, leaving the Ticonderoga-class cruisers as the only ships capable of performing this duty. For this reason, any attempts at retrofitting cruisers to fit a railgun would incur unacceptable risk to the carrier battle group.

**Operational Innovation and Organizational Adaption?**

The remaining two criteria of Krepinevich’s ‘Military Technology Revolution,’ operational innovation and organizational adaption, are the great unknowns with regards to the railgun, presenting the biggest opportunities, but also the biggest risks. It is in these areas that the Navy and DoD have the most to gain, but also the most to lose.

At this time, it is too early to make assessments on how the Navy will respond experimentally or organizationally. Early indications seem to suggest that the railgun has attracted interest throughout the surface warfare community, but with the program still in development, there is no way to assess if early developments are indicative of reality. Complicating matters will be the likely continuation of the current budgetary pressures. In the same mid-2020s timeframe that the railgun will achieve IOC, the Navy budget will be dominated by the Ohio-class replacement, the Ford-class aircraft carrier, and the unmanned carrier-launched airborne surveillance and strike programs. The sheer cost of these programs will spill into other
areas of the Navy’s budget, potentially restricting operational experimentation.

For these reasons, there are certain signs that will give early indicators as to how much organizational experimentation and adaption will be involved, that include:

**Organizational Experimentation**

- Does the Navy elect to retrofit an existing ship to accommodate the railgun?
- How much experimentation does the Navy perform beyond the already scheduled tests in 2016 and 2019?
- Does the Navy experiment with employing railguns in a manner other than traditional naval artillery?
- Does the Navy experiment with employing railguns in conjunction with other munitions as a force multiplier?

**Organizational Adaption**

- If organizational experimentation occurs before the design of FSC, are the results incorporated into its design?
- How does the Navy respond to counter-measures developed by other countries?
- Is funding for the railgun protected over other areas in difficult budgetary times?

**Conclusions**

It remains to be seen if the railgun will become the revolutionary technology that many proclaim it to be. The potential for the technology to be a ‘game changer’ is clear. At an estimated $25,000 per shot and ability to operate at long-range, the railgun has a realistic potential to break the cost
curve that has become the foundation in many of our adversaries’ anti-access/area denial strategies. History shows us, however, that technological advancements must be accompanied by changes in tactics, doctrine, strategy, and organizing principles. The development of these new methods will require considerable operational experimentation, yet there is the possibility that an “operational-deployment gap” prohibits wide-scale experimentation until long after the technology becomes operationally effective. Unfortunately, there are no easy answers as the Navy faces the difficult question, “are the interim sacrifices to existing capabilities worth the potential gains from operational experimentation?”

While the Navy and DoD will ultimately have to decide that for themselves, the evidence suggests that if the railgun can continue along its current development path, we could be looking at a key element of the next revolution in military affairs.

Rhys McCormick is a research assistant with the Defense-Industrial Initiatives Group (DIIG) at Center for Strategic International Studies. He holds a B.S. in security and risk analysis from the Pennsylvania State University and is currently pursuing an M.A. in security studies with a concentration in military operations at Georgetown University. This paper was prepared by Rhys McCormick in his personal capacity. The opinions expressed in this paper should be understood to be the author's own and do not reflect the view of the Center for Strategic and International Studies.

Pakistan’s Urban Militant Threat: Challenges and Opportunities for Police-Led Counterinsurgency

Hijab Shah

As traditional hideouts on the Pakistan-Afghanistan border are pounded by Pakistani jets and US drones, militant leadership and mid-level cadres have shifted to Pakistan’s cities. With the Pakistan Army spread thin and the threat shifting towards densely populated areas, conventional military force becomes less relevant, and police forces become better placed to deal with the threat. Unfortunately, Pakistan’s police forces are overworked, underpaid, systematically targeted by militants, and suffering from a lack of training, recruitment, materiel, and political backing, boding ill for the security situation. Using the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province’s police forces as a case study, this paper will conduct a thorough review of the institutional weaknesses and capacity constraints of the police, as well as an analysis of the progress made by recent reforms to the force and the shortcomings it continues to face. The paper will culminate with broader implications of the provincial police’s efforts against urban militancy and recommendations for how to bolster their efforts.
Police-led counterinsurgency is a fairly new phenomenon in Pakistan, a country where the military has held a monopoly over the security domain since achieving independence in 1947. The police forces function according to colonial-era legislation that has gone largely unchanged over the past century and a half. However, in the face of an insurgency shifting away from traditional hideouts on the Pakistan-Afghanistan border and setting up shop inside urban centers, the police forces have had no choice but to adapt rapidly to a worsening security situation. This has been an uphill battle for a sub-par force mired in structural, political, and capacity issues. The province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) has been the hardest by violence in the years following the Global War on Terror (GWOT) in Afghanistan, with the provincial police force bearing the brunt of the backlash resulting from Pakistan's alliance with the United States.

Over the past decade, tens of thousands of Pakistanis have been killed by suicide attacks, bombings, shootings, and meticulously planned terrorist operations — many of which were designed from within KP’s provincial borders. KP Police has had to adapt to the rise of urban militancy within its jurisdiction and has been forced to take on an unprecedented role in Pakistan’s counterinsurgency efforts. KP Police has undertaken significant efforts in recent years — restructuring the force, establishing specialized training centers, obtaining better technology — to reform the force and better equip it to counter the shifting threat paradigm within the country. A year into massive reforms implemented by the force, progress and shortcomings in KP Police’s capacity have come to light, making for an interesting case study in the study of police-led counterinsurgency. The question remains: is the KP Police force capable of taking on the rising threat of urban militancy
and conducting a successful counterinsurgency campaign to help secure the region?

Shifting Threat Paradigm

The tribal region along the Pakistan-Afghanistan border has historically served as the safe haven of choice for a plethora of unsavory characters. From extortionists and smugglers to mutineers and murderers, those seeking to escape the authorities have for centuries found sanctuary in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA), where provincial law enforcement has no jurisdiction. The Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) of 1901, a rudimentary and timeworn system of governance allowing minimal federal oversight in the area, has been dysfunctional since the British ended their colonial rule in the Subcontinent in 1947 and thus serves as no real impediment to the movement of criminals seeking to escape the authorities in the urban and settled areas of Pakistan.1

In the post-9/11 era, FATA first became the sanctuary for the Afghan Taliban fleeing the operations led by the International Security Assistance Force (ISAF). The area then became a haven for emerging groups of Pakistani, Arab, and Central Asian extremist groups allied with Al Qaeda and the Taliban, who sought to challenge the ISAF-led coalition in Afghanistan and its political and military allies in Pakistan. After largely unsuccessful operations by the Pakistani military in North and South Waziristan between 2002 and 2008, the

---

Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP or Pakistani Taliban) and its affiliates took control of a large swath of North Waziristan and developed an operating base from which they launched their agenda of overthrowing the government and establishing Shariah law in Pakistan through a deadly campaign of terrorist attacks on Pakistani cities. The most recent large-scale attack launched by the group was on the Army Public School at the end of last year in Peshawar, the provincial capital of KP, killing 132 children.

The sanctuaries in FATA are, however, no longer hospitable. The aerial bombardment of militant hideouts and convoys by a combination of American unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs) and, more recently, the Pakistan Air Force (PAF) fighter jets over the last five years have caused operational setbacks to the various local and foreign groups hiding in the area. The TTP, in particular, has been significantly disrupted by Operation Zarb-e-Azb — launched in June 2014 and intensified after the Army Public School attack — and Operations Khyber-I and II — launched in October 2014 and March 2015, respectively. TTP control over territory in Waziristan has severely diminished. Not too long ago, TTP leader Hakimullah Mehsud would drive with impunity around large swaths of land he controlled in FATA, in a U.S. Humvee allegedly stolen from a NATO supply truck on its way to Afghanistan. He is now dead, along with some 3,000 other

---

2 This paper will focus on the Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) as this group is the main agitator within the country, an insurgency with control of territory within Pakistan’s sovereign domain.


militants, whilst nearly 900 sanctuaries have been destroyed since June 2014.⁶

In the past, criminals would flee the cities to lose their pursuers in the rough terrain of the tribal areas. Now that FATA is no longer a viable sanctuary, militant leaders and cadres are fleeing the tribal areas to hide within the human terrain of Pakistan’s crowded cities. The northwestern city of Peshawar and its surrounding suburbs, along with the southern port city of Karachi, have become the urban hideouts of choice.⁷

Although a large number of militants have fled across the border into the border areas of Afghanistan,⁸ the more potent threat comes from the leaders and operatives that are scattered amongst the civilian population within Pakistan. Military operations against militants in urban areas are almost entirely out of the question, not only because of the severe risk they would pose to the local population, but also because the Pakistani armed forces are spread very thin. Between the soldiers deployed for Operation Zarb-e-Azb and the units permanently stationed on the eastern border with India, the military — particularly the Pakistan Army — cannot take on

---

⁶ These figures were provided by Inter-Services Public Relations (ISPR), the official media arm of the Pakistani military and the sole source of information from the heart of the conflict. “A Year On, 2,763 Militants Killed in Operation Zarb-E-Azb: ISPR,” The Express Tribune, June 13, 2015, http://tribune.com.pk/story/903004/a-year-on-2763-militants-killed-in-operation-zarb-e-azb-ispr/.


the added burden of conducting low-intensity counterinsurgent warfare in cities as well.⁹

The Pakistani armed forces have always controlled security-related operations in the country, ranging from large-scale conventional warfare against India, to quelling belligerent secessionist movements in urban centers, to conducting rapid response operations during ongoing terrorist attacks. The gravity of the militant threat to urban centers, coupled with the Army’s commitments on the eastern and western borders of the country, have resulted in the empowerment of an underprepared — but logical — partner in the fight against the militant insurgency: the police.

KP police forces, in particular, have had a sudden increase in responsibility over the past decade — especially since the uptick of attacks and insurgency in the areas within its jurisdiction from 2005 onwards. The proximity of the tribal areas, coupled with the establishment of strongholds and safe houses around Peshawar, have made the KP forces critical to the security of Pakistan as a whole, but at the same time caused them to be targeted by militants. KP Police has been at the frontlines of the fight against the insurgency in Pakistan, and its experience and evolution over the past decade serve as lessons to the police forces of the country’s three other provinces.

---

⁹ Although paramilitary groups such as the Pakistan Rangers, Frontier Corps, and Frontier Constabulary are contributing to the counterinsurgency effort, they are largely tied up elsewhere: In Karachi, the Rangers have launched a significant operation against political gangs, whereas the Peshawar-headquartered Frontier Corps and Constabulary assist with border duty and anti-smuggling patrols near the Afghan border, as well as providing security to the diplomatic corps, politicians, and government personnel — such as health workers involved in dangerous polio drives in villages close to the tribal areas.
The bulk of Pakistan’s police forces are under the jurisdiction of each provincial government and administrative authority, and are structured according to the Indian Police Act of 1861, instituted by the British viceroyalty while the crown still ruled over a united India. The Act established a community-oriented constabulary model of policing that relied on police’s engagement and relationship with the local community to tackle issues of mostly petty crime. After the British left the subcontinent and Pakistan became an independent country in 1947, minor amendments were made to the 1861 model, but none prepared the police forces to tackle the post-GWOT security situation. KP Police was wholly unprepared for the magnitude of violence it confronted around the 2005 mark — suicide bombings, targeted killings, improvised explosive device (IED) detonations, extortion, and kidnappings for ransom soon became the norm in the province. Peshawar, the capital of the province and the nearest urban center within reach, was the hardest hit of all. Militants of various shades chose the city to do damage to what they deemed a traitorous government that catered to the whims of the United States.

Ironically, between 2003 and 2007, the provincial government of KP — helped into power by a desperate Pervez

---

10 Exceptions to this are the Capital Territory Police responsible for law enforcement in Islamabad, which is separate from the Punjab provincial police force. The federally supervised law enforcement agencies include paramilitary agencies, the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA), the National Highways and Motorway Police, the Pakistan Railways Police, and the Airport Security Force, amongst others. Hassan Abbas, “Reforming Pakistan’s Police and Law Enforcement Infrastructure: Is It Too Flawed To Fix?,” Special Report (United States Institute for Peace, February 2011), 4–5, http://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/resources/sr266.pdf.
Musharraf, then-military dictator of Pakistan, losing popularity in the face of his support for the GWOT — inadvertently enabled militant groups to gain influence and power in the region. Under Musharraf’s leadership, the Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA), a coalition of religious parties with known links and sympathies with the Taliban in Afghanistan as well as various other violent extremist groups, formed the provincial government. The MMA turned a blind eye to militant activity teeming within the province, and enabled militant groups to gain more operating space and eventually coalesce under the TTP umbrella.\textsuperscript{12} The MMA brokered lopsided ceasefires and deals between leaders like Baitullah Mehsud, Hafiz Gul Bahadar and Nek Muhammad Wazir, and the Pakistani military in the early years of operations against militants in FATA, which featured major concessions for the militant groups and allowed them to create parallel governance systems within pockets of the country.\textsuperscript{13} The rise of the TTP insurgency in the province correlates with the MMA’s rule over KP. The MMA was dethroned from its provincial seat in 2007, and with no one to wield control or influence over the TTP, violence hit a crescendo in Pakistan. According to official government sources, 4,497 people were killed and 11,637 were injured just in KP between 2007 and 2014.\textsuperscript{14} The violence spilled over into


\textsuperscript{13} Khattak, “Reviewing Pakistan’s Peace Deals with the Taliban”; Interview with Former Senior Bureaucrat, KP Government.

the rest of Pakistan as well, with the government reporting the loss of nearly 50,000 lives since its 2001 decision to support the GWOT.15

The erstwhile-Frontier Police (now KP Police) was thoroughly unprepared to handle the emergence of the post-9/11 crisis. Overworked, underpaid, under-resourced, riddled with nepotism and corruption — although to a much lesser degree than some other provincial police forces — and with a terrible public image, the police force could not put up a fight against the organized, ruthless cadres of the TTP. Nevertheless, the province’s police forces put on a brave front, improvising to the best of their abilities despite the meager resources at their disposal. The forces began to target the criminal networks that had abetted the TTP through recruitment of informants and would-be suicide bombers, kidnapping for ransom to finance militant activities, and provision of resources and materiel to carry out attacks.

The police force suffered the brunt of the TTP’s retaliation. Within three years, KP lost two of its finest senior officers to targeted suicide attacks: Deputy Inspector General of Police (DIG) Malik Saad in January 2007, and Additional Inspector General of Police (Additional IG) Safwat Ghayur in August 2010.16 From the 1970s to date, 1,508 KP police personnel have


been killed in the line of duty: 1,133 of them were killed between 2006 and 2015.\textsuperscript{17} Peshawar’s Bomb Disposal Squad, which defused about 2,200 bombs between 2009 and 2014 with minimal equipment — lost their chief Hukam Khan in September 2012, when militants set off an IED close to a dummy bomb they had planted to lure him. Khan had manually defused more than 200 bombs just that year.\textsuperscript{18} Police morale in Pakistan as a whole took a major hit with the magnitude of its losses, affecting the performance of law enforcement agencies throughout the country, but especially in KP.\textsuperscript{19}

Then in April 2014, Nasir Khan Durrani became the new Inspector General of Police (IG) of KP and breathed life into an organization that was in desperate need of support and rejuvenation. In 2014, IG Durrani overhauled KP Police and introduced a series of radical reforms to consolidate the strategic vision and improve the capacity of his forces. The KP Counter Terrorism Department (CTD), established a year prior to IG Durrani’s appointment, was empowered further in their intelligence gathering, investigation, and other operations against militant groups operating in the region. KP Police also established five new specialized police training schools — the Police Schools of Investigation, Intelligence, Tactics, Explosive Handling, and Public Disorder Management — alongside two


new Recruit Training Centers to bring the provincial total to five.\textsuperscript{20}

The specialized schools feed into new and revamped units established by the IG. The reformed Elite Force now houses the Rapid Response Force (RRF) — “a standby force consisting of highly motivated and trained police units available for deployment on a notice of 5 to 10 minutes” — as well as the Specialized Combat Unit (SCU) — a unit that “will respond to extreme situations which the District Police and RRF are unable to handle ... available for movement on a zero-minute notice,” and whose training has been designed by the Pakistan Army’s Special Services Group (SSG) — and the province’s first ever Women Elite Commando Unit, “participating in search and strike/sting operations and for securing the soft targets frequented by the female populace.”\textsuperscript{21} With the help of USAID grant money, the KP Police has developed an area of nearly 150 acres into a state-of-the-art training facility — the Joint Police Training Center (JPTC) — for the Elite Force and its respective specialized units.\textsuperscript{22} The KP government has also allocated $8 million from its own budget towards the JPTC, as well as an additional $4 million towards the efforts against the militant threat.\textsuperscript{23}

\textsuperscript{20}“Strategic Initiatives, KP Police,” 17–33.
\textsuperscript{21}Ibid., 36–41.
The former Bomb Disposal Squad has now been updated to a Bomb Disposal Unit, “equipped with 20 bomb-disposal suits, four remote-controlled bomb disposal robots and a kennel of 10 specially trained sniffer dogs, as well as specialist explosives investigation and defusing kits.” Additionally, the KP Police has invested in technology relevant to streamlining workflow, obtaining actionable and timely intelligence. In addition to the $12 million being spent towards the improvements to the KP police force, the provincial government has also set money aside to “to purchase 300 GSM and 10 explosive detectors, 2 GSM locators, 25 metal detectors, 25 non-metal detectors, 16 short-range jammers and 100 computers.” These purchases and investments in information technology systems are vital to tracking the communications of and preventing attacks by the TTP. KP Police has also revamped its recruitment and promotion processes to improve the quality of its force, in addition to cracking down on nepotism and corruption, and implementing severe penalties for those within the force trying to circumvent the rules.

Although the reforms implemented by IG Durrani have only been in place for about a year, KP Police has made significant progress into becoming a formidable opponent to

---


26 “Police Training Centre.”

the TTP insurgency. On the other hand, the past year has highlighted obstacles and shortcomings that have implications for the counterinsurgency competence of the KP Police force, with the potential to significantly impact regional and international security as well, especially if the urban militancy threat is given space to establish itself. The following section will analyze the progress and shortcomings of KP Police’s reform agenda along counterinsurgency lines.

**Challenges and Opportunities of KP Police’s New Role**

Arguably the most positive impact that the police reforms have had in KP is the decrease in militant attacks within the province. Although the threat of the TTP-led urban militancy is far from over, the police have made significant, quantifiable gains in the past few years. According to a report by the Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency (PILDAT), “There has been a 45 percent decrease in suicide bombings; 50 percent decrease in vehicle borne IED attacks; 25 percent decline in IED attacks; 30 percent decrease in rocket attacks; and 50 percent decline in terrorism-related casualties in 2014 compared to 2013.” 28 Kidnapping for ransom has reportedly decreased by 45 percent, and extortion cases have reduced from about 75 cases per month to four or five. 29

---

conducted “11,329 search operations, arrests or interrogation of 36,000 suspects including detention of 454 hardcore militants, and nearly 5,000 cases against home and hotel owners who failed to report tenants to the police.”

KP Police — much like the rest of Pakistan’s police forces — had a bad reputation in the public domain. Although public opinion began to turn around in KP after the TTP and other militant groups targeted the police, issues such as corruption, nepotism, mismanagement, and lack of resources continued to plague the force. The reforms brought into place by IG Durrani have, however, forced KP Police to turn over a new leaf, and this has not escaped the public’s notice.

In the short amount of time between October 2013 and September 2015, nearly 5,000 police officials have been disciplined over charges of corruption, nepotism, neglect, and even ties to criminals — with nearly 600 removed from the post. IG Durrani has even established a customer service department of sorts — the Police Access System — which allows for the public to directly lodge complaints about police behavior, and allows the public to have a “round-the-clock direct link between himself and the public.” This is an unprecedented show of transparency and accountability from within the KP Police, one that is positively impacting the counterinsurgency effort. The improved public image will likely encourage more public trust, support, and assistance in

30 Gul, “Counterterror in K-P and FATA.”
32 “Police, Politics, and the People of Pakistan,” 20–21.
34 Ibid.
the police’s operations against urban militants scattered amongst the civilian population. A cleaner police force also means fewer opportunities for sabotage or interference from corrupt insiders within the KP Police force who may previously have been an obstacle to tackling criminal networks working in tandem with the TTP, or provided intelligence on high-level officials for targeted attacks.

Although the KP Police has made significant inroads in improving its capacity and strategic outlook, there remains a significant gap between the leadership on the officer level and the rank-and-file cadre whose duty is to implement and execute. The mismatch in the level of strategic thinking, training, and attitudes between the officer and enlisted ranks is a product of educational and socioeconomic realities and a structural problem within the Pakistani police system, a remnant of the 1861 Police Act. A culture of insulation and isolation has developed within the officer ranks, where the leadership is almost entirely removed from the realities on the ground and the issues being faced by the enlisted personnel responsible for carrying out police duties.35

A culture of corner-cutting and low-level corruption is endemic within the enlisted ranks, due to the meager benefits and salaries they have been provided in comparison to the officer leadership. Additionally, a mismatch in seniority has widened the gap between the officer and the enlisted policeman: if the latter works his way up the ladder of enlisted ranks and is positioned to be promoted to the rank of Superintendent of Police (SP), he may well be superseded by a junior officer with significantly less experience and who is fast-tracked into the role purely by virtue of being an officer. This,

35 Interview with Senior Officer (A) in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Force, interview by Hijab Shah, July 25, 2015.
understandably, creates not just friction within the force for political reasons, but inefficiency as well.\textsuperscript{36} A green junior officer will not understand the issues and the inner workings of a department the way a more experienced policeman would, and could significantly frustrate the efforts of a department in the time it would take for the former to get up to speed.\textsuperscript{37}

While structural issues within the enlisted ranks persist and need to be given more attention by the KP Police, the quantity and caliber of the enlisted cadre is certainly improving. In fact, it could eventually help shrink the aforementioned disconnect between the officers and enlisted personnel. In 2007, the KP police force consisted of 34,000 people. In 2015, that number has more than doubled to 79,000.\textsuperscript{38} More than 80 percent of the new recruits are graduates and post-graduates, which poses an interesting problem: for the first time, the recruits have higher academic qualifications than their trainers at the police academies within the province, forcing the leadership to bring in foreign trainers and focus on improving the quality of trainers available.\textsuperscript{39}

Although the KP Police has boosted its numbers, especially in the provincial capital of Peshawar, the police-to-population ratio remains worrisome. Today, Peshawar has one policeman for every 1,000 people in the city, whereas the recommended ratio is one for every 400 in peacetime, and “a range of 20 to 25 counterinsurgents for every 1,000 residents” (or one for every

\textsuperscript{37} Interview with Senior Officer (A), KP Police.
\textsuperscript{38} Interview with Senior Officer (B), KP Police.
\textsuperscript{39} Ibid.
40 to 50 people) during counterinsurgency operations.\textsuperscript{40} While there are 6,400 police personnel in Peshawar, only 1,900 are available for active policing — the remainder are assigned to static duties such as guarding consulates, government buildings, hospitals and schools, or providing protection to politicians and VIPs.\textsuperscript{41} This is especially troubling in a city of 3.7 million, more than 4 million when counting the recent influx refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).\textsuperscript{42}

Increasing the number of active policemen further to adequately provide for counterinsurgency operations in KP will require additional funding from the provincial government. Fortunately, this is reflected in the KP government’s current budget proposal, which allocates nearly 15 percent of the provincial budget — $3.2 million — towards bolstering the force, a marked increase from the previous year’s allocation — $2.8 million.\textsuperscript{43}

There are issues in the counterinsurgency effort, however, that money cannot fix; interagency cooperation is one of them. Although KP falls under the jurisdiction of the provincial police


\textsuperscript{41} Interview with Senior Officer (B), KP Police.

\textsuperscript{42} Although an official population census has not been held in Pakistan since 1998, these numbers are conservative estimates gleaned from surveys done by the provincial government and KP Police. There is a census planned in 2016, which will provide more accurate numbers. Ibid.

force, there are several other agencies actively involved in security operations within the province. Peshawar houses the XI Corps of the Pakistan Army, which is leading operations in FATA and assisting in efforts within the settled areas of KP alongside the paramilitary forces of the Frontier Corps and Frontier Constabulary. The intelligence community, consisting of the Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI), Military Intelligence (MI), and the federally supervised civilian Intelligence Bureau (IB), has a significant presence within the province to support the counterinsurgency operations. With so many groups working in tandem, there has previously been some overlap and confusion regarding the roles and jurisdictions of each.44

While the military forces and intelligence agencies have significant experience working with each other, the relationship between the civilian and military security and intelligence arms is still a work in progress, especially after the changes undergone by the KP Police. The lack of institutionalized structures for agencies to cooperate within can result in the wastage of valuable but time-sensitive intelligence. Actionable intelligence takes too long to get processed and delivered from one agency to the next. By the time the police force is able to act upon it, the intelligence may no longer be viable. Coupled with the resource gap between the military and civilian security sectors — the former far outstrips the latter, especially in tracking technology — disorganized collaboration between the various players in KP continues to hinder successful urban counterinsurgency efforts.45

That said, efforts to rectify the issues with interagency cooperation are certainly underway, with IG Durrani stating

44 Interview with Senior Officer (B), KP Police.
45 Ibid.
that, “We enjoy full support of the army, ISI and MI.” The relationship between the KP Police and the IB, however, has produced significant dividends; in the past year, 90 percent of CTD operations in the province were conducted with the IB, leading to the arrest of 300 militants. In a different example of interagency cooperation, the Army SSG continues to help train KP Police’s Elite Forces, and is now joined by the Pakistan Navy, which has recently provided a six-week training to 52 Special Combat Unit members in emergency water-rescue operations. This commitment to bolstering interagency cooperation between the various security forces within KP — the IB, the Army, and the Navy — has taken on a national role, one that can only benefit the efforts against urban insurgency nationwide.

Taking the KP Police from a force previously focused mostly on localized misconducts and petty crimes to one geared towards urban counterinsurgency is a herculean task, but one that the forces are steadily heading towards. The momentum over the last few years is such that the challenges faced by the KP Police are outweighed by the progress and improvement that the forces are making. The goals that the provincial force is striving towards have security implications not just for KP, but for the country and region as well.

46 Cheema, “Joint IB-Police Operations Make KP Almost Terror-Free.”
Regional Relevance and Recommendations

While KP Police’s jurisdiction is limited to the province, the forces can potentially have a much broader impact with further improvement in their counterinsurgency capacity. Urban militancy is, of course, not just a problem in the province of KP. The rise of what has been dubbed the sectarian “Punjabi Taliban” in the province of Punjab, and a melee of violent militant groups with diverse agendas in Karachi — including treacherous elements of the TTP who have carved out no-go areas within the city — are also serious causes for concern, and potential future avenues of urban counterinsurgency within the country. KP Police’s experience can serve as a model to the rest of the provinces within the country, and perhaps lead to a more effective and streamlined effort in the future.

Securing the urban centers of Pakistan — particularly in KP — against the shifting insurgent threat would significantly restrict the violence emanating from the region, an important consideration for neighboring nations that are directly affected by the actions of militant groups in Pakistan. Militant violence — be it TTP, Al Qaeda, or any other group — has spillover effects especially in neighboring Afghanistan. This in turn also affects the remaining US and international forces within Afghanistan, and pose a threat to American assets and interests in the region. Successful counterinsurgency operations in Pakistani cities can be the hammer to the military’s anvil in the tribal areas bordering Afghanistan, and help stabilize the volatile neighborhood.

KP Police’s potential progress on the urban counterinsurgency front is additionally a timely case study of indigenous, police-led operations with foreign support, but without foreign interference. The experience of KP province’s police forces can help shape local approaches towards similar
threats in numerous other flashpoints in the world — particularly the Middle East — and help nations to become self-reliant, if not self-sufficient, in tacking their internal threats.

To this end, the Pakistani federal and provincial governments must continue pledging monetary and political support to the police forces in the country — and learn from the successes of the KP Police, earned without political interference and with significant autonomy. The further professionalization and modernization of the KP Police forces must be followed by similar enhancements in other provincial police forces, in proportion to the threat paradigm in the particular provinces.

The various agencies making up Pakistan’s security establishment have already improved their relationship with KP Police. This trend should continue towards the institutionalization of interagency cooperation, preferably at a level where a federal level body for collaboration and cooperation — a Pakistani version of the Department of Homeland Security. Fortunately, the framework for such an institution exists; the National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA) has the mandate to take on such a unifying role, but has yet to deliver on its mission. Prioritizing NACTA and institutionalizing it within the federal government would significantly improve the odds for success against insurgency in the urban centers of Pakistan.

The international community — the United States in particular — should shift its focus away from the lethal element of the fight against the militancy, and focus instead on bolstering the country’s nonlethal capabilities in the realm of counterinsurgency. Greater training and investment in interagency collaboration, intelligence-gathering mechanisms, forensic investigation capabilities, psychological operations,
and strategic communications can all contribute towards the improvement of KP Police’s capacity, and in turn help in the efforts against the TTP insurgency.

The KP Police has come a long way since the early years of the post-9/11 era; it is a much more sophisticated and capable force, and the decrease of militant attacks are a testament to the force’s vast improvement. As the militant threat in Pakistan takes on an increasingly urban flavor, KP Police will need all the support and assistance possible from domestic and international players to augment its ranks and tackle the dynamic, evolving threat within its borders.

Hijab Shah is a second-year Security Studies Program student, concentrating on military operations and counterterrorism. Her interest in the field of security studies has been shaped by her experiences growing up in Peshawar, Pakistan, and Dhahran, Saudi Arabia. Prior to joining the Security Studies Program, Hijab worked at the Georgetown Asian Studies Program and the Center for Strategic and International Studies.
September 26 marked the first anniversary of the disappearance of 43 Mexican students in Ayotzinapa, Guerrero. The crime — which involved local authorities and drug cartels — sparked a wide and energetic response from society not only in Guerrero, but across the country and in the international arena as well. Not only was this an act linked to the drug war conflict in Mexico, it was also committed in collusion with the authorities themselves\(^1\) and it exposed the complex nature that violence has acquired since the launch of the “War against Drugs” during Felipe Calderón’s administration (2006-2012).

Historically, Mexico has proved highly vulnerable to penetration and corruption by powerful organized crime groups. This vulnerability stems from its lack of social capital, weak civic institutions,\(^2\) poor coordination between local, state, and federal authorities, and high levels of impunity. But although security has always been a concern among Mexican citizens, homicide rates had been gradually declining until 2007 when they experienced an exponential increase.

---


In 2010 the number of homicides doubled the 2006 rate. The majority of them were classified as ‘drug related killings.’ Thus, “violence was highly concentrated in key drug trafficking corridors, production zones and transshipment points”\(^3\) such as Ciudad Juárez, Tijuana, Chihuahua, Acapulco and Culiacán. What happened in Mexico as of 2007 shook the country’s collarbone. A death toll of 120,000,\(^4\) 27,000 disappearances, a 500% increase in cases of torture, tens of thousands displaced and a pervasive sense of fear and insecurity are some of the legacies of Mexico’s confrontation to the drug cartels.

In the midst of violence, however, “societies that suffer traumatic experiences can identify positive ways to respond, recover and rebuild”.\(^5\) The concept of community resilience\(^6\) was first introduced in Mexico as a part of the discussion that framed the implementation of the Merida Initiative.\(^7\) It refers to a society’s capacity to withstand and recover from adversity.

Ciudad Juárez, Chihuahua, has usually been identified as an example of successful resilience. As journalist Tracy Wilkinson reports, new graffiti now cover the streets. “Change depends on

---

\(^3\) Ibid., p. 4.
\(^4\) There has been a lot of debate around the violence statistics. In February, 2013 the Ministry of Interior, Miguel Ángel Osorio Chong, declared that he had knowledge of 70 thousand deaths. Official and international organizations assert that the death toll reached between 60 and 120 thousand respectively.
\(^6\) Community resilience implies a capacity for society to withstand and recover from hazards, stress and shocks. The notion of resilience has also been applied in reference to societies and communities recovering form economic crises, health epidemics, terrorism and natural —and human caused— disasters.
\(^7\) The Mérida Initiative is the security partnership between the U.S. and Mexico to fight organized crime. “Pilar IV of the Merida Initiative aims to address the social and economic factors contributing to the violence and seek to build strong and resilient communities that can withstand the pressures of crime and violence”.
you. A city can be something else,” read the new slogans.⁸ Although the reasons for this recovery still remain unclear, many analysts point to the intervention of the federal government in the area. After a shooting in Villas de Salvárcar where 15 people were killed, Calderón committed resources to the implementation of *Todos Somos Juárez*, a set of social, educational, and economic projects based in various neighborhoods of the city. One of the most successful parts of this program was the working tables called “Mesas de Seguridad” (Security Tables), which enabled civil society representatives, academics, and business people to engage in a dialogue with the government. It was also able to create specific mechanisms to monitor government actions. This, in turn, fostered citizen trust and encouraged them to report crimes.

The civic response that emerged in Juárez was hybrid and unique in the sense that it managed to merge the efforts from the government, private sector, and civic society. Its work resulted in a drop in crimes such as extortion, kidnapping, theft, and robberies and has, therefore, been portrayed as a successful example in Calderon’s battle against organized crime.

In the other extreme of the territory, the zone of Tierra Caliente, Michoacán dealt with a different type of communitarian response to violence. The state where the ‘War against Drugs’ was first launched witnessed the apparition of *autodefensas*: extralegal, local, and self-defense groups that used to appear in rural or indigenous communities in the south of Mexico. In the past years, however, such groups have grown exponentially across the country. According to the government,

---

14 new groups have formed since January 2013. Security analysts assert the number is higher.9

While Juárez was an example of a model of intervention (that is, it was an initiative promoted and implemented by the state), Michoacán’s self-defense groups emerged as a result of citizen frustration in communities “where the absence of effective law enforcement [led to] a reliance on informal means of justice.”10 In the former, the state engaged the civic society to tackle violence. In the latter, the society challenged the state. In both cases, however, we witnessed a communitarian response.

The self-defense groups base their efforts upon civil society participation, solidarity, and other values that survive in rural Mexico, such as family relations, friendship, and social trust among the inhabitants of a town.11 In the case of Juárez, most of its success can be explained by the fact that entrepreneurial, civilian, and government forces converged in the right direction. Both scenarios represent a social response to the failures of the state security strategy in ensuring peace and order in their communities.

What are the different types of community resilience that Mexico has experienced in the past years? What are the conditions that allow for an effective convergence of the state, private sector, and civic society? What, in contrast, promotes the appearance of self-defense groups? In the following pages I will trace the evolution of Mexico’s violence and some of the social responses that have emerged in response to it. I will use

---

the cases of Juárez and Tierra Caliente to highlight, first, the structural and circumstantial factors that made these cities particularly prone to violence and, second, the reasons behind such divergent outcomes (e.g., a reduction of violence thanks to a tripartite alliance of forces in Juárez, and the emergence of self-defense groups in Tierra Caliente).

Ayotzinapa is the latest evidence of the social and political decomposition that has been taking place in Mexico. It is also living proof that civic society is not dead in the country; nor is it indifferent to tragedy and convulsions. Understanding the mechanisms that can bolster or channel civic efforts to promote a change in Mexico is, therefore, imperative.

**Violence in Mexico**

*Historical tendencies of violence in Mexico*

Many analysts have tried to understand and explain the nature of the violence crisis that Mexico experienced as of 2009. Although insecurity has always concerned Mexican policy makers and citizens alike, the rise in homicide rates and other high-impact crimes during Felipe Calderón’s administration had no historical precedent. In order to assess its novelty, however, a brief review of Mexico’s security panorama is necessary.

According to David Shirk, Mexico’s security crisis is complex and deeply rooted in the country’s recent economic struggles and political development. Fernando Escalante’s historical analysis of homicide in Mexico confirms this assertion. Since the end of the 1970s and with minor variations,

---

12 Paula Martínez and Camila Ruiz, *art. cit.*
it had witnessed high levels of violence – between 15 and 20 homicides per 100,000 inhabitants. The 1970s economic fluctuations contributed to a rise in unemployment rates, which, in turn, resulted in significant spikes in criminal activity. It also coincided with a rise in U.S. drug consumption and counter-drug efforts in Colombia and the Gulf of Mexico.

The 1980s and 1990s saw the introduction of free market reforms that produced mixed results. One of their unintended consequences was that they pushed an important segment of the Mexican population to an expanding underground economy. If this criminal economy was able to grow the way it did, it was because well into the 1980s, many current top cartel operatives operated largely undisturbed and benefited from a highly permissive environment. The expansion of this black market and its associated violence, however, was territorially distributed and violence was displaced to some of the most populated cities in the north according to Escalante. In the rest of Mexico’s territory, as of 1992, homicide levels started to decrease systematically until they reached a historical minimum of 8.04 in 2007.

In 2008 this pattern was fiercely disrupted: the homicide rate doubled in this year and did the same in 2009. In other terms: in 2007 there were 8,867 homicides; in 2011, 27,199. The Mexican media incessantly repeated that one phenomenon served to explain this outburst in violence: drug trafficking.

---

13 Today, official estimates suggest that drug trafficking activities now account for 3 percent to 4 percent of Mexico’s more than $1 trillion GDP.
14 David Shirk, p. 9.
According to this view, the fragmentation of the cartels — which occurred as a result of Calderón’s frontal confrontation —\textsuperscript{17} led to a dispute between smaller and increasingly dispersed criminal organizations that fought for the control of routes and plazas.

Single-factor explanations, however, are not sufficient to explain Mexico’s violence. Drug trafficking has been a historical phenomenon in the country,\textsuperscript{18} and regardless of whatever small variations it might have experienced after Calderón’s strategy, it does not wholly explain what the country experienced as of 2008. All three authors speak of a convergence of factors that exposed Mexico’s institutional weakness and created, in Alejandro Hope’s words, the ‘perfect storm.’

It must be emphasized, however, that this outburst exposed some chronic conditions: Mexico’s security crisis is due not only to a lack of compliance with the law, but also to the failure

\textsuperscript{17} According to Eduardo Guerrero, Calderón’s policy fragmented the major criminal groups, which increased from six in 2006 to twelve in 2012. (See Eduardo Guerrero, “La raíz de la violencia”, Nexos, junio de 2011, available at: http://www.nexos.com.mx/?p=14318)

\textsuperscript{18} Enrique Krauze explains that drug trafficking in Mexico can be traced back to the end of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century. The Chinese workers that were hired to install the railroad line that would unite the north and south of the country, planted opium in the Sinaloa mountains. In 1918 the Sinaloa governor, Esteban Cantú, was the first politician to establish political links with the Chinese exporters. When the Prohibition in the U.S. came to an end, the Mexicans exterminated the Chinese competition in Sinaloa. By the 1950s the opium industry had become popular and extensive in the northern region of Mexico. In 1976, when President Richard Nixon declared the war on drugs, Mexican politicians and drug dealers became accomplices. This collusion was natural given the authoritarian nature of Mexico’s political system. During the 1980s, the \textit{cocaine boom} boosted the economic gains of drug trafficking in Latin American countries. Simultaneously, interdiction efforts directed from the U.S. (the South Florida Task) displaced the trafficking routes from the Caribbean to Central America. Mexico became an increasingly important link in the drug chain whose end destination was the lucrative market at its northern border. (See Enrique Krauze, “México: La tormenta perfecta”, Letras Libres, November 2012).
of the government to enforce the law faithfully, effectively, and fairly. The police sector in Mexico faces severe challenges that include rampant corruption, limited resources, and low professional standards.19

The weaknesses of Mexico’s criminal justice system also contribute to the extraordinarily high levels of criminal impunity and weak protections for the rights of the accused. As a result, Mexicans have little or no confidence at all in law enforcement officials: victimization surveys suggest that at most 25% of crimes are even reported and only two out of every hundred crimes result in a sentence. 20 In 2002, for example, the ICESI (Instituto Ciudadano de Estudios sobre la Inseguridad) talked about an impunity rate of 94%. When Calderón declared the war against organized crime, conditions were set for chaos.

Violence in the context of the ‘War on Drugs’

In December 2006, President Felipe Calderón launched the Operativo Conjunto Michoacán (OCC). The strategy included a massive deployment of federal forces, an increase in the number of official dependencies dealing with drug trafficking, more intense air and sea interdiction, and the decapitation of criminal organizations. These factors resulted, respectively, in the fragmentation of cartels, a rupture of the pre-established arrangements between local authorities and delinquent groups, a destabilizing effect between the state and drug trafficking

---

19 For a detailed analysis of the weaknesses in Mexico’s police sector, see Maureen Meyer, “Mexico’s Police. Many Reforms, Little Progress”, WOLA, May, 2014.
20 See David Shirk, art cit., p. 11 and David Shirk, Judicial Reform in Mexico. Change and Challenges in the Justice Sector, University of San Diego Trans-Border Institute, 2010, p. 5.
organizations (DTOs), and a lengthening of the land routes through Mexico. The decapitation policy, finally, induced violence through three channels: 1) creating a dispute inside the criminal band to gain control of it, 2) fomenting the rupture of middle intermediaries and the creation of new organizations, and 3) creating voids that were used by the rival groups. In sum, Calderón’s strategy aimed to break the major DTOs into smaller pieces. However, like Shirk asserts, smaller does not mean more manageable.21

What stands out about Mexico’s drug-related violence is the extent to which political change and counternarcotic efforts have actually intensified the competition among DTOs and the violent conflicts between them. In Escalante’s analysis, violence exploded in the states that witnessed joint operations. Eduardo Guerrero supports this thesis: under the name “Operation Safe,” Calderón’s security strategy was based on military deployment and it extended to seven states in just two years. Killings in those seven states increased by 325% between 2007 and 2009.22

The explanation is that criminals change their modus operandi when pressure is exerted upon them: they adopt predatory strategies, increase their aggressiveness, extend their zones of influence, attack security agents, and kill each other. This is the case of Ciudad Juárez where the Operativo Conjunto Chihuahua (OCC) was implemented on March 28, 2007. The year before the operation, the national homicide rate had been 19.6 per every 100,000 inhabitants; in 2007 it was 14.4; in 2008, 75.2; and in 2009, 108.5. Michoacán also follows this

---

pattern: the year after the joint operation homicide rates increased all over the state.

Alejandro Hope is one of the few observers who has added an international explanation to the national dynamics that account for Mexico’s violence. Under Álvaro Uribe’s administration, Colombia implemented a new anti-drug approach. In 2006 it moved from eradication of coca plantations to interdiction strategies that resulted in a 60% increase in seizures. Consequently, there was a rise in cocaine prices in the U.S., the principal market (between the first trimester of 2007 and the fourth trimester of 2008 the price of cocaine doubled according to the Drug Enforcement Agency).

As the cocaine market was becoming more profitable than ever, the arms were becoming cheaper. In 2004, the U.S. eliminated the Federal Assault Weapons Ban, which resulted in an increase in the availability and use of high-caliber weapons in Mexico, particularly in border communities.23 Furthermore, in 2010, 68% of crimes in Mexico were perpetrated with fire weapons; in 2002, it was 44%.

At the same time, the risk of trafficking drugs through the territory increased as the security at the border between Mexico and the US was tightened. Criminal extraditions from the US to Mexico also increased in this period: from 2002 to 2008 the number of ex-convicts extradited rose 35%. All in all, the drug market was more attractive as the prices rose due to a supply

---
shock that derived from Colombia’s new strategy. Simultaneously, the risks associated with trafficking drugs increased because of the intensification in border security, as criminal organizations also increased their offensive power.

**The effects of violence in Mexican society**

The scale of violence in Mexico is difficult to measure: official statistics talk about 70,000 killed, 27,000 disappeared, 250,000 displaced and 8,000 orphaned. Furthermore, since 2007, mass killings, torture, dismemberment, disappeared persons, extortion, and kidnapping have all become too commonplace. In addition, during recent years, journalists have been particularly threatened. Seventy-six journalists were murdered or disappeared in the last six years, which made of Mexico one of the world’s most dangerous places for the exercise of this profession.

A side effect that has been undermined is the impact on the mental health of victims and communities at large. More specifically, the violence associated with the drug war has contributed to a pervasive sense of fear and insecurity. This, in turn, has put millions of Mexican citizens at risk of developing post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). According to Mauricio Meschoulam, the prevalence of PTSD is now not exclusively found in Mexico’s most violent municipalities. People’s stress

---

levels are directly proportional to their exposure to the mass media. In Meschoulam’s research, based on a sample of 333 people from 15 Mexican states, 51% of interviewees said violence affected their work life; 72%, their social life and 58%, their family life; 42% asserted violence had an impact on their economic status and 60% reported it had influenced their mental health. All these numbers might serve as a very superficial glimpse of what Mexican society has been facing in recent years and the reasons behind their mobilization.

**Community Resilience in the Wake of Violence**

*The concept of community resilience*

Marcus Keck and Patrick Sakdalpolrak define social resilience as comprising three dimensions: *coping capacities* – the ability of social actors to cope with and overcome all kinds of adversities; *adaptive capacities* – their ability to learn from past experiences and adjust themselves to future challenges; and *transformative capacities* – their ability to craft sets of institutions that foster individual welfare and sustainable societal robustness towards future crises.28

As promising as it may sound, the concept of social resilience should not be overemphasized. As Lorenz has pointed out, the ability to cope with, adapt to, and transform in response to external threats does not entirely depend on people’s willingness or ability to do so. It is also “a question involving those societal factors that both facilitate and constrain

---

people’s abilities to access assets, to gain capabilities for learning, and to become part of the decision-making process.”

As we will see in the following pages, the cases of Michoacán and Ciudad Juárez both point to the importance of institutions as mediators between social discomfort and effective political actions. The behavior of these institutions must reflect local particularities and engage citizens in order to strengthen trust within a society. This is something that is lacking in Mexico.

In 1995, for example, the Mexican government passed the National Security Law. In it, the government stipulated that the “authorities will establish efficient mechanisms so society may participate in the planning and supervision of public security.” This law, in Dudley’s diagnosis, failed to promote citizen participation. Few if any “security councils” functioned properly, which forced citizens to resort to a combination of non-governmental forces, business organizations, and public displays of dissatisfaction.

Citizen participation is not a strong concept in Mexico. The country’s post-revolutionary history is an important factor to understand this. The predominant political party that governed uninterruptedly between 1946 and 2000 transformed the participation of large sectors of civil society into state institutions. It was not until the 1960s that independent social organizations started to emerge. They were met with repression and others were unable to consolidate. However, they formed the historical basis of civil society organization in the country.

Its development and consolidation was deepened during the 1980s. First, with the 1980s economic crisis and the 1985 earthquake that fostered new ways of mobilization and social ties. Then, with the 1988 elections that, deemed with fraudulent activity, mobilized society around political rights and democracy.

Despite its recent evolution, however, civic participation in Mexico is relatively weak compared to other countries. Robust civil society sectors in the United States and in other Latin American nations such as Chile boast about 20 times more civic organizations per capita than Mexico.

In the midst of the War on Drugs and having experienced the shortcomings of Calderón’s security strategy, the US government along with the Mexican government started to emphasize the social dimension of violence in Mexico. In other words, more attention was put in the possibility that civic engagement could reduce violence. This awareness resulted in a subtle but meaningful change in the destination of the Merida Initiative resources and also in its rhetoric.

**Community resilience in the Merida Initiative**

In March 2007, at their first summit meeting in Merida, President Felipe Calderon asked President George W. Bush to support Mexican efforts to combat drug related crime. The Merida Initiative emerged from this meeting and the US appropriated $1.4 billion over the next two fiscal years. In its second phase, the Merida Initiative moved from an emphasis in transfers of equipment and technical assistance, and the support
of public officials,\textsuperscript{32} to building resilient communities that could resist the pressure of crime and violence.

Elaborated in October 2009, both governments announced the second phase in early 2010. Broader than the original Merida Initiative, ‘Beyond Merida’ proposes four categories: disrupting and dismantling criminal organizations, strengthening state institutions, developing a ‘smart border’ with the US, and addressing the social and economic factors contributing to violence. Within the latter, Pillar IV, in particular, “seeks to build strong and resilient communities that can withstand the pressure of crime and violence.”\textsuperscript{33}

The actions considered in this Pillar are aimed at providing youth with alternatives to criminal activities, catalyzing Mexican efforts to scale up programs that work, and introducing rigorous monitoring and evaluation processes. In Diana Negroponte’s words, “Pilar IV addresses a fundamental aspect of Mexico’s transition to a fuller and more sustainable democracy, namely giving greater voice to citizens as they confront local challenges to their security and wellbeing.”\textsuperscript{34} In sum, Pilar IV emphasized the involvement of citizens in the decision-making process, a component that Lorenz identifies as crucial in building social resilience. We will now explore the

\textsuperscript{32} The exact objectives of the Mérida Initiative in this phase were: dismantle the transnational criminal groups that operate in both territories; strengthen the air, land and sea controls; improve the institutional and judiciary capacities in the region; diminish local gang activity and drug demand. (See Armando Rodríguez Luna, “El combate al crimen organizado y la Iniciativa Mérida” in Raúl Benítez Manaut (coord.), Seguridad y defensa en América del Norte: Nuevos dilemas geopolíticos, Washington, Woodrow Wilson, International Center for Scholars, April 2010, p. 267).


\textsuperscript{34} Ibid., p. 5.
actual reality of this theoretical concept in the cases of Juárez and Michoacán.

The Case of Ciudad Juárez

Violence in Juárez

In 2010 Ciudad Juárez (with a population just over one million) had more than 2,700 homicides; that is more than the combined annual totals for New York (532), Chicago (435), Philadelphia (304), Los Angeles (297), Washington D.C. (131), and Miami-Dade (84). From 2007 through 2013 almost 11,000 people were killed in Juárez.

This context of violence is exacerbated by the lack of citizen trust in law enforcement officials and judiciary institutions: according to the Survey of Citizen Perception on Insecurity in Ciudad Juárez, between 88 and 93% of the residents (18 years or older) have no or little confidence in the institutions and security corporations. This explains why 62% of the crimes in Juárez are not denounced. The main reasons are that citizens do not trust the authorities (39.5%), they consider the denouncing process a waste of time (37.4%), or they fear retaliation (16%).

As a border city, Juárez has a strategic significance in the drug trafficking corridor that extends from the south of Mexico’s territory and ends in the United States. Some of the factors that make Juárez appealing to legitimate business have also made it strategic to the operation of illicit actors. The mass movements of people and cargo across the borders, for

35 David Shirk, op. cit., p. 8.
example, allow for camouflage of illicit goods moving north.\textsuperscript{37} But there are other factors, besides the drug trade, that help to account for Juárez’s violence. In fact, the 2007 violence crisis only exposed a process that had long been under way: social deterioration, the conditions of abandonment, and the context of violence in which thousands of children and young kids had lived as well as the vulnerability of large segments of the population.

Since the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, Ciudad Juárez has attracted migration fluxes from various regions of the country, but by the mid-twentieth century, this condition was reinforced by the implementation of the Bracero Program in the US (1942-1964) and, later, by the expansion of the textile factory at the border (1965). This resulted in a process of demographic expansion in the region (from 1990 to 2000 it had an average rate of population growth of 4.3% compared to a national rate of 1.8%) that was not accompanied by a growth in social and urban infrastructure. At the same time, Juárez’s economy became highly linked to the economic world fluctuations. Between 1999 and 2004, the economic activity of Juárez relative to the state of Chihuahua, represented a little more than 50% of the state’s economy. But in 2000 the textile industry stalled and this caused a crisis of unemployment.

In words of Myrna Limas, Juárez suffers from a historical abandonment from the federal government and the Juarenses have suffered an enormous pressure for the lack of basic infrastructure, constant migration to the city, and the lack of an

\textsuperscript{37} Since the 1980s Juárez, the Carrillo Fuentes organization (also known as the Juárez Cartel) used comercial, governmental and private aircraft to make of Juárez a key transit point for cocaine from South America to cross into the U.S. (See Steven Dudley and Sandra Rodriguez, Civil Society, the Government and the Development of Citizen Security, Working Paper Series on Civic Engagement and Public Security in Mexico, August 2013).
economic policy that is capable of creating jobs beyond the textile industry (whose success is closely linked to the US economy). It also suffers from its geographic position: its shared border with the US makes it a strategic point for the activities of criminal organizations.

All these historical and structural factors intertwined with Calderón’s administration and made Juárez the most violent city in the world. According to Steven Dudley, beginning in 2008, a battle erupted between the Juárez Cartel and the Sinaloa Cartel to move large loads of cocaine across the border. On the local level, they were also trying to control the drug, extortion, and kidnapping market, all of which served to finance the gangs who were used as soldiers in the battles.

In this same year, in March 2008, Calderón launched the Operativo Conjunto Chihuahua against criminality and organized crime that consisted of the deployment of 2,026 soldiers in the state, delivery of technical equipment, and polygraph tests to deal with corruption in state and municipal police forces. By 2009 and due to the rise in executions, kidnaps, and extortions, the number of soldiers was raised to 7,000.

In the first two years of the operation, there were hundreds of complaints of human rights violations, and in 2010 the federal government decided to reframe the strategy. First, it changed its name to Operación Coordinada Chihuahua and it announced the exit of the federal troops (which were substituted with federal police) in order to change the emphasis to homicides, kidnappings, and extortions. In parallel, it destined a significant amount of resources to the strategy Todos Somos Juárez, highlighting the need to restore the social tissue of the city. The result was a dramatic downfall in homicide levels (as seen in the graph below).
Even if there were a lot of factors in play, *Todos Somos Juárez* became one of the few emblematic ‘successes’ of Calderón’s administration. In order to assess its effectiveness, a brief account of Chihuahua’s civic core is necessary since citizens played a major role in the implementation of this particular strategy.


**Chihuahua’s civic society**

Although there is no clear consensus on the date in which Mexico became a democracy, there is no doubt that the local elections of 1983 in the state of Chihuahua were a watershed in the country’s history. That year, the center-right party PAN (Partido Acción Nacional) defeated the official regime represented by the PRI (Partido Revolucionario Institucional) by winning 11 municipalities, including Ciudad Juárez. This particular event is not completely unrelated to Juárez’s response to violence. According to Lorenzo Meyer, the 1982 economic
crisis (which represented the terminal phase of Mexico’s economic model thus far) was particularly harsh on the frontier states, particularly Juárez. The PAN was able to build support by channeling social unrest in the state. It did so by launching a campaign that sought direct contact with the citizen. According to Tonatiuh Guillén, the challenge in Chihuahua consisted in creating and stimulating a social force that could defy the authoritarian regime. The aperture of the political space in Chihuahua by the mid 80s also meant the exercise of a real citizenship. They could not be independent processes.

The same social unrest that resulted from the economic crisis of 1982 and the failure of the textile model in Juárez also triggered a severe crisis of insecurity in the state, reflected primarily in a shocking pattern of femicides. By 2002, the divergent figures totaled 254 from Casa Amiga, 258 from the Chihuahua State Attorney General’s Office, and 320 from the El Paso Times. This explains why in the late 1990s, NGOs emerged among victims’ families and women’s and human rights activists. Some were even bi-national initiatives that joined efforts in the US and Mexico. The bi-national initiatives should not surprise anyone: according to Staudt, the border runs through the combined metropolitan area of Juarez-El Paso, complicating accountability relationships between people, victims, victims’ families, and government. The trust problem between citizens and police, thus, is aggravated in

---

38 For an explanation of Chihuaua as a catalyst of Mexican democracy see Lorenzo Meyer, “Prologue”, in Alberto Aziz, Chihuahua: historia de una alternative, Mexico, CIESAS, 1994, pp. 7-15.
Juárez and in the state of Chihuahua in general according to Staudt.

From the previous analysis, two factors must be emphasized: on the one hand, Juárez geographic situation made it particularly vulnerable to violence. The city was a ‘boom town’ whose industrial activity served as a magnet to attract migrants and it became the headquarters of the Carrillo Fuentes cartel and became a major traffic corridor due to its strategic vicinity to the US. On the other hand, it also became a focal point in Mexico’s transition to democracy because of the same reason: having been particular vulnerable to the effects of the economic crisis of 1982 and the failure of Mexico’s economic model, the entrepreneurial class became a relevant and political actor. The 1983 elections created a social force that was distinguished by its capacity to engage individuals as citizens. The security crisis in the state mobilized an already politicized and active citizenry that was willing to engage in collective actions to demand concrete solutions.

*Todos Somos Juárez*

When violence reached unprecedented levels in 2008, civil groups began clamoring for more security. Dudley explains that they organized around their professions and their industry (the most active being the business sector). However, up to 2010, very little was achieved despite the various groups that mobilized. The reason was simple: the groups were poorly coordinated and did not have the support of the federal government. This changed in 2010 due to an unfortunate tragedy in Villas de Salvárcar.

On January 31, 2010 a local party was interrupted by gunmen who shot and killed 15 people. Calderón, who was abroad at the time, publicly accused the young men of being
part of a criminal organization. In early February, when the President visited Juárez, a mother of one of the victims confronted him and told him he was not welcome in the city. The federal government then committed significant resources to the city. The result was an initiative called *Todos Somos Juárez* or *We Are All Juárez*.

With a budget of 6 billion pesos, the project was launched around 168 actions that promoted citizen participation. Its objective was to “break the vicious circle of insecurity by providing social and economic opportunities to the population, reconstruct the social fabric, and lower the prevalence of anti social behavior in the city.”

The essence of the strategy was the so-called *Mesas*, or working groups in which members of the business community, civil society, trade unions, youth, and interested parents and citizens gathered to discuss 15 themes including housing, health, education, culture, sports, security, poverty, and employment. From these discussions came firm commitments and the identification of persons responsible for implementing and supervising the projects.

At the center of the tables were businessmen, academics, professional associations, human rights lawyers, and civic groups. The motives behind their involvement varied. Some of them were moved by an economic rationale. “We got involved in the issue because we thought that there would be no development without security,” Juárez businessman Jorge Contreras explained. Others joined for personal reasons: their

---

42 Diana Negroponte, *art. cit.*
relatives or colleagues were victims of kidnapping and extortion and their professional space was violated constantly.\textsuperscript{43} All in all the citizens of Juárez played a critical role in the design, implementation, and follow-up of the plan.\textsuperscript{44} The base of the program itself was the citizen participation since “the Juarenses [were] the ones who know their city best and can do more to alleviate the situation that afflicts them”.\textsuperscript{45}

Distribution of the Budget in \textit{Todos Somos Juárez}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Policy Area</th>
<th>Number of actions</th>
<th>Budget 2010 (in millions of pesos)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education, culture and sports</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social development</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>3,383</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: \textit{Todos Somos Juárez}, 2010

Citizen participation was also enhanced by a close collaboration between the federal, state and municipal governments in the implementation of the 168 programs. A working plan was


\textsuperscript{44} Diana Negroponte, \textit{art. cit.}, p. 7

\textsuperscript{45} No author, \textit{Estrategia Todos Somos Juárez}, Mexico’s Federal Government, 2010, p. 3.
developed that outlined the commitment, the objectives to be carried out within 100 days, and a timeline for completion. The process was structured and funds identified to permit non-governmental organizations (NGOs) to carry out specific programs. In Negroponte’s words, “the concept was excellent and the degree of transparency in determining progress or lack thereof was remarkable.”

However, during the course of 2010 *Todos Somos Juárez* gradually lost its luster. On December 31, 2010 an assessment of the 168 programs was due but never materialized. Furthermore, President’s Calderón office admits that only a small percentage of the numerical grading of schools, roads paved, etc., is available. The failure to complete all projects within the timeframe is explained by the rushed effort to coordinate multiple programs, the overall broad and ambitious nature of the project, the elections and change of government in the course of 2010, as well as the slow disbursement of the federal funds.

*Assessing Juárez’s success*

*Todos Somos Juárez* was a bold and new idea that asked the citizens of Juárez for their analysis of the problems and their suggestions for concrete responses. Two factors can be identified as key elements of success in this case: the involvement of ordinary citizens in the diagnosis and elaboration of a strategy and the coordination between the

---

federal, state, and municipal governments in the implementation of the 168 programs.  

The process, more than the substance of the programs, is what was needed to change the attitude of citizens towards their government. Citizen participation in *Todos Somos Juárez* introduced a degree of transparency in the development and oversight of the programs. The intent was to develop incipient trust both in the federal and local governments. As one citizen of Juárez expressed: “Fear is like the flu: it’s contagious. But so is hope”.  

The tables engendered informal contact and better relations with regards to specific criminal activity. The interaction between the members of the tables and the security forces was regular; the citizens managed the meetings, controlled the agenda, and discussed crime indicators to establish particular agreements with the authorities. In many cases, the Mesas served as intermediaries between the security forces and the victims. The latter did not trust the former, but they did trust the table members.

Perhaps the most important contribution of *Todos Somos Juárez* was the regular interaction between government and civil society. There was also the resolution of specific cases, especially kidnapping and extortion cases. These positive results have given other Juárez businesses more confidence to go to the security forces with their problems, leading to more

---

47 A symbolic evidence of this is that the program was announced by the governor of Chihuahua, José Reyes Baeza; the major of Juárez, José Reyes Ferriz, and the President of Mexico, Felipe Calderón.

48 Quoted in Tracy Wilkinson, *art. cit.*

49 In order to facilitate their work, the table was broken down into 14 committees: crime indicators, public trust, Emergency Response Center, car theft, kidnapping and extortion, to name a few. The committees met monthly.
arrests and greater security. In the words of Arturo Valenzuela, “in Juárez, just as the Berlin Wall fell, Mexicans dissolved the huge wall that existed between society and government, and we sat at a table for the first time [...] Then others, who were scattered about, joined, and trust was built, and a team was formed.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of the population willing to organize themselves in actions of social prevention. Ciudad Juárez, 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Yes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>No</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does not know</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Encuesta de Percepción Ciudadana sobre Inseguridad en Ciudad Juárez, 2011

**The Case of Michoacán**

In the beginning of 2014, official authorities talked about various groups in conflict in the state of Michoacán: the Jalisco’s cartel *Nueva Generación*, the *Knight Templars* (KT), state and municipal police, the army, self-defense groups and a group of citizens that armed themselves to confront the latter. In this scenario, according to Carlos Dorantes, the state is only one among many other actors. In other words, the situation that unfolded in Michoacán as of January 2014 is the most complex

---


51 Ibid., p. 72.
since the security crisis worsened in the context of the War on Drugs. As in the case of Juárez, Calderón’s strategy worsened a process of social deterioration that was already underway.

In this case, self-defense groups emerged in tandem with the failures of the government’s security strategy. These militia groups replaced the municipality police and quickly evolved in the state’s zone known, ironically, as Tierra Caliente (Hot Land). Its members have different backgrounds, motives, and interests but they all joined to combat the presence of the KT. The groups quickly took control of various towns, expelling the drug cartel from urban areas and forcing local government officials from office.

Self-defense groups have a long history in Mexico but they have usually dealt with petty crimes in indigenous communities. These efforts are considered legal and legitimate by the constitution. What was surprising about Michoacán’s phenomenon, however, was the size that the groups reached. As in the case of Juárez, community leaders, farmers and business elites joined forces to fight crime. Also similar was the legitimacy that the strategy enjoyed within the community. In the end, the essence of community police is to ensure safety where other authorities have failed to do so, and in so doing they represent a social response to the failures of the state security agency in ensuring peace and order in their communities.

Violence in Michoacán

The state of Michoacán represents 3% of Mexico’s territory, 4% of its population and 2% of its national GDP. It has, therefore, played an important role in the country’s political and social history. Its very specific geographical features are also important when explaining its violence. Michoacán is
mountainous, making it difficult to ensure law and order. Consequently, it is divided in 113 municipalities, a relatively high number in a country of 2,457 municipalities. Its access to the sea and its various connections to important population centers make Michoacán an important transit point for the local market and international export. As in the case of Juárez, the same factors that made it apt for commercial, legitimate business also made it prone to become an important transit point for the drug trade. Historical sources suggest that drug cultivation probably became widespread since the 19th century. But with the emergence of transnational agriculture and the development of infrastructure, drug trafficking grew side by side with commercial activities as regional political power also expanded. Ever since, drug trafficking has had profoundly rural connotations. As Aguirre and Herrera explain, the *Knights Templar* concern themselves with commercial functions, judicial matters, and social gatherings, functions that should be regulated by state institutions.

**Homicide Rates Per 100 Thousand Inhabitants in Michoacán (2000-2013)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>National Rate</th>
<th>Michoacán’s rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>13.73</td>
<td>11.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>13.57</td>
<td>11.37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

52 Tierra Caliente is Mexico’s second producer of limes and the primary produced or avocados. Trade with Asia has also turned the port of Lázaro Cárdenas one of the most important tones in the country. (See Dudley Althaus and Steven Dudley, “Mexico’s Security Dilemma: Michoacán’s Militias. The Rise of Vigilantism in Mexico and its Implications Going Forward”, Wilson Center-Insight Crime Working Papers, 2010, p. 4).
Like Juárez, Michoacán, and especially Tierra Caliente, has suffered from federal abandonment. It has become a “region that due to its isolation from well-trodden roads has been nicknamed the ‘abyss of the globe’”\(^5\) In this scenario the *Knights Templar* have filled the chronic vacuums of authority in the three levels of government.

Given this set of structural conditions, only two weeks after assuming the presidency Calderón launched the *Operación Conjunta Michoacán* (OCM). Over 7,000 elements from different police and military groups were sent to patrol the state, especially its southern regions. Although the immediate results were impressive, human rights violations also increased dramatically. Mexico’s National Human Rights Commission asserts that from December 1, 2006 to May 17, 2008, 634

---

complaints were filed against soldiers in Michoacán; in 2008, reports of torture had also increased by 300%.

Just like in Juárez, a tragedy shook the state and changed its path in terms of social responses to violence. On September 15, 2008, in Morelia (the capital) grenades were flung into a crowd celebrating Mexico’s independence. Three civilians were killed and 111 injured. According to Maldonado, this attack on the civilian population changed the logic of the war between the state and traffickers and convinced federal authorities that the government of Michoacán had ties to the drug cartels. In this context of generalized distrust a communitarian response emerged with surprising force: the autodefensas.

Michoacán’s civic core

Community self-defense groups are security corps composed of citizens working in their specific regions according to traditional rules and often recovering indigenous customs. These groups base their efforts upon civil society participation, solidarity, and other values that survive in rural Mexico, such as family relations, friendship, and social trust among the inhabitants of a town or region. The expansion of community groups is both old and new – these groups integrate romantic notions of justice with the more modern concept that society must participate in the fight against organized crime. According to Jaime Hernández and Mauricio Merino, these two opposing dimensions are harmonized in the wake of an ineffective security policy, forcing society to reach beyond public protest so as to organize community police groups.56

In the case of Michoacán, in the 1930s, President Lázaro Cárdenas converted the Apatzingán valley into a collective farming system that, according to Dudley, gave birth to a politicized rural population in Tierra Caliente. Not only was it politicized, it also had specific sociological characteristics. As Salvador Maldonado explains, in Michoacán the ranchero culture—characterized by individualism, opposition to government, valuing the family above society, and an extreme form of popular Catholicism—gives the drug trade much of its identity. Rancheros see themselves as a sector that lives on the margins of the state because they rarely see their benefits but suffer the partiality of its laws.\textsuperscript{57} This explanation is useful to understand the nature of the autodefensas that emerged as a marginal force to the state and also claimed to be able to perform the duties that the latter had failed to do, particularly ensure order.

As Dorantes explains, if there is no security organization on the macro level, trust is transferred to the immediate community. In other words, the absence of state authority and the lack of trust in political parties, police, or institutions create the conditions in which a new form of leadership is prone to emerge. This leadership is based on trust, the same component that lacks between citizens and authorities. In Michoacán, the consequence of this dynamic was the formation of small conflicts between groups that organized themselves at the communitarian level to fight the organized crime. However, once they reached a certain level of autonomy, the trust problem emerged again and new conflicts arose between these groups and organized citizens, local, and federal authorities and the army.

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
The future of Michoacán

In May 2014, new rules imposed by Mexico’s federal government were put in place to regularize the *autodefensas* into a uniformed police force called the Fuerza Rural and ban ordinary citizens from carrying machine guns. Throughout June, however, armed citizens continued to carry out operations in Michoacán.

Although in theory, Mexico’s federal government replaced the ad hoc agglomeration of *autodefensas* fighters with a formal and unified police force, in practice, the new unit has not been set up in many parts of the state due to the explosion of violence in other parts of Mexico’s territory and the geographical conditions of the state that were explained earlier. This, in turn, strengthens and legitimizes the *autodefensas* movement. “The government doesn’t act while Michoacán remains in flame,” complained José Manuel Mireles, the most emblematic leader of this movement. 58 He stated that the federal government had only created rural defense units in two municipalities with 34 remaining for the vigilantes to protect. 59

Just like in Juárez, the federal government tried to deploy resources that would boost local efforts that were already underway. However, in the case of Michoacán, self-defense groups challenged the legitimacy of the state because in a small period of time, they were able to combat organized crime more efficiently than the federal government had. The more successful the *autodefensas* were, the more it challenged Calderón’s security strategy and the legitimacy of the state

---

itself. Current moves to legalize Michoacán’s self-defense forces, therefore, have exacerbated tensions in the movement’s leadership by creating a clear dividing line between those involved in the new Rural Defense forces and those left in the outside.

As the story unfolds, a number of questions remain unsolved. Among the most important of these is how self-defense groups fit into the struggle against large criminal organizations. On the local and state level, particularly, the state has proved incapable of protecting its citizens. In this context it is likely that more self-defense groups will emerge in the future. Yet, Michoacán has not provided further understanding of what is or should be the role of militias or how they can be incorporated in the national effort to combat organized crime and violence.

Conclusion

The security policy of the Calderón government produced a maelstrom of violence, a growing lack of confidence in the state’s ability to confront it, and a new social awareness of the need to react to the fragmentation, diversification, and impunity of organized crime by using one’s own resources.60

This awareness, however, had very different expressions across the country. In Juárez, citizens mobilized around a common agenda that comprised the interests of civic society, the business sector, and the state and federal government. Chihuahua’s civil society, as one of the most active in Mexico, explains why the citizens of Juárez started to mobilize and demand a change even before the government intervened.

60 Jaime Hernández and Mauricio Merino, art. cit., p. 150.
However, the tragedy of Villas de Salvárcar served as a cruel catalyzer of the federal involvement in the city. The resources were held with a high degree of transparency and served to foster the trust between the citizens and the authorities. The coordination between all three levels of government was also noteworthy. All in all, it was the process more than the actual results of *Todos Somos Juárez* (which were more visible in the realm of kidnapping and extortion) that sparked a new sense of change in the city. The regular meetings between the civic society and the government and the active participation of the citizens in the design, implementation, and follow-up of the strategy promoted a renewed sense of trust that, in turn, resulted in more denouncements.

In Michoacán, there is also an active and politicized citizen that is rural in essence, just like the drug trade is in this region of the country. Self-defense forces are built upon values such as solidarity and close family ties. They are also evidence of a historic way of viewing the state as a separate entity. The self-defense groups that emerged in this region, therefore, are also an expression of civic participation. Michoacán’s self-defense experiment, in fact, has illustrated that criminal organizations can be dismantled quickly with a strong, functional alliance between community and government. However, without a clear legal framework and definition of roles, there is little guarantee that the job will not remain half-finished.

In both cases, Calderón’s security strategy completely altered a picture of social deterioration that was chronic and even structural. A lack of diagnosis from the federal government failed to acknowledge that municipal police and local dynamics, while weak, are also essential in any effort that aims to foster citizen trust and sustainable peace.

Both Juárez and Tierra Caliente suffer from a chronic abandonment of the federal government that has generated high
levels of mistrust to the authority. In the former, a mechanism like the *Mesas* was able to channel mistrust and discomfort through effective mediation channels. In Michoacán, the mediation forces were autonomous and had a strong logic of their own. The initial federal effort to make them part of an institutional structure, therefore, failed almost immediately.

Civil society organizations are strongest when they combine various sectors of society, stretch across political parties, and have solid, independent voices.\(^{61}\) Local authorities are the key to more security, but civil society actors need the support of federal level politicians to achieve the highest levels of interaction and effectiveness. Institutions are also key in building social resilience that will help communities not only withstand adversity but also recover from its damage.

*Marcela Valdivia Correa is a Masters of Science in Foreign Service student with a concentration in Global Politics and Security. She is a Fulbright scholar and fellow at the Institute for the Study of Diplomacy of Georgetown. Her research has focused on security issues and humanitarian crises in Mexico and the Caribbean.*

Kenya’s 9/11: The Effects of the Garissa University College Attack on Kenyan Counterterrorism Policy

Jacob Goldstein

This paper will aim to analyze the counterterrorism efforts of the Kenyan government in the aftermath of the al-Shabaab attack on the Garissa University College in April 2015. The Garissa attack has been dubbed “Kenya's 9/11” and is already beginning to frame Kenyan attitudes towards security. Kenya is a critical US partner in East Africa and the largest recipient of US security assistance outside of the Middle East. As a result, how Kenya handles this pivotal point in its history is key to US interests in East Africa. The government's post-Garissa policies have been mixed. They have included reactionary tactics, such as increasing the power of domestic security agencies and restricting the civil liberties of Kenyan Muslims. However, Kenya also has offered amnesty to citizens in Somalia who want to return home and appears to be committed to combating the causes of radicalism, especially youth unemployment, as well as corruption among its security forces. As a result, the paper finds reason for cautious optimism that Kenya will be able to successfully mitigate the effects of al-Shabaab's terrorist campaign.

On April 2, 2015, four armed men entered the Garissa University College Campus and took close to 800 students hostage. The attackers allowed those who were able to quote
verses from the Quran to go free, while 147 other students were killed by the time Kenyan authorities arrived on the scene hours later.¹ The Somalia-based terrorist group al-Shabaab would later claim responsibility for the attack. According to the Kenyan government, the mastermind of the attack was Mohamed Kuno, a Somali immigrant who had been living in Kenya since at least 2006.²

The attack on Garissa is the largest operation carried out by al-Shabaab in Kenya to date. Al-Shabaab has engaged in a systematic campaign of attacks on Kenyan civilian and military targets that intensified due to the deployment of Kenyan troops to Somalia in 2011 in an attempt to stabilize the country. According to survivors of Garissa, one gunman ordered them to “tell your President to withdraw the KDF from Somalia and ensure that the North Eastern [province] belongs to Muslims.”³

While the Garissa attack is not the first terrorist attack carried out by al-Shabaab in Kenya, its impact has been the greatest. Kenya's Deputy President William Ruto called the attack “Kenya's 9/11” in terms of the magnitude of the effect that Garissa had on the psyche of the Kenyan people.⁴ The fact

that those killed were students only added to the emotional impact of the terrorist attack. Additionally, the fact that al-Shabaab specifically targeted non-Muslims adds an explicitly religious and ethnic dimension to attack's message. More than 11% of Kenya’s 45 million citizens are Muslim.\(^5\) Additionally, Kenya is home to nearly 463,000 Somali refugees, though this number is likely far higher due to difficulties in accurate data collection.\(^6\)

The aim of this paper is to examine the effects of the Garissa attack on Kenyan counterterrorism policy. Kenya is a lynchpin of US policy in East Africa. The country hosts a military base from which the US supports the African Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM).\(^7\) Kenya is one of the largest recipient of US foreign aid outside the Middle East.\(^8\) As a result, the US has a vested interest in ensuring that the Kenyan government's response to the Garissa attack is effective. This paper will provide an overview of recent Kenyan counterterrorism policy, the impact of the Garissa attack on these policies, and will conclude with policy recommendations for both Kenya and the US going forwards.

Recent History of Kenyan Counterterrorism Policy

Kenya's first brush with radical Islamic inspired terrorism came in 1998 when the US Embassy in Nairobi was bombed by al-Qaeda. Though the target of the attack was the US Embassy, over 200 Kenyans were killed. 9 While the highest-profile response to the embassy bombing was US missile strikes in Afghanistan and Sudan, the attack highlighted terrorism as a major threat to Kenyan security.10 In 1999, the US Congress approved $37 million in supplemental aid to Kenya to assist with recovery from the bombing.11 This transaction marked the beginning of a long relationship between the two countries on security matters. Kenya was soon after added to the Department of State's Anti-Terrorism Assistance (ATA) Program, which formalized the US-Kenya counterterrorism relationship.12 The ATA did not immediately result in more security funding for Kenya, but rather established a mechanism by which US personnel could train Kenyan security forces.13 On the Kenyan side, the 1998 bombing spurred a reorganization of the intelligence apparatus and the creation of the National Security

Intelligence Service (NSIS) in order to better coordinate the government's response to terrorism.¹⁴

9/11 renewed US interest in Kenya's potential to act as a regional security partner. The next major development in Kenyan counterterrorism policy was inexorably linked to the US-led War on Terror. In 2003, the Kenyan government introduced the Suppression of Terrorism Bill in order to criminalize acts of terrorism and give law enforcement more tools to preempt violent extremism.¹⁵ Civil society and civil rights groups immediately criticized the bill as draconian.¹⁶ For example, the bill’s definition of terrorism encompassed actions “designed to influence the government or to intimidate the public or a section of the public,” a phrase so broad that it could have been used to prosecute strikers.¹⁷ The proposed legislation also called from a reduced burden of evidence required to detain a suspect, denial of the right to legal representation during interrogation, and lowered barriers for the government to extradite suspects.¹⁸ Most odiously, the bill would have allowed authorities to count the wearing of certain types of Muslim clothing as grounds for suspicion.¹⁹

The Kenyan Parliament eventually rejected the Suppression of Terrorism Bill in the face of overwhelming domestic demand.

---

opposition. Interestingly, part of the opposition to the bill stemmed more from the perception that it was forced on Kenya by the US and UK than from its content. This belief originated from the easing of extradition requirements contained in the Bill and because, shortly after its proposal, the US offered $100 million worth of security funding as part of the East Africa Counterterrorism Initiative. This incident demonstrates that while the Kenyan government has been more than willing to accept US direction on its domestic security, the country is a democracy and has a robust civil society that does not always have the same priorities as the government.

The Kenyan government reorganized its security organizations in the early 2000s with a focus on terrorism. The Anti-Terror Police Unit (ATPU), National Counter-Terrorism Center, and the National Security Advisory Committee were all formed with the intent of better coordinating counterterror activities between police, military, and intelligence agencies. Despite the defeat of the US-backed Suppression of Terrorism Bill, cooperation between the two countries deepened. In 2006, the Kenyan Ministry of Defense requested funding to create a new special operations unit, the Ranger Strike Force, which could be used to target terrorists. The US provided Kenya with more than $40 million through the Joint Combined Exchange and Training (JCET) and East African Regional Security Initiative to set up the Ranger Strike Force. Kenya

also accepted US funding through the ATA program to set up a joint maritime facility at Manda Bay, where the US continues to train Kenyan and Tanzanian police.  

The next major milestone in the evolution of Kenyan counterterrorism policy was the country's 2011 invasion of Somalia. Spurred to action by the murder of a British tourist and the kidnapping of two Spanish aid workers near the Somali border, the Kenyan Defense Forces (KDF) launched Operation *Linda Nchi* (Protect the Country). Two KDF battalions, consisting of 2,400 troops, were deployed to Somalia and ordered towards the port city of Kismayo Working in conjunction with Kenya, Ugandan soldiers operating under AMISOM took Mogadishu, and Ethiopian forces carried out operations in northwest Somalia. Though the KDF faced stiff resistance, it was able to achieve its short-term objectives partly because it was well equipped with more than $3 billion worth of US-funded military equipment. Kenya eventually merged its troops in Somalia with the existing AMISOM structure.

---

29 Throup, “Kenya’s Intervention.”  
30 Throup, “Kenya’s Intervention.”  
While the 2011 Kenyan intervention was sparked by cross-border attacks from al-Shabaab, there is evidence that the Kenyan military had long had its eye on Somalia as a potential source of instability and terrorism that needed to be dealt with. In 2010, the East African Standby Brigade, a regional force for peace support operations that Kenya is a part of, had plans to take Kismayo.\textsuperscript{32} Kenya had previously tried to deal with the al-Shabaab threat by training a group of Somali refugees, the Isiolo militia, to fight against al-Shabaab, in addition to coordinating with Somali militias.\textsuperscript{33} By 2011, however, Kenyan leadership felt that more direct action was needed.

Operation Linda Nchi was a critical turning point in Kenyan terrorism policy because it changed the nature of the terrorist threat that the country had to deal with. While the KDF had hoped that taking Kismayo would deal a severe blow to al-Shabaab by cutting off one of its main sources of revenue (exporting charcoal), it did not have the desired response. Most of al-Shabaab's 5,000 fighters retreated into Jubaland and the Shebelle valley and began to alter their fighting style, focusing more on guerrilla-style hit and run attacks than fighting the Kenyans directly.\textsuperscript{34} This transformation in fighting style is similar to the tactics utilized by Hezbollah and ISIS. These groups pose a difficult challenge for conventional armies because of their ability to function as traditional insurgent groups and also mass together and meet their enemies head on when needed.

\textsuperscript{33}Throup, “Kenya’s Intervention.”
The threat posed by al-Shabaab to Kenya is so significant in part because of Kenya's large Somali population. In addition to nearly half a million Somali refugees in Kenya, there is a large population of permanent immigrants as well, especially in Nairobi and along the coast. The Kenyan intervention resulted in a concerted effort by al-Shabaab to develop a domestic insurgency within Kenya. Just days after the Kenyan invasion in 2011, al-Shabaab claimed responsibility for a dual grenade attack in Nairobi. 35 Centered in the heavily Somali Eastleigh district of Nairobi, al-Hijra, formerly known as the Muslim Youth Center, merged with al-Shabaab in January 2012. 36 Al-Hijra is “a covert group of primarily Kenyan Somali and non-Somali Muslims followers of al-Shabaab in East Africa... [whose] geographic center of support is on the Muslim Swahili coast of Kenya and Tanzania, although its base is in the Majengo area of Nairobi.” 37 Al-Hijra operatives were instrumental in carrying out both the 2013 Westgate and 2015 Garissa attacks. 38 Al-Hijra also serves as a conduit for radicalized Kenyans to travel to Somalia, providing an opportunity for them to fight with and receive training from al-Shabaab. The significance of this pipeline continues to grow; as many as 10 percent of al-Shabaab’s membership is now composed of Kenyans. 39

37 Nzes, “Al-Shabab’s.”
Faced with this uptick in violence, Kenya again tried to revise its legal framework for dealing with terrorism. The 2012 Prevention of Terrorism Act criminalized acts of terrorism and gave the Kenyan police the ability to detain suspects and intercept their communications. However, unlike the 2003 Bill, the 2012 Act was lauded by analysts as successfully balancing intelligence collection and human rights.

The most recent major development in Kenyan counterterrorism legislation was the 2014 Security Laws Amendment. In response to the highly publicized 2013 attack on the Westgate shopping mall in Nairobi, the government introduced an amendment aimed to give security agencies more leeway in fighting al-Shabaab. History often rhymes if not outright repeats itself; the Amendment was denounced as dictatorial and repressive. The Amendment gave Kenyan intelligence agencies permission to carry out domestic covert operations that they deemed necessary to fighting terrorism. Additionally, media outlets were prohibited from reporting on security operations or investigations. The Amendment was eventually signed into law after contentious debate in

---

41 Mwazighe, “Legal Responses to Terrorism,” p. 71-83.
44 The Security Laws.
Parliament, but in February 2015 the High Court struck down the provisions relating to media censorship.45

The Garissa attack had and continues to have a profound effect on the Kenyan government's approach to countering terrorism. Unlike the Westgate attack, whose victims were mainly upper-class Kenyans and expatriates living in the wealthy Westlands neighborhood, those killed at Garissa were students from all over Kenya.46 Furthermore, the overt targeting of non-Muslims by the gunmen at Garissa was deliberately provocative. As a result, the impact of Garissa was more profound than previous terror attacks. President Uhuru Kenyatta responded to the attack by calling al-Shabaab “an existential threat” to Kenya and promising to pursue “the planners and financiers of this brutality [who] are deeply embedded in our communities.”47

The Kenyan Reaction to the Garissa Attack

Kenya’s response to Garissa has been multi-faceted and difficult to characterize. It has been mainly reliant on the traditional tool of counterterrorism in Africa: security forces. This has, however, been accompanied by a rhetorical shift advocating for an increased focus on nonmilitary policies such as expanding economic opportunities, rooting out corruption, and expanding community policing. Whether or not any actual

policy changes accompany these statements will go a long way in determining the future of al-Shabaab in Kenya.

The most immediate reaction to the Garissa attack was a Kenyan air campaign against al-Shabaab targets in Somalia. On April 6, four days after Garissa, Kenyan fighter jets bombed al-Shabaab camps in the Gedo region near the border.\textsuperscript{48} The KDF claimed that the attack destroyed multiple terrorist camps that housed more than 800 fighters, although al-Shabaab disputed the fact that any of its infrastructure was neutralized.\textsuperscript{49} Aerial bombardment did not represent a departure from previous Kenyan counterterrorism policy. The KDF had been carrying out military operations in Somalia since 2011, so the bombing of al-Shabaab camps was an intensification of that policy rather than a new course.

One of the most controversial policy proposals that emerged in the aftermath of the Garissa attack is the plan to build a wall along the 424-mile Kenya-Somalia border.\textsuperscript{50} Ostensibly, the goal of this project is more tightly regulate the entry of Somali terrorists into Kenya. Despite the fact that the “wall” would in reality be a system of fences and guard towers, it is projected to cost close to 200 million shillings (approximately $2 million) per kilometer.\textsuperscript{51} Analysts predict


that the project will not cover the border, only about 125 miles of the most vulnerable sectors.\textsuperscript{52} The whole project is estimated to cost around $250 million. The border wall proposal has been criticized for treating the symptoms of the problem, rather than addressing the problem itself. The Somali government opposes the border wall and has stated that it has not been consulted by Kenya on the matter.\textsuperscript{53} Somalia’s Interior Minister Abdirizak Omar called for on Kenya to cancel the project saying, “A separation wall cannot stop an ideology.”\textsuperscript{54} Other critics of the wall point out the fluid nature of the Kenya-Somalia border in towns like Mandera and say that the wall would severely disrupt the lives of residents.\textsuperscript{55}

Comments made by Kenyan government officials indicate that the government seriously considered closing the Dadaab refugee camp near the Somali border after Garissa until pushback from human rights groups and international organizations caused them to reconsider. The Dadaab camp is the largest in Africa, hosting more than 500,000 mostly Somali refugees.\textsuperscript{56} While the camp remains open, statements like Deputy President Ruto’s promise to “relocate [the refugees] ourselves” if they were not moved could further antagonize and marginalize the Somali expat community in Kenya.\textsuperscript{57}

\textsuperscript{52} Kasami, “Kenya-Somalia Border Wall.”
\textsuperscript{55} Kushkush, “Kenya Envisions.”
\textsuperscript{57} BBC News, Kenya stampede.”
The Kenyan government has responded to the Garissa attack by planning to increase its expenditures on the police and military. The proposed 2015-2016 budget calls for $2.2 billion USD to be spent on security programs, an increase of more than $250 million USD from 2014.\(^{58}\) The majority of this money is slated to go to modernizing the military and police forces. Additionally, Secretary Kerry pledged that the US would provide Kenya with $100 million worth of security assistance in 2015.\(^{59}\)

Kenya’s government offered amnesty to members of al-Shabaab who turned themselves in and denounced the group.\(^{60}\) As a result, more than 200 young people turned themselves in, according to Interior Cabinet Secretary Joseph Nkaissery.\(^{61}\) The government plans to put these former al-Shabaab members through an unspecified de-radicalization program in order to reintegrate them back into society.\(^{62}\)


The Kenyan government is certainly saying all of the right things with regards to three key non-military areas critical to counter-terrorism: community policing, economic development, and corruption. However, it remains to be seen what concrete steps will come from this rhetoric.

Even before Garissa, Kenya promoted a concept called Nyumba Kumi (Ten Households). Nyumba Kumi is a program aimed at encouraging Kenyans to know their neighbors in order to combat radicalization. The idea of community policing is not particularly innovative, but stands to be especially useful in Kenya because of strong preexisting communal ties and an aversion to invasive security measures by the groups most at risk for being radicalized: Muslims and Somalis. Nyumba Kumi fits within the US framework of countering violent extremism (CVE), which focuses on dually supporting the development of local law enforcement institutions and the implementation of community policing models.

In Kenya, as in many developing countries facing terrorist threats, youth unemployment is one of the drivers of recruitment for violent groups. In addition to causing material poverty, unemployment can lead to social marginalization, causing young people to turn towards ideological groups who can offer them a higher purpose. Data from the 2009 Kenyan census indicates the unemployment rate for urban males is

---

Al-Shabaab members can earn up to $150 every month doing work that is much more appealing than other opportunities available to young people. According to one al-Shabaab member living in Eastleigh, joining al-Shabaab “was an easy job compared to other jobs such as construction work.” This anecdotal evidence provides support for the idea that at least some al-Shabaab recruits are motivated by economic opportunity in an environment where they have few other options. Therefore, countering al-Shabaab recruitment is not only a function of delegitimizing their ideology; rather, the economic outcomes of joining the group must be made less attractive than legal options.

The Kenyan government’s flagship program to respond to the issue of youth unemployment is the National Youth Service, an agency whose goals are “to facilitate the provision of work experience for young persons with a view to their employment to encourage participants to develop, a sense of responsibility and of service to the country; and self-respect and respect for authority; to promote among participants, values of discipline, democracy, citizenship and cooperation [sic].” The NYS has been around since 1964, but was modernized and relaunched in 2014. As of 2015, Kenya aims to attract 26,000

---


69 Kenyan National Youth Service, “The History of NYS.”
new recruits each year. However, drawing recruits may not be an issue, as there has been talk of reviving the old practice of mandatory service in the NYS for high school students.

It is no secret that Kenya’s security forces have a reputation for breathtakingly widespread corruption. This phenomena has been reported on and analyzed repeatedly. Likewise, it is widely reported that some of the worst abuses are perpetuated on Somali immigrants who often lack the funds to bribe police officers. One Somali refugee was quoted in a Human Rights Watch report as saying “The police kept saying we were al-Shabaab terrorists and said ‘Somalis are like donkeys: they have no rights in Kenya.’” Corruption is also rampant in higher levels of government, creating an atmosphere in which taking bribes is an accepted practice. For example, part of the reason that the government response to Garissa was so slow was that the commander of response team had commandeered the plane that was supposed to take commandos to Garissa and instead used it for personal reasons, a blatant misuse of resources that may have cost lives. While cleaning up Kenya’s security apparatus will not be simple, President

---

72 Wong, Michela, “‘Everyone is Corrupt in Kenya, Even Grandmothers,’” Foreign Policy, 6 May 2014, http://foreignpolicy.com/2014/05/06/everyone-is-corrupt-in-kenya-even-grandmothers/.
Kenyatta is attempting to change how corruption is viewed by directly equating it with supporting al-Shabaab. In a speech shortly after the Garissa attack, Kenyatta asked, “What else but corruption of the worst and most criminal kind is it for Kenyans to finance, hide and recruit on behalf of al-Shabaab?”

It remains to be seen what effects the Kenyan government’s policies will have on the country’s resiliency to al-Shabaab terrorism and ability to deter potential recruits. Terrorism often works by baiting security forces into overreacting against a whole group of what the government sees as possible future militants, creating sympathy towards the terrorist group. While this dynamic is easy enough to understand in an academic sense, states repeatedly fall victim to the same missteps. In reality, war is a continuation of politics by other means. In an elected government like Kenya, security policy arises through an ongoing dialogue between politicians and the public. It is an appealing low-hanging fruit for Kenyan politicians to demonize Muslims and immigrants in order to pander to their electorates. It will take a principled effort by Kenyatta and others in government to resist these urges and craft a measured response in the wake of Garissa.

**Policy Recommendations**

In order to maximize its ability to counter the threat of terrorism:

- Kenya needs to walk a fine line between appropriately policing at risk communities and driving them towards al-

---

Shabaab. In addition to avoiding inflammatory rhetoric, Kenyan security forces must halt their brutal treatment of Somali immigrants. The vast majority of Somali immigrants coming to Kenya have no sympathy for al-Shabaab, which has devastated the country they are fleeing. Extrajudicial killings have no place in a democracy.

- The government is correct to highlight the importance of youth unemployment as a “push” factor that can lead young men to take up arms. While the National Youth Service can be useful as a counterterrorism tool, the government should take care not to over rely on what is essentially an army reserve program. Mandatory recruitment will create resentment among communities that already distrust the government and make them less inclined to cooperate. As an alternative, the Kenyan government should build stronger partnerships with civil society groups and NGOs.

- Kenya needs to focus on preempting terrorism, not only responding to it. This will require working with Muslim community leaders because they are in the best position to identify future jihadists. The Kenyan intelligence apparatus likely does not have the ability to identify individuals at risk of radicalization, especially in the Nairobi sprawl, so it makes sense to outsource this work to key figures in the community who are more in touch with youths. Obviously, these key figures should be moderate Muslims who can counteract the influence of extremists. Kenya should draw from the experience of a United Kingdom program that funded moderate Muslim preachers who promoted democracy and secularism.76

- The most effective counterterrorism policy in the world

is useless if not properly implemented. Low-level police corruption harms those who are unable to pay bribes, especially recent immigrants who often lack access to cash. Kenya’s problem with corruption has been repeated by both security and development analysts. The solution to this problem is beyond the scope of this paper. Nevertheless, policymakers must keep corruption’s damaging influence on all aspects of policy in mind.

The US has a key role to play in advancing Kenya’s fight with terrorism. While the US should not dictate Kenyan policy, US aid can be influential mechanism in guiding policy in a direction advantageous to US interests. It serves US strategic interests in East Africa for Kenya to be able to deal with both al-Shabaab and the homegrown al-Hijra. This means the US needs to push Kenya to use all of the counterterrorism tools at its disposal, not just the military and police, and to respect the rights of Muslims and Somalis. Therefore:

- US influence in Kenya needs to be applied subtlety. Overt US pressure to change Kenyan policy, even if that pressure is applied to advance human rights, will engender blowback from Kenyan citizens. As the reaction to the failed 2003 Suppression of Terrorism Act shows, Kenya has a robust civil society that is willing and able to confront the government over what it perceives as inappropriate foreign involvement. For all of its problems, the Kenyan government is still a democracy, meaning that it only has a limited ability to impose policies that people disagree with. Therefore, the US should in this case avoid public diplomacy and focus instead on engaging with military and civilian leaders.
- The US should express their concerns about the treatment of Muslims in Kenya in terms of counterterrorism,
not human rights. As the controversy in Kenya regarding President Obama and gay rights demonstrated, Kenyans do not appreciate what they perceive as Western attempts to impose morality.77 Instead of setting up a situation where police abuses are discussed in the context of cultural absolutism, the US should emphasize the links between government human rights violations and the growth of insurgencies.78 If Kenyan leaders require a stronger incentive to treat minorities fairly, they should be reminded that US law prohibits the US from funding foreign security forces guilty of human rights abuses.79

- US funding to Kenya should shift from security forces to community policing and deradicalization programs. The US must be realistic and acknowledge that, in many cases, Kenyan police and military are part of the problem. Ninety-five percent of US security assistance to Kenya for FY 2015 is set to go to the KDF.80 A significant percentage of this assistance should be diverted to expanding Nyumba Kumi awareness and training, and to helping the Kenyan government come up with a concrete deradicalization program to reintegrate militants back into society.

In both 2003 and 2014, Kenya demonstrated that it has a robust civil society and parliament willing to push back against what they perceive as overreaches by the executive. While this will undoubtedly complicate making security policy in the immediate future, it is an encouraging sign for Kenya’s long-term prospects. The greatest danger facing Kenya after Garissa is not that the government will do too little; it is that it will do too much. A worse outcome than the status quo is a situation in which urban youths are further marginalized and seek closer ties to al-Shabaab and the al-Hijra network.

Terrorism stands to be a serious threat to Kenya in the coming years. Kenya has a large, marginalized Muslim population, a porous border with a failed state, and a security force that has continuously demonstrated a disregard for the concept of the minimum of fire. In many respects, the situation appears hopeless. However, if the rhetorical shift demonstrated by the government since Garissa actually represents a change in policy, Kenya has a fighting chance against al-Shabaab.

Jacob Goldstein is an M.A. candidate in the Georgetown Security Studies Program, concentrating in international security. His areas of interest include counterinsurgency, energy security, and regionally, sub-Saharan Africa. He currently works for the Homeland Security & Defense Business Council and as Professor Christine Fair’s research assistant. He received a B.A. in public policy and political science from the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.
El Salvador’s Gangs and Prevailing Gang Paradigms in a Post-Truce Context

Michael Lohmuller

This paper examines the relevance of prevailing gang paradigms as it relates to the case of El Salvador. It is particularly concerned with the concept of ‘Third Generation Gangs,’ which holds that Salvadoran street gangs are becoming sophisticated political actors seeking to maintain an international reach, and are increasingly capable of confronting the state. El Salvador is in the midst of a violent upheaval. In 2012, El Salvador’s two main street gangs signed a truce, which was tacitly endorsed and facilitated by the government. However, following the breakdown of the truce, violence in El Salvador has rapidly escalated, with the gangs increasingly targeting security forces. This paper discusses whether this rising violence is indicative of the gangs’ collective maturation process into a ‘Third Generation Gang,’ or, alternatively, if autonomous spasms of violence by individual gang factions as a means of self-preservation are being misinterpreted as a collective maturation process.

In March 2012, news became public that El Salvador’s two largest street gangs, the Mara Salvatrucha and Barrio 18, had negotiated a truce. Over the next 14 months, El Salvador saw a significant decline in homicide levels. Yet violence began rising in the latter half of 2013 and throughout 2014. So far, 2015 is on track to be the bloodiest year in El Salvador since
the end of its civil war, and the country may have the highest homicide rate in the world by year’s end. The gangs, whose leaders have been demanding the government reinstitute the truce, are fueling this violence.

The truce has led to concerns that the gangs have become more powerful and sophisticated, transitioning into political actors that are capable of directly confronting the state—a phenomenon potentially manifesting itself in the current wave of violence. To explore this proposition, this paper will examine the concept of ‘Third Generation Gangs’—a leading paradigm for understanding gang evolution—which holds that some gangs evolve through three generations.

To begin, a brief history of the MS-13 and Barrio 18’s origins will be presented, followed by a discussion of the factors surrounding the 2012 truce and rising violence in its wake. The paper will then introduce third generation gang studies, briefly summarizing the characteristics of each gang generation. Lastly, the effects of the truce on the gangs—and the nature of post-truce violence—will be explored to examine if the gangs are collectively evolving into third generation gangs, and whether or not the paradigm holds sufficient explanatory power for understanding El Salvador’s gangs in a post-truce context.

Origins of the MS-13 & Barrio 18

The rival Mara Salvatrucha and Barrio 18 gangs both trace their roots to the United States.¹ Formed by Mexican youths in

¹ There are two terms used in describing the Central America gang phenomenon. “Mara” connotes a larger, more sophisticated structure with transnational origins. “Pandilla” generally refers to smaller, locally-focused street gangs, whose territory may only consist of a neighborhood or series of streets. Pandillas are generally considered
Los Angeles in the 1960s, the Barrio 18 was the first Hispanic gang in the city to accept members of different races and nationalities. The gang grew significantly during the late 1970s and early 1980s owing to an influx of Salvadoran and Guatemalan refugees fleeing civil wars in their respective countries. The MS-13 was formed in the latter half of the 1980s by a second wave of Salvadoran refugees settling in Los Angeles. As outsiders in the United States, young men arriving from Central America as refugees sought to incorporate themselves into the gangs for purposes of inclusion and protection. By the early 1990s, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 had become bitter rivals.

Beginning in the mid-1990s, the United States began deporting Central American gang members en masse. This process was accelerated when, in 1996, the US Congress passed the Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act, which ensured non-US citizens sentenced to a year or more in prison would be repatriated to their country of origin. As a result, between 1998 and 2005 the United States deported almost 46,000 convicts to Central America—in essence as having a historical presence in the region, while maras are a more recent phenomenon. The general term “gang” will be used throughout this paper when referring to the MS-13 and Barrio 18. Seelke, Clare Ribando. "Gangs in Central America." Congressional Research Service, no. RL34112 (2014). Accessed September 14, 2015, 2.; Jütersonke, Oliver, Robert Muggah, and Dennis Rodgers. "Gangs and Violence Reduction in Central America." Security Dialogue 40, no. 4-5 (2009), 7.

2 Seelke, “Gangs in Central America,” 2.
3 The Salvadoran civil war was fought from 1980 to 1992. Guatemala’s civil war was much longer, lasting from 1960 until 1996.
“exporting” a Los Angeles gang culture to El Salvador and neighboring countries.\(^6\)

Upon arriving in El Salvador, many MS-13 and *Barrio 18* gang members found themselves to be outsiders, having spent little (if any) time in their native countries. They therefore perpetuated the gang structures that had provided them with support and security in the United States. Over time, the recruitment of new members—along with the influence of Salvadoran domestic factors—has resulted in the evolution and growth of the MS-13 and *Barrio 18*. Today, the two gangs count a significant number of members among their ranks in El Salvador, and engage in a broad array of criminal activities.

**The MS-13 & *Barrio 18* in El Salvador**

*Membership & Structure*

Estimates of total gang membership in Central America vary. A 2012 US State Department approximation put the total number of gang members in the Northern Triangle countries (El Salvador, Guatemala, and Honduras) as high as 85,000.\(^7\) A 2012 estimate from the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), however, pegged the figure at 54,000, with 20,000 gang members in El Salvador, 12,000 in Honduras, and 22,000

\(^7\) Seelke, “Gangs in Central America,” 3.
in Guatemala.\(^8\) In El Salvador alone, 470,000 people have been estimated to have gang connections.\(^9\)

The MS-13 and *Barrio 18* in El Salvador each have a tiered gang structure, although they differ slightly in configuration. Regarding the MS-13, the gang’s base is composed of *clicas*, or cliques, that consist of 15 to several dozen members each, and are extremely local in focus and scope, typically only controlling a neighborhood or street.\(^10\) Individual cliques are organized into a larger bloc of several dozen cliques called a *programa*, which is under the authority of a mid-level leader known as a *palabrero*. At the next level is a *ranflero*, a gang leader who is typically imprisoned but whose orders are relayed and carried out. Above the *ranfleros* are *jefes nacionales*, or national leaders, almost all of whom are imprisoned and exercise final decision-making authority on issues affecting El Salvador’s entire MS-13 structure.\(^11\)

The *Barrio 18*—considered to be more violent and less sophisticated than the MS-13—has a somewhat different structure. At the top are *palabreros*, or gang leaders, that operate from the prison system and coordinate the gang’s

---

8 Even low-end estimates of gang membership imply there are more gang members than military personnel in Central America. El Salvador has the highest concentration of gang members, with some 323 for every 100,000 citizens; double that of Guatemala and Honduras. *Ibid.;* Jütersonke, “Gangs and Violence,” 5.


10 In El Salvador, it has been estimated there are over 2,000 cliques affiliated with six man gangs. Other gangs active in El Salvador besides the MS-13 and Barrio 18 include, among others, the Mao Mao, Maquina, and Mirada Locos 13. *Ibid.*

activities. There are also *palabreros en la libre*, or those leaders who are outside the prison system and are responsible for carrying out the orders of imprisoned leaders, such as overseeing the extortion system and planning homicides. Below these *palabreros* are leaders called *canchas*, who each control several *tribus*, or tribes, that each consist of several dozen to hundreds of members. Furthermore—and of particular importance for understanding gang dynamics in El Salvador—in 2005, the *Barrio 18* divided into two major and competing factions, the *Revolucionarios* and the *Sureños.*

Despite the gangs’ respective hierarchy, however, local MS-13 and *Barrio 18* leaders exercise a broad degree of autonomy (the MS-13’s tighter structure suggests it is less autonomous than the *Barrio 18*). The cliques, for instance, exercise wide discretion over the relationships they maintain with other gang and non-gang groups, and the type of criminal activity they conduct. Each clique is largely self-sufficient and responsible for its own financial well-being, meaning it decides for itself how to raise money and distribute criminal proceeds. Rodgers and Muggah explain that, while each clique is

---


13 There are an estimated 28 *Barrio 18* *tribus* in all of El Salvador, compared with around 250 MS-13 cliques. This suggests the MS-13 in El Salvador has a much more intimate and coordinated structure than the Barrio 18. Additionally, it is not uncommon for Barrio 18 cells to be referred to as cliques, being something of a general term when referring to local gang groups. As such, “clique” will be used interchangeably throughout the remainder of the paper when referring to the gangs’ base-level groups. Ibid.


explicitly affiliated with either the MS-13 or Barrio 18, “neither gang is a real federal structure... That is, neither the Barrio 18 or MS-13 answer to a single chain of command, and their ‘umbrella’ nature is more symbolic of a particular historical origin than demonstrative of any real unity, be it of leadership or action.”

_Gang Activities_

Taken as a whole, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 are involved in a broad array of illicit activities. At the local level, this largely involves opportunistic crime, with ‘la renta,’ or extortion, being the gangs’ most important revenue source. In areas they control, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 extort virtually all businesses, with the transportation sector particularly targeted. The gangs also engage in—among other crimes—kidnapping, vehicular theft, petty drug dealing, and murder-for-hire in their areas of influence.

There have also been suggestions the MS-13 and Barrio 18 in El Salvador may be partaking in transnational criminal activities, such as working for Mexican drug cartels to protect drug shipments transiting Salvadoran territory or participating in the region’s illicit arms trade—although to date such claims appear to be overblown. Moreover, by the mid-2000s, US law

---

18 According to Jütersonke, Rodgers, and Muggah, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 “tend to serve as a local security apparatus for the smaller cartels, or as informally connected street vendors. Gangs are seldom involved in the large-scale or transnational movement of narcotics, nor do they wholesale.” Jütersonke, “Gangs and Violence,” 9.
enforcement had discovered evidence of jailed MS-13 leaders in El Salvador ordering assassinations on individuals in the Washington, D.C. area.\(^\text{19}\)

**Gang-driven Violence & Security Policy**

The criminal activities of the gangs have significantly contributed to El Salvador’s high levels of violence and insecurity.\(^\text{20}\) To combat crime and gang activity, El Salvador has traditionally favored repressive strategies focused on heavy-handed anti-gang policies. In July 2003, the government of Salvadoran President Francisco Flores enacted a *Mano Dura* (Iron Fist) policy known as the *Ley Antimaras* (Anti-Gang Law). This law made gang membership illegal, and gave

---


complete authority to the police—and sometimes to military personnel—to conduct arrests based on arbitrary evidence.\textsuperscript{21} This resulted in the mass roundup and incarceration of suspected gang members, with roughly 20,000 arrested between July 2003 and August 2004. In July 2004—after El Salvador’s Supreme Court declared the \textit{Ley Antimaras} unconstitutional—a new \textit{Mano Super Dura} package of anti-gang reforms was implemented. This stiffened the penalties for gang membership by lengthening prison sentences, and by 2009 El Salvador’s prison population had doubled from 6,000 to 12,000 prisoners.\textsuperscript{22}

Nonetheless, El Salvador’s \textit{Mano Dura} policies served to exacerbate the gang problem. Evidence indicates the violence reduction benefits of heavy-handed anti-gang measures are temporary and tenuous, and actually tend to generate perverse effects.\textsuperscript{23} Indeed, repressive tactics have generally encouraged the MS-13 and \textit{Barrio 18} to adapt and become more organized.\textsuperscript{24} The mass imprisonment of gang members—along with suspected gang members—appears to have facilitated gang organization by turning prisons into “schools of crime” and recruitment centers. This was aided by the Salvadoran government’s decision to segregate prisons based on gang

\textsuperscript{21} Evidence of gang membership included tattoos, hand signals, some dress codes, and physical appearances. Bruneau, “Pandillas and Security,” 161.

\textsuperscript{22} Prison terms were lengthened to up to five years for gang members and nine years for gang leaders. In 2011, El Salvador’s prison system, with a capacity for 8,000 prisoners, was holding around 24,000 inmates, at least one-third for gang-related crimes. Jütersonke, “Gangs and Violence,” 10.; Bruneau, Thomas. "Pandillas and Security in Central America." \textit{Latin American Research Review} 49 (2014): 152-72. 162.


\textsuperscript{24} For instance, many gang members in El Salvador stopped getting tattooed, and began showing less obvious gang signs and symbols to avoid detection and arrest. Jütersonke, “Gangs and Violence,” 12.
membership to avoid inter-gang conflict—meaning MS-13 and Barrio 18 members were placed in prisons where their gang exercised complete hegemony over inmate dynamics. The prisons also allowed members from various regional cliques of the same gang to establish contact and connections with one another, allowing for stronger gang structure and coordination. 25 Bruneau describes the mass incarceration of gang members as converting the prisons into a sort of permanent assembly, where gang members could debate, make pacts, and decide on gang strategy.26 This dynamic was clearly evident in early 2012, when imprisoned MS-13 and Barrio 18 leaders negotiated and implemented a gang truce.

The Truce

In March 2012, Salvadoran news agency *El Faro* reported that truce negotiations were taking place between the rival MS-13 and Barrio 18 groups.27 That month, Security and Justice

25 The prison system has come to play an important role in the culture and functions of the MS-13 and Barrio 18. Orders generally emanate from imprisoned leaders to members on the streets, with members on the streets providing revenue and other goods for those in prison. This system rests partly on the logic that all gang members will end up in prison at one point or another, and will need the protection and good graces of incarcerated gang leaders when they arrive—a form of “prison insurance” so to speak.


Minister David Munguia Payes agreed to transfer around 30 MS-13 and Barrio 18 gang leaders from maximum-security institutions to less restrictive prisons. The prison transfers were intended to facilitate talks between the gang leaders and government-sanctioned facilitators, and enable gang leaders to more easily communicate with members on the streets and order a halt to violence. In exchange for a reduction in violence, MS-13 and Barrio 18 leaders asked the government to implement rehabilitation and job training programs for gang members, and to improve prison conditions.

The truce resulted in an immediate and sustained reduction in violence. By April homicides had dropped almost 60%, and violence stayed down through 2012: the Salvadoran National Police (PNC) registered a total of 2,576 murders for the year, a 41% drop from the 4,371 murders in 2011. In January 2013, ...


the first of a number of “peace zones” were implemented in municipalities across the country. In these areas the gangs promised to cease all criminal activity in exchange for a reduction in police harassment and the opportunity to participate in education and job training programs. Homicide levels continued to stay down through mid-2013, and between March 2012 and May 2013 the Salvadoran government reported homicides declined from an average of 14 to six per day.

Despite the reduction in homicides, however, the truce quickly came under public scrutiny and criticism. Questions and doubts surrounded the gangs’ intentions in negotiating the truce, as well as the government’s lack of transparency regarding its role in bringing the truce to life. Skeptics were particularly concerned the government was inadvertently legitimizing the gangs and granting them status as political

---


actors. Critics also pointed to the truce’s inability to reduce other crimes. For instance, the gangs never fully ceased extorting, and gang leaders explicitly refused to do so until the government opened paths for more formal, legitimate means of earning an income. The number of disappeared persons also increased during the truce, doubling between 2012 and 2013. Among the skeptics of the truce was the belief that homicide levels stayed largely the same, with the gangs simply “disappearing” their victims so they could not be counted in statistics.

Widespread public skepticism fed into El Salvador’s election cycle politics—which turned the subject of the truce into a political hot potato—and contributed to the truce’s disintegration. In May 2013, Security Minister Payes—one of the main architects of the gang truce—was ousted from his position. The Funes administration began withdrawing

---


35 Ahead of February 2014 elections, politicians from the opposition Alianza Republicana Nacionalista (ARENA) party used the gang truce to attack the ruling Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional (FMLN) party of President Funes, accusing the FMLN of negotiating with criminals.

support for truce mediators and negotiators, and violence levels in El Salvador began increasing.  

*Violence Peaks*

During 2015, violence in El Salvador surged to critical levels, and began to accelerate in January when MS-13 and *Barrio 18* gang leaders were transferred back to maximum-security prisons.  


police internal affairs—declared that “we’re at war” with the gangs.\(^{39}\) March then set a record as the most violent month since the end of El Salvador’s Civil War in 1992, with 481 murders—only to be surpassed by May (622 murders), June (677), and then August (907) as the bloodiest month of the past two decades.\(^{40}\)

Driving the spike in violence has been the MS-13 and *Barrio 18*, whose leaders are demanding the government revive the 2012 truce and curtail anti-gang legislation and security

---


Gang-driven violence and threats have thus been viewed as a means of pressuring the government into negotiations. For instance, in late July there was a gang-enforced transportation “boycott,” when gang members (believed to be from the Barrio 18’s Revolucionarios faction) ordered bus drivers to go on strike or else suffer the consequences. Attacks against security forces have also increased, with gang members allegedly attacking security personnel over 250 times in 2015 through May—an average of two confrontations per day. Police intelligence reports in

---


April asserted the MS-13 ordered cliques in the province of La Libertad to kill two police officers each, and that the MS-13 and Barrio 18 were planning a combined offensive against the government.\(^{44}\) In June, police officers discovered a stolen car that had been booby-trapped with a grenade, an apparent attempt at killing police (members of the MS-13 were the suspected culprits).\(^{45}\) Then, in August, Salvadoran authorities announced the MS-13 and Barrio 18 were discussing a potential merger to form a unified gang structure and focus their aggression on state security forces.\(^{46}\)

In response to increasing violence, the Salvadoran government has been ratcheting up security measures and hardening its rhetoric towards the gangs. For instance, in January 2015 the PNC’s director said police should use their weapons against criminals “with complete confidence.”\(^{47}\) President Salvador Sánchez Cerén then announced in May three battalions of Special Forces soldiers would be deployed to


Salvadoran judicial officials have also invoked the country’s anti-terrorism laws to prosecute gang members, and in August the Supreme Court declared the MS-13 and Barrio 18 to be terrorist groups. Accordingly, the experience of the gang truce, and the nature of gang-directed violence in its wake, raises the question as to how current conditions in El Salvador are to be interpreted. Namely, is the truce, and the gangs’ continued violent outbursts, indicative of the gangs’ collective evolution into more sophisticated actors? Or, is rising violence more an attempt at self-preservation by gang factions in the face of intensified pressure from rivals and security forces?

In an effort to reach an answer, the concept of “Third Generation Gangs” will be examined, exploring if its precepts hold sufficient explanatory power for understanding El Salvador’s gangs in the context of recent developments in the country.

---


Third Generation Gangs

Originally put forward by John P. Sullivan in the 1990s, the field of third generation gang studies seeks to understand the gang phenomenon and characteristics of contemporary criminal street gangs.\(^5^0\) It has since become one of the primary models for explaining gang behavior and development. The basic tenet is that some gangs evolve through three generations, transitioning from a traditional turf gang to a market-oriented drug gang, before becoming a third generation gang that mixes political and mercenary elements.\(^5^1\) Three factors are identified as determining the evolutionary potential of gangs: politicization, internationalization, and sophistication. What follows is a brief description of the characteristics defining each gang generation.

First Generation

First Generation gangs are localized and relatively unsophisticated.\(^5^2\) They operate under loose leadership, with ill-defined roles and a focus on loyalty and turf protection (neighborhood or street). When they engage in criminal enterprise, it is largely opportunistic and individual in scope, and tends to be local in nature. First generation gangs operate at

---

\(^5^0\) Since then, it has been developed and explored by a number of scholars, particularly Robert Bunker and Max Manwaring.


the low end of societal violence, and primarily engage in inter-gang rivalry. They are limited in political scope.

Second Generation

Second generation gangs are more entrepreneurial and drug-centered, and are organized for business and commercial gain. As such, they are more interested in market than turf protection, tending to focus their criminal endeavors on local drug distribution as a business. These gangs are also more cohesive, with greater centralization of leadership. They may embrace a broader political agenda—albeit focused on improving market share and revenue—and operate in a broader, sometimes multi-national context. Violence is typically a means to control competition, but may also be used as political interference to negate enforcement efforts directed against them by police and other security organizations. As they seek to control or incapacitate state security organizations, they may begin to dominate vulnerable communities.

Third Generation

A third generation gang is a mercenary-type group with goals of power or financial acquisition. As they evolve, they develop into more sophisticated organizations with broader drug-related markets—operating at the global end of the spectrum—with ambitious political and economic agendas. Political action is

---

54 Ibid.,10.
intended to provide security and freedom of movement for gang activities, although quasi-terrorism or true terrorism may be embraced to advance influence and objectives.\(^{57}\) As a consequence, a third generation gang challenges the legitimate state monopoly on the use of violence within a given political territory.\(^{58}\) Typically, third generation gangs are the result of gangs maturing due to exposure to more sophisticated criminal enterprises, combined with access to an opportunity space conducive to enhanced sophistication and expanded reach.\(^{59}\) In short, third generation gangs are in a state of transition from street gang to sophisticated, networked criminal enterprises. They may, however, continue first and second generation actions as they expand their geographical presence and seek to further their commercial and political goals.\(^{60}\)

To determine if El Salvador’s MS-13 and Barrio 18 gangs are evolving into more sophisticated, internationalized, and politicized entities—transitioning from their first generation origins into full-blown third generation gangs—the effects of the truce on the gangs will be examined. Overall, while there are some signs the truce may have resulted in a reconfiguration of the gangs’ self-perception as political entities, there are reasons to believe the gangs’ post-truce behavior does not represent their collective maturation into third generation gangs, suggesting instead that the increase in violence is more indicative of autonomous manifestations of rebellion and self-preservation by gang factions.

\(^{57}\) Sullivan, “Third Generation Street Gangs,” 96.
\(^{58}\) Manwaring, “Street Gangs,” 10.
\(^{60}\) Manwaring, “Street Gangs,” 10.
The Post-Truce Context: Collective Maturation or Self-Preservation?

A persistent concern surrounding the gang truce is that it allowed the MS-13 and Barrio 18 to become more sophisticated. Namely, there have been some indications the truce strengthened gang hierarchy by forcing the leadership to exert greater control in order to ensure the truce was respected. Indeed, the significant drop in homicides following the truce’s implementation would suggest a certain degree of command and control on the part of gang leaders over members—although the increase in disappearances during the truce does call this into question. A factor possibly enabling the gangs to become more powerful and organized during the truce was that MS-13 and Barrio 18 leaders were transferred to less restrictive prisons with greater access to the outside world.61

Increasing gang organization may in turn have fostered more transnational cooperation and coordination. Even during the truce, there was evidence of imprisoned leaders in El Salvador coordinating with members in the United States.62 There have also been some indications that the MS-13 sought to establish a presence in Europe and South America, allegedly attempting to have members deported to countries where the

---


gang was hoping to expand (although the extent of this to date appears limited). There were also suggestions the gangs (particularly the MS-13) used the truce to become more integrated into the structures of regional transnational criminal organizations, solidifying ties to *transportista* (drug transit) networks and establishing connections with Mexican cartels. Notably, in October 2012, seven months after the truce began, the United States placed the MS-13 on a list of transnational drug trafficking organizations—alongside powerful groups like Mexico's Zetas—and later put economic sanctions on six MS-13 leaders. In July 2013, Salvadoran Security Minister Ricardo Perdomo said that, over the course of the truce, “there are groups that have increased their drug trafficking activities,” and in June 2014, Alejandro Vila—a special prosecutor for the migrant unit in Chiapas, Mexico—said the MS-13 was deepening its hold on illegal migration routes in Mexico.

---


Additionally, the gangs’ behavior during the truce suggests a degree of political identity and self-awareness. For instance, the rhetoric of the gangs took on a distinct political quality, with a number of press releases issued exhibiting a diplomatic tone and formality.\(^{67}\) This—combined with images of gang leaders holding discussions and negotiations with official intermediaries, in essence a *de facto* recognition by the government of the gangs as political actors—indicates (or gives the impression) of a new level of political awareness. Indeed, it is possible MS-13 and *Barrio 18* leaders began to understand that territorial control and cohesion made it possible for them to extract concessions from the state.\(^{68}\) For example, the gangs have declared they have the power to influence elections. These statements were backed up by truce mediator Raul Mijango, who in October 2013 stated representatives of at least two of El Salvador’s top political parties had met with *Barrio 18* and MS-13 leaders, adding that the gangs are “an elector that can define the result” of presidential elections.\(^{69}\) In February 2014, *Barrio 18* and MS-13 leaders issued a statement claiming the Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front (FMLN) political party almost lost the 2014 elections because it did not have the

---


gangs’ backing.70 Douglas Farah has explained the possibility of the gangs becoming increasingly active in politics, not as political parties, but essentially as “votes for rent,” whereby the gangs deliver votes from areas under their control in exchange for political favors.71

Nonetheless, these isolated signs of the gangs’ possible evolution are offset by other occurrences suggesting otherwise, which indicate the MS-13 and Barrio 18 are not undergoing a collective maturation process.

The cohesion of the MS-13 and Barrio 18 should not be overestimated. While the MS-13 and Barrio 18 obviously have a transnational presence—and, to a degree, can link their international network to conduct cross-border crimes—there is little evidence they operate as transnational criminal organizations. And despite the effects of the truce, it remains that the gangs are large, fundamentally loose-knit networks, and are better understood as a franchise of affiliated cliques than as coherent third generation gang entities. For instance, during the truce, certain cliques and factions were difficult to control, being either uncooperative or unwilling to abide by the truce.72 There was also evidence of tensions between the gangs’ top leadership—who drove the truce process—and rank and file


71 Such a dynamic between gangs and political parties has been observed in Jamaica, with gangs controlling the different areas of Kingston aligning with different politicians in return for benefits. Farah, "Central American Gangs," 8.

members. The cliques were largely excluded from the truce process, and there were rumblings of discontent among certain cliques that perceived gang leaders as disproportionately benefitting from the truce.73

There have been other signs of disagreement and turmoil within the gangs as well. In August 2015, 14 members of the Barrio 18’s Revolucionarios faction were murdered at the Quezaltepeque prison. While the motive is unknown, authorities believed the killings were part of an “internal purge” within the Barrio 18. Indeed, there have been reports that rising violence in 2015 is due to intra-gang competition, with Salvadoran Security and Justice Minister Benito Lara attributing high homicide levels in August to “an internal rivalry between gangs and confrontations by criminals against the police.”74

Nor has violence and gang members’ participation in more sophisticated—or transnational—criminal activities since the truce been a collective advancement. For instance, it was the Barrio 18’s Revolucionarios faction that allegedly enforced the gang-ordered transportation strike in July.75 Similarly, in June

---

73 Following the start of the truce, Douglas Farah noted that “serious splits” in the gangs “surfaced almost immediately,” and that sources within the MS-13 “reported anger with gang leaders, in part because they conducted negotiations without street member input.” Clique members were also said to resent seeing the family members of gang leaders suddenly going on shopping sprees and making expensive purchases, which was taken as a sign the leadership received cash to agree to the truce, but did not share payments. Farah, “The Transformation,” 2.


75 Gang-ordered bus strikes are not a novelty for El Salvador. In September 2010, in protest of recently enacted gang legislation, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 issued a joint warning for public transportation operators to stay home for three days or face reprisals. Seelke, “Gangs in Central America,” 4.
2015 there were indications the gangs were involved in an arms trafficking network that smuggled weapons into El Salvador from Honduras, Guatemala, and Nicaragua. Yet the network only involved 16 of the MS-13’s roughly 250 cliques, and of the 90 suspects arrested in connection to the case only 21 were MS-13 members. It appears these MS-13 members were primarily involved in buying and distributing guns within El Salvador, not coordinating the transnational sale of weapons themselves.\(^7^6\)

Additionally, during and following the truce, the MS-13 and Barrio 18 did not demonstrate a developed political agenda or coherent political action. Instead, violence appears to be more a reaction to the transfer of gang leaders back to maximum-security prisons, and a natural response in self-preservation against the government’s increasingly hard-line anti-gang stance—and perhaps against internal gang rivals as well—than an attempt to advance a significant political transformation.

Consequently, the truce, and rising violence in its wake, has not given way to the collective maturation of the MS-13 and Barrio 18 into third generation gangs. Rather, violence appears to be more indicative of intra-gang rivalries and autonomous attempts at self-preservation during the ongoing fallout of the failed truce. Nonetheless, this does not mean certain segments of the gangs are not demonstrating the potential for evolving

\(^7^6\) Nonetheless, elements of the MS-13 and Barrio 18 have been enhancing their weapons capacities, acquiring automatic rifles such as AK-47s, along with grenades and other military-grade weapons. In the past, it has been common for elements of the Salvadoran military to be implicated in the region’s illicit arms trade and supply such weapons. Daugherty, Arron, and Elyssa Pachico. "El Salvador Gangs Involved in Arms Trafficking Network." InSight Crime. June 19, 2015. Accessed September 14, 2015. http://www.insightcrime.org/news-briefs/el-salvador-gangs-involved-arms-trafficking-network.; Farah, "Central American Gangs,” 9.
into more sophisticated actors. Instead, the third generation gang paradigm may offer only limited explanatory power to understanding El Salvador’s gangs in a post-truce context, calling for a reconfiguration in how the gangs are assessed.

**Third Generation Gangs: Assessing the Paradigm**

Third generation gang studies offers a useful guide for broadly understanding and characterizing the different stages of gang evolution in a variety of different contexts. Yet the paradigm is deficient in several respects, especially its lack of interpretation into how gang structure affects evolution processes and outcomes. That is, the paradigm offers little guidance for understanding internal gang dynamics and behavior, and the factors that may promote or lessen a gang’s movement towards increasing politicization, internationalization, and sophistication—beyond simply having an opportunity space afforded by weak institutions or exposure to more sophisticated criminal organizations. In the context of El Salvador, it is inappropriate to think of the MS-13 and Barrio 18 as monolithic organizations. Instead, we should try to understand them as franchised, disperse networks consisting of numerous cliques and factions. As such, perhaps it is incorrect to ask if the MS-13 and Barrio 18 are experiencing a collective maturation, and instead ask what elements of the gangs are evolving, and why.

More specifically, while the truce may not be a sign of the collective evolution of the gangs, it may be a sign of the evolution of certain segments of the gang structure. For instance, it was imprisoned MS-13 and Barrio 18 leaders that formulated, implemented, and oversaw the truce. Nonetheless, gang leaders had trouble keeping the cliques and violence in check as the truce unraveled—even though they reaffirmed the
gangs’ commitment to the truce on multiple occasions—with some cliques expressing contempt for the truce and the lack of benefits it brought them.77

This leads to speculation that the gangs’ hierarchy is being stretched, with opposite ends of the gang structure moving in different directions given competing interests and agendas. The gangs’ older imprisoned leadership, for example, may be attempting to become more sophisticated political actors, negotiating with the government, while younger members on the street are more prone to violence, recklessness, and opportunistic crime—perhaps an indication of a generational split within the gangs. Or, it may be that, given the large membership of the Barrio 18 and MS-13 and the territorial expanse of their networks, a separation within the ranks is inevitable, with gang factions that have competing agendas beginning to diverge from one another.

Refining the Paradigm

This leads to the need to incorporate new elements into the third generation gang paradigm to expand both its predictive and explanatory power. Greater tools are needed for assessing how, when, and if a gang—or elements of a gang—is evolving into a more sophisticated entity. This entails several areas in need of further study and development to assess their relevance in determining a gang’s evolutionary potential, as well as their potential inclusion into the third generation gang paradigm in

order to enhance its ability to present a more refined understanding of gang evolution.

Pulling from the current case regarding El Salvador’s MS-13 and Barrio 18 gangs, there are several areas where inquiry should begin. First, we can look at the effects of gang membership: are larger gangs more prone to evolve into third generation gangs than smaller gangs? Or is there a threshold where a gang becomes so large it fractures, with some gang elements evolving while others do not? Second, related to this are questions over what holds a gang structure or network together, be it incentives of loyalty, financial, or fear.

Additionally, what role does the age of a gang play? This pertains not only to a gang’s age from the time of its formation, but also the age of key leaders. It is possible that older, seasoned leaders become more strategic and sophisticated over time, and seek to make the gang more internationalized, politicized, and sophisticated, having the connections from a lifetime of criminal activity to do so. In contrast, younger, less-educated gang members are more prone to excessive acts of violence and localized opportunistic crime.

Moreover, we need to consider how incarceration impacts gang development. For instance, the prison system has played a key role in the ability of the MS-13 and Barrio 18 to organize and consolidate, serving as a “safe haven” from which to direct and conduct criminal activities. It may be prisons are an important, if not crucial factor allowing gangs to evolve into more sophisticated entities (and providing them with the necessary contacts to do so). Tied in with this is the role government security strategies play in driving gang maturation,

---

as evidenced by El Salvador’s *Mano Dura* policies encouraging the adaptation of gang members to avoid detection.

Further exploring these questions and incorporating their findings into third generation theory may serve to better understand and predict gang evolution, and therefore aid policymakers and security officials in formulating strategy and efforts to prevent gangs from transitioning into more powerful and menacing entities.

**Conclusion**

Since their formation in Los Angeles, the MS-13 and *Barrio 18* have grown in size and influence, becoming a persistent cause of violence and insecurity in El Salvador. The 2012 gang truce, and the dramatic drop in homicide levels it precipitated, demonstrated the influence of the MS-13 and *Barrio 18* leadership, and was a potential mark of the gangs’ collective evolution into more sophisticated entities: so-called ‘third generation gangs.’ Yet an examination of the processes leading to the truce’s negotiation and implementation, the gangs’ structure and criminal activities, and the nature of violence following the truce’s disintegration suggests there has not been a collective maturation of the gangs into more sophisticated actors. Instead, it may be that certain segments of the gang structure are evolving in divergent directions, with post-truce violence indicative of self-preservation efforts by gang factions as they come under pressure from rivals and Salvadoran security forces. As such, the explanatory power of the third generation gang paradigm appears to be lacking in several respects that—if developed and incorporated into the existing paradigm—would allow for a more complete understanding of gang behavior and evolution in El Salvador.
Michael Lohmuller is a December 2014 graduate of the Security Studies Program. Currently based in Medellín, Colombia, he works for the organization InSight Crime, which researches, investigates, and analyzes organized crime in Latin America. He was previously a Peace Corps volunteer in Guatemala.